

Evaluation of the California Arts Council's Arts in Education Demonstration Projects

Final Report

**Treseen McCormick
Joan Peterson
Sharon Ramsden
Naida C. Tushnet
Juan Carlos Bojorquez
Wendy Dailey
Jerry Bailey**

November 2003

QuickTime™ and a
TIFF (LZW) decompressor
are needed to see this picture.

Evaluation of the California Arts Council's Arts in Education Demonstration Projects

Final Report

Treseen McCormick, Co-Project Director

Joan Peterson, Co-Project Director

Sharon Ramsden, Project Coordinator

Naida C. Tushnet, Principal Investigator

Juan Carlos Bojorquez, Research Associate

Wendy Dailey, Research Assistant

Jerry Bailey, Senior Statistician

November 2003

Table of Contents

EXECUTIVE SUMMARY	1
CHAPTER I: INTRODUCTION AND OVERVIEW	12
EVALUATION OVERVIEW.....	13
REVIEW OF THE LITERATURE	15
TECHNICAL ASSISTANCE.....	21
LISTSERV	21
CONFERENCES	22
DIRECT TECHNICAL ASSISTANCE	23
DATA ENTRY FILES	23
CHAPTER II: EVALUATION METHODOLOGY	25
EVALUATION METHODOLOGY	26
CONTENT ANALYSIS.....	26
CASE STUDIES	27
STATEWIDE MEASURES	27
CHAPTER III: DEMONSTRATION PROJECT INFORMATION.....	29
PROJECT CHARACTERISTICS.....	30
DEMOGRAPHICS	30
OVERVIEW OF HOW THE ARTS WERE USED.....	34
OVERVIEW OF HOW VAPA STANDARDS WERE ADDRESSED.....	35
OVERVIEW OF HOW OTHER CORE STANDARDS WERE ADDRESSED.....	36
CHAPTER IV: INTENDED OUTCOMES	38
PROJECT INTENDED OUTCOMES AND IMPACTS.....	39
INTENDED OUTCOMES FOR STUDENTS.....	41
IMPROVED ACADEMIC ACHIEVEMENT.....	41
IMPROVED ATTITUDES AND BEHAVIOR IN SCHOOL.....	40
HEALTHIER STUDENT SELF-CONCEPT	42
IMPROVED CREATIVITY	44
IMPROVED ARTISTIC ABILITY AND KNOWLEDGE	47
IMPROVED CONFIDENCE IN THE ARTS	49
INCREASED ENTHUSIASM FOR THE ARTS.....	51
OTHER INTENDED OUTCOMES FOR STUDENTS	54
INTENDED OUTCOMES FOR TEACHERS AND ARTISTS	56
INCREASED TEACHER AND ARTIST AWARENESS AND USE OF THE VAPA STANDARDS	56
IMPROVED COLLABORATION BETWEEN TEACHERS AND ARTISTS	61
INCREASED CONFIDENCE, KNOWLEDGE AND SKILLS FOR USING THE ARTS IN THE CLASSROOM	64
INCREASED INTEGRATION OF VAPA AND OTHER CORE CONTENT STANDARDS	67
CONTINUED USE OF PROJECT-DEVELOPED LESSON PLANS USING THE ARTS	69
OTHER INTENDED OUTCOMES FOR TEACHERS	70

SCHOOL AND DISTRICT RELATED INTENDED OUTCOMES	72
INCREASED SUPPORT AND AWARENESS OF ARTS WITHIN THE SCHOOL.....	72
IMPROVED ACADEMIC PERFORMANCE	73
PARENT AND COMMUNITY INTENDED OUTCOME	74
INCREASED SUPPORT AND AWARENESS OF ARTS WITHIN THE SCHOOL.....	74
CHAPTER V: COMMON THEMES	77
COMMON THEMES FOR PROJECT IMPLEMENTATION	78
PROJECT ACCOMPLISHMENTS BEYOND INTENDED OUTCOMES	78
SUCCESSFUL IMPLEMENTATION PRACTICES	79
PROJECT CHALLENGES	83
RESOURCES DEVELOPED	91
PROJECT VISIBILITY	92
PROJECT SUSTAINABILITY	94
REFERENCES.....	96
APPENDIX: CASE STUDY SITE REPORTS.....	98
AMERICAN COMPOSERS FORUM.....	99
ARMORY CENTER FOR THE ARTS	105
BRAVA! FOR WOMEN IN THE ARTS.....	112
CROCKER ART MUSEUM	119
CALIFORNIA STATE UNIVERSITY, SACRAMENTO	126
GUALALA ARTS.....	131
RIVERSIDE ARTS COUNCIL.....	140
VALLEY CENTER-PAUMA UNIFIED SCHOOL DISTRICT	146

List of Tables

TABLE 1: NUMBERS REACHED IN 2001-2002 AND 2002-2003 SCHOOL YEARS	30
TABLE 2: TARGETED POPULATION.....	31
TABLE 3: POPULATION CHARACTERISTICS	32
TABLE 4: CALIFORNIA COUNTIES REACHED BY 2002-2003 CAC DEMONSTRATION PROJECTS	33
TABLE 5: REGIONAL DESCRIPTION	34
TABLE 6: ART FORMS ADDRESSED	34
TABLE 7: IMPROVED STUDENT ATTITUDES AND BEHAVIOR	43
TABLE 8: IMPROVED STUDENT ARTISTIC ABILITY AND KNOWLEDGE.....	48
TABLE 9: IMPROVED STUDENT CONFIDENCE	50
TABLE 10: INCREASED STUDENT ENTHUSIASM	52
TABLE 11: TEACHER AWARENESS AND USE OF VAPA STANDARDS	57
TABLE 12: ARTIST AWARENESS AND USE OF VAPA STANDARDS.....	58
TABLE 13: TEACHER COLLABORATION WITH ARTISTS	62
TABLE 14: ARTIST COLLABORATION WITH TEACHERS	62
TABLE 15: TEACHER-ARTIST COLLABORATION.....	62
TABLE 16: TEACHER CONFIDENCE, KNOWLEDGE AND SKILLS FOR USING THE ARTS	65
TABLE 17: TEACHER INTEGRATION OF VAPA AND OTHER CORE CONTENT STANDARDS	68
TABLE 18: PARENT AND COMMUNITY SUPPORT AND AWARENESS OF THE ARTS WITHIN SCHOOLS	75

EXECUTIVE SUMMARY

The Demonstration Projects were created to evaluate how art makes a difference – both for individual students and for individual schools. Each funded project was a partnership between an arts organization and an educational institution. In the demonstration grants 58 projects served 92,653 students, 4,138 teachers, 2,684 classrooms, 496 schools and 185 districts.

The mission of the California Arts Council (CAC) Demonstration Project was to make arts basic to schools and define workable models that described why and how they were successful, so that other interested schools and communities can adopt these models. Fifty-eight grantees were funded to provide arts education services during the 2001-2002 school year; 55 were refunded for the 2002-2003 school year. The CAC required grantees to include an evaluation component, and WestEd was contracted to provide an overall program evaluation and technical assistance. The Demonstration Project was intended to be a three-year project. However, due to state budget cuts, funding was decreased in the second year and eliminated for the third year.

Throughout the evaluation, WestEd used a combination of methods to learn about project characteristics as well as successes and challenges encountered during implementation. WestEd used content analysis, case studies, and developed a statewide system of measures to gather qualitative and quantitative data. In addition, in-depth case studies were conducted on nine CAC Demonstration Project sites. Technical assistance was provided through a listserv, conferences, direct assistance through numerous telephone and email conversations, and the provision of customized data entry files.

Project Demographics

One goal of the CAC was to distribute funds throughout the state representing multiple counties in Northern and Southern California, as well as urban, suburban, and rural settings. Projects were located in 22 different counties, with Los Angeles and San Francisco counties having the highest number of grantees. Additionally, approximately half the grantees served people in urban settings (52%), and approximately one-third served people from suburban (35%) and rural (31%) settings.

Grantees worked with students, teachers, and artists from many schools and districts across California. During the 2001-2002 school year, 64,195 students participated in Demonstration Projects representing 97 school districts. These numbers increased to 92,653 students and 185 school districts in the 2002-2003 school year.

Grantees also worked with students from a wide range of grade levels. Some projects focused on a specific grade level, such as 2nd or 3rd graders. Other grantees worked with multiple grade levels, including some that worked with all students k-12 within the school or district. The majority of grantees worked with students between kindergarten and 5th grade. Just over half worked with 6th through 8th grade students and almost one-third worked with 9th through 12th grade students.

The majority of grantees targeted students from economically disadvantaged communities and ethnic minorities. Nearly three-quarters of grantees involved English Language Learners, with projects intended to increase literacy skills and English language proficiency. Just over one-third of grantees worked with students enrolled in special education classes or classified as “at-risk.” Students classified as “at-risk” included juvenile offenders, children of immigrants, gang members, high school dropouts, and students failing their classes.

Some grantees focused on one art form, such as music or theater. However, many grantees worked with a variety of talented artists representing a wide range of art forms. Dance was the most common art form used, followed closely by visual arts, music, and drama.

Intended Outcomes

Intended outcomes will be discussed for students, teachers and artists, as well as parents and community. In this section, each intended outcome will be briefly described, followed by statewide findings where applicable and two examples of individual project findings.

Intended Outcomes for Students

The CAC, WestEd, and the Statewide Advisory Committee identified seven common intended outcomes for students: 1) improved artistic ability and knowledge; 2) improved academic achievement; 3) improved attitudes and behavior in school; 4) improved creativity; 5) healthier self-concept; 6) improved confidence in the arts; and 7) increased enthusiasm for the arts. For each intended outcome, WestEd and the Statewide Advisory Committee provided at least one measure to assess projects’ impact.

Improved Academic Achievement

Improved academic achievement through the arts encompassed improved student learning and critical thinking; increased quality of student work, grades, and test scores; and improved skills of English Language Learners (ELLs) in other core content areas. Several projects intended to improve student knowledge in subject areas such as language arts, social studies, and mathematics.

For the statewide evaluation, we hoped to collect SAT-9/CAT-6 standardized test scores prior to and after implementation of the project. However, schools were yet to receive test scores for the 2002-2003 school year, and projects ended prematurely, making aggregated data analysis impossible.

Examples of individual project findings include:

- ❖ Art integration at a community day school for at-risk youth and juvenile offenders found students improved their language skills an average of one grade level and their math skills an average of two grade levels. (Yuba County Office of Education)
- ❖ Significant increases were found in district writing scores among students who participated in playwriting workshops; scores for a similar group of students not participating in the project declined. (Playwrights Project)

Improved Attitudes and Behavior in School

Improved attitudes and behavior in school included student motivation and engagement, improved attendance and behavior, and a reduced need for discipline. Three statewide measures were used to assess the projects' impact on student attitudes and behavior, including a measure for students, teachers, and artists.

Teacher data on student attitudes and behavior for four grantees were aggregated and analyzed using independent t-tests. At posttest, teachers indicated a greater proportion of students showed respect for classmates' art, participated more when arts were used, and were engaged when arts were used. These improvements were not statistically significant. However, teacher pretest ratings were high leaving little room for change.

Examples of individual project findings include:

- ❖ The average number of absences for Native American students participating in the project was significantly lower than a matched comparison group of students not in the project. Additionally, participating students were less likely to be absent the day the artist visited than any other day of the week. (Valley Center-Pauma Unified School District)
- ❖ Survey results indicated a 40 percent increase in students' ability to work together and participate in team activities. Students also scored higher than a comparison group of students in peer negotiation, leadership skills, and team working abilities. (San Jose Children's Musical Theater)

Healthier Student Self-Concept

Healthier self-concept included the areas of self-efficacy, empathy, aspirations, humor, and personal skills such as communication and cooperation.

Thirteen grantees indicated improving student self-concept was an intended outcome of the project; however, only eight administered the statewide measure to students. We were unable to aggregate data for improved student self-concept because of limited pretest data. Therefore, only individual project findings are discussed.

Examples of individual project findings include:

- ❖ Survey data showed students participating in the project had better self-concepts than a comparison group of students ($p < .05$). (Cal Poly, San Luis Obispo)
- ❖ A measure of writing self-efficacy revealed significant improvements among students participating in the project ($p < .01$). Further, project students' scores increased while scores from a comparison groups decreased. (Playwrights Project)

Improved Creativity

Individual projects assessed student creativity as it related to each projects' specific art form(s). Some examples of creativity include improved expression, use of visualization, and creative thinking or problem solving.

Fourteen grantees indicated improving student creativity was an intended outcome of the project; however, only nine administered the statewide measure to students. We were unable to aggregate data for improved student creativity because of limited pretest data and incomplete data sets. Therefore, only individual project findings are discussed.

Examples of individual project findings include:

- ❖ A teacher measure of creativity showed fourth graders with California Arts Council-funded instruction had a significantly higher average than fourth graders from the previous year who did not receive the arts instruction ($p < .01$). (Cal Poly, San Luis Obispo)
- ❖ Several projects reported an increasing trend of students indicating they would be interested in a job that would require a lot of their talents. (Cultural Odyssey, HeArt Project, Institute for the Renewal of Modern Culture, Riverside Arts Council)

Improved Artistic Ability and Knowledge

Improved artistic ability and knowledge included students' knowledge about art as well as their creative and artistic abilities. Twenty-two grantees indicated improving students' artistic ability and knowledge was an intended outcome for the project.

Teacher data on students' artistic ability and knowledge for six grantees were aggregated representing approximately 50 teachers. For all questions, teachers indicated statistically significant improvements in their students' artistic ability, including creative writing, art critique, use of art-related materials, and the identification of art elements.

Examples of individual project findings include:

- ❖ Teacher surveys reflected significant differences between treatment and comparison groups in the following areas: creative and engaging writing, making connections between art and other subjects, critiquing others artwork, using art-related materials, learning art skills, familiarity with arts vocabulary, and identification of art elements ($p < .05$). (California State University, Sacramento)

- ❖ Students receiving poetry instruction scored significantly higher than a comparison group on all poetry-related items of a student artistic ability and creative writing survey ($p < .05$). Teacher and artist retrospective surveys also showed significant improvement in students' poetry-related abilities ($p < .05$). (California Poets in the Schools)

Improved Confidence in the Arts

Individual projects measured student confidence as it related to each project's art form(s). Examples include liking to perform or show artwork. Thirty-one grantees indicated improving student confidence was an intended outcome of the project. Only teacher reports of improved student confidence from four projects were aggregated. No student or artist data could be aggregated because of limited usable pre-post data.

Teachers indicated a significantly greater proportion of students were confident in their artistic ability, proud of their artwork, and eager to share their artwork at posttest than at pretest. Teachers also indicated that a significantly lower proportion of their students were fearful about making mistakes and reluctant or unable to get started at posttest than at pretest.

Examples of individual project findings include:

- ❖ Students at one project had significantly higher scores on the statewide measure of student confidence ($p < .05$). This finding was reinforced by teacher reports reflecting a majority of students being confident, eager, and proud. (Brava! For Women in the Arts)
- ❖ A grantee that collected pre- and post- data with a comparison group found the treatment group to have a significant increase over the course of the project while the comparison group did not ($p < .01$). (Opera Piccola)

Increased Enthusiasm for the Arts

Increased enthusiasm for the arts was the most common intended outcome for students. Thirty-seven grantees hoped to build enthusiasm among students through increased access and exposure to the arts. Along with enthusiasm were increased excitement, motivation, appreciation, and interest in the arts.

Teacher survey data were aggregated for four grantees, representing approximately 50 teachers. Four out of five questions showed significant increases and the fifth started high leaving little room for improvement.

Examples of individual project findings include:

- ❖ Teachers working with arts specialists rated their students significantly more enthusiastic than a comparison group of teachers ($p < .05$). (Plumas County Arts Commission)
- ❖ One project found student ratings of enthusiasm for the arts increased after participating in the project. Ratings from a comparison group of students showed decreases in enthusiasm for the arts. (San Jose Repertory Theater)

Intended Outcomes for Teachers and Artists

Two intended outcomes were identified for both teachers and artists, increased awareness and use of the VAPA Standards and improved collaboration between teachers and artists. Three additional intended outcomes were identified for teachers: 1) increased confidence, knowledge, and skills for using the arts in the classroom; 2) increased awareness and teaching to the VAPA Standards with other core content areas; and 3) continued use of project-developed lesson plans.

Increased Teacher and Artist Awareness and Use of the VAPA Standards

Grantees hoped to increase teacher and artist understanding of and their ability to teach lessons that appropriately meet the California Visual and Performing Arts (VAPA) Standards. Twenty-seven grantees reported this intended outcome for teachers, and twenty grantees reported the intended outcome for artists.

WestEd was able to aggregate teacher data from 20 grantees representing approximately 165 teachers and artist data from 17 grantees representing approximately 160 artists. Statistically significant increases were found between pre- and post- tests for both teachers and artists.

When aggregated, teacher and artist data revealed significant improvements in knowledge and use of the VAPA Standards. Many individual projects were unable to show statistically significant changes because of small sample sizes. The significant differences demonstrate arts in education projects can increase teacher and artist knowledge and use of the VAPA Standards.

Examples of individual project findings include:

- ❖ Significant improvements were found on teachers' understanding and use of the VAPA Standards ($p < .001$), with the mean score increasing one full point on a four-point scale. (Arts Orange County)
- ❖ Teachers reported significant increases in familiarity with the VAPA Standards ($p < .01$), and understanding of the different components of arts education ($p < .05$). (City of Glendale Arts and Culture Commission)

Improved Collaboration between Teachers and Artist

A common goal for many grantees was to increase collaboration between teachers and artists. More specifically, grantees wanted to increase the time teachers spend working, consulting and planning lessons directly with artists. Twenty-four grantees identified improved teacher-artist collaboration as an intended outcome.

Teachers and artists were asked to answer two questions both in terms of their current level of agreement and their level of agreement prior to the project: 1) I understand the importance of teachers and artists working together; and 2) I discussed VAPA and other content standards with an artist (or teacher on the artist measure). Although individual project data from the statewide measure revealed few projects making an impact on teacher-artist collaboration (possibly because of the small number of artists participating in individual projects -- some projects had only two or three artists), matched t-tests conducted on the aggregated data revealed statistically significant findings for both teachers and artists.

Examples of individual project findings include:

- ❖ Teachers reported significant increases in their belief that teacher-artist collaboration was beneficial for their students ($p < .01$). (Cal Poly, San Luis Obispo)
- ❖ An artist-in-residency project reported significant increases in artists understanding of the importance of collaboration, and in artists discussing VAPA Standards with teachers ($p < .05$). (Arts for the Schools)

Increased Confidence, Knowledge and Skills for Using the Arts in the Classroom

Increased confidence, knowledge and skills for using the arts in the classroom was the most common intended outcome for teachers, identified by 31 grantees. Data from four grantees representing 44 teachers were aggregated.

Teacher responses on the number of hours per week and weeks per year varied greatly by art form; data for any specific art form were insufficient to conduct statistical analyses. Therefore, only responses to the first four questions could be aggregated. Statistically significant differences were found on all four questions.

Examples of individual project findings include:

- ❖ Teachers participating in an Arts in Education Demonstration Project reported significantly higher confidence, knowledge and skills for using the arts than a comparison group ($p < .05$). (Merced County Arts Council)
- ❖ After participating in a literacy though dramatic arts project, teachers could list specific skills acquired through the project, and teachers were very confident in their ability to teach literacy though the arts (mean of 4.83 on a 5-point scale). (Brava! For Women in the Arts)

Increased Integration of VAPA and other Core Content Standards

One intended outcome was to develop teacher competency in teaching content standards (including language arts, mathematics, science and/or social studies/history) through the arts. Rather than teaching each subject separately, teachers would be able to integrate content from multiple subjects, such as addressing both drama and language arts standards, or social studies and visual arts standards.

Twenty-nine grantees indicated increased integration of the arts with other core subjects as an intended outcome. Changes between pre- and post- test were not statistically significant. However, the pretest means indicate the teachers began the project with higher than average levels of interest, use, and comfort. This could be expected, especially among projects in which teachers volunteered to participate. It is possible the lack of change between pre- and post- test resulted from a ceiling effect with the teachers already high on the scale.

Examples of individual project findings include:

- ❖ Teacher surveys revealed statistically significant increases in their ability to use the VAPA Standards and integrate art into the curriculum. Three quarters (75%) of teachers reported the project adequately prepared them to integrate art across the curriculum. (Young Audiences of San Jose and Silicon Valley)
- ❖ Teachers from a project school were significantly more likely to use the arts to teach other core subject areas than a comparison group of teachers from a non-participating school. (Merced County Arts Council)

Continued Use of Project-Developed Lesson Plans Using the Arts

Twenty-two grantees hoped to leave teachers with arts-integrated lesson plans that teachers would continue to use even after the project ended. The statewide measure asked teachers to indicate whether or not they planned to use the project-developed lesson plans in the future, and why or why not.

Fifteen grantees provided usable data representing 151 teachers; the majority of whom (86%) indicated they would continue to use the lesson plans. Some reasons teachers listed for continuing to use the project-developed lesson plans included: students responded positively to lessons, lessons were easy to use and implement, lessons enhanced the curriculum, and students were more engaged and interested when lessons included art.

Parent and Community Intended Outcome

Increased Support and Awareness of Arts within the School

Seventeen grantees indicated increased parent and community support and awareness of the arts within the school was an intended outcome. The goal included increasing awareness of the arts in the classroom, taking students on field trips to performances and exhibitions, building awareness of schoolwide art activities, and inviting parents and community members to watch or teach lessons in the classroom.

WestEd aggregated data from 12 projects representing approximately 165 teachers. Statistically significant increases were found on all eight questions from the statewide survey. The greatest increases were found in parents' understanding the value of

exposing their children to the arts and overall parent and community awareness of arts in the schools.

Examples of individual project findings include:

- ❖ A survey completed by parents shows a willingness to be much more involved in the classroom, including volunteering to assist with and teach art lessons, donating money for the arts, and chaperoning student field trips to performances or exhibitions. (Armory Center for the Arts)
- ❖ Over half (56%) of the parent surveys indicated more school time should be devoted to the arts, and nearly three-quarters indicated they would attend a schoolwide art day with their children. (Arts Council of Napa Valley)

Successful Implementation Practices

Grantees identified a wide range of practices they found essential for successful project implementation. Although implementation practices varied by project and some were listed by only one or two projects, patterns emerged across the sites suggesting the importance of specific elements. Successful implementation practices common across multiple projects included:

- District and school commitment
- Support for teachers and artists
- Planning and communication
- Orientation meetings for relationship building
- Multiyear implementation and evaluation

Over the two years of the project, thousands of teachers gained arts experiences and hundreds of lesson plans were developed. Whether or not projects will be sustained is unknown. However, grantees are optimistic in their search for new funds to continue and expand their projects.

Chapter I

Introduction and Overview

EVALUATION OVERVIEW

The Demonstration Projects were created to evaluate how art makes a difference – both for individual students and for individual schools. Each funded project was a partnership between an arts organization and an educational institution. In the demonstration grants 58 projects served 92,653 students, 4,138 teachers, 2,684 classrooms, 496 schools and 185 districts.

The mission of the California Arts Council (CAC) Demonstration Project was to make arts basic to schools and define workable models that described why and how they were successful, so that other interested parties, schools and communities can impart or emulate these models. Fifty-eight grantees were funded in 2001 to provide arts education services during the 2001-2002 school year; 55 were refunded for the 2002-2003 school year. The CAC required grantees to include an evaluation component and WestEd was contracted to provide an overall program evaluation and technical assistance. The Demonstration Project was intended to be a three-year project. However, due to state budget cuts, funding was decreased in the second year and eliminated for the third year.

It was a paradigm shift for grantees to measure systematically the impact of their work on students, teachers, artists and communities. During the first year, the CAC asked WestEd to assist grantees in determining the impact of their projects in addition to evaluating the impact of the Demonstration Project as a whole. It was difficult for grantees to manage project activities and conduct objective evaluations. Therefore, during the second year, all 55 projects hired an external local evaluator to work with WestEd on conducting evaluation activities. This structure was unprecedented for these arts programs in California.

During the first year, grantees developed project-specific goals, objectives and intended outcomes. Consequently, in order for WestEd to answer the question of the impact of the Demonstration Projects, it was necessary to develop groupings of projects according to their goals, objectives and intended outcomes. Doing so involved analyzing proposals and first year reports, as well as conducting visits to nine case study sites (eight case study sites continued in year two). As a result of this work, we created categories that reflected overarching goals across projects. Statewide intended outcomes were created based on these categories and were tested to ensure they were accurate and reflective of projects' objectives. At the start of the second year, statewide measures were developed and distributed for the statewide evaluation.

The information reported in this document is based on Final Reports completed by grantees and local evaluators, and findings from the eight case study interviews

conducted by WestEd staff. This report will begin with a review of the literature, followed by a description of the technical assistance WestEd provided. Chapter II describes the evaluation methodology. Chapter III provides summary information about the projects, including demographic information of those served and uses of the arts. Chapter IV discusses the impacts of the Demonstration Project on students, teachers and artists, schools and districts, and parents and the community. Aggregated statewide findings are provided, as well as selected individual project findings. Chapter V discusses common themes that emerged across projects including successful implementation practices, implementation challenges, resources developed, project visibility, and project sustainability. Site reports for the eight case study projects are provided in the Appendix.

REVIEW OF THE LITERATURE

The place of the arts in education has been debated for decades. Many educators, artists, and parents have advocated including the arts in public education. They posit that the arts should be a tenet of basic education because of the richness of the content of the arts – the knowledge, skills, and understanding the arts provide for all students, not just those perceived to have talent.

The arts are seen as important in providing a historic base of understanding of our civilization. The arts develop aesthetic perception and help students analyze, evaluate and comprehend the world around them. The arts foster creativity, an essential element in the world of work (SCANS Report, 1991; Florida, 2002). The arts provide a means of communication that is unique to each of the disciplines of dance, music, theater, and visual art.

The arts are slowly becoming more integral to education as some educators discover that learning through the arts can help students excel in other, non-arts “core” disciplines. For example, studies done by Harvard Project Zero (2000) found that studying music supports spatial learning and therefore can increase students’ mathematics skills.

Many, however, see the arts as an extra or a set of fun activities to supplement a lesson and give students a break from more “serious” learning. As budgets become tight and concerns grow for low mathematics and reading scores, many schools are focusing resources and instructional time on increasing basic skills and reducing what are viewed by some as superfluous programs. As a result, arts educators, advocates, and arts organizations have had to demonstrate that the arts are essential to basic education and can extend and deepen learning in the curriculum areas such as reading and mathematics. This calls for strong evaluation and assessment of arts in education programs to reveal the benefits of instruction in the arts and the impact the arts can make on students’ lives.

Supporters of the arts in education often argue that the arts have something to offer students that other subjects do not. These advocates do not believe that the arts need to be proven to support other subjects but that the arts have intrinsic value and can teach and affect children’s lives the way that other disciplines cannot. Goldberg (2001) argues that the arts are critical to education because they impact human knowledge, expression, culture, and communication. In other words, one might argue that the arts are an essential part of human life, equal to knowing how to read, write and reason, for example. We do not expect educators to prove that teaching history increases mathematics skills, so arts supporters do not believe that the arts should be appreciated only because they

support other disciplines, but because they offer something unique and fundamental (Harvard Project Zero, 2000).

In *The Rise of the Creative Class* (2002), Florida argues that creativity is growing in importance to the future of society. He believes that in our complex and multicultural world, human creativity is the driving force behind progress in economy and social life. Florida states:

In virtually every industry, from automobiles to fashion, food products, and information technology itself, the winners in the long run are those who can create and keep creating. This has always been true, from the days of the Agricultural Revolution to the Industrial Revolution (p. 5).

Furthermore, the author argues, interactions between artistic and cultural creativity will give rise to new industries that have yet to be discovered or created. He makes a connection between the new flexibility in workplaces (e.g., more casual dress codes) to employers recognizing the need for creativity and diversity at work. For these reasons, many advocates view the arts as essential to a well-balanced education.

However, the reality is that because of cuts in school budgets and a need to economize resources, school systems have done away with programs that are viewed as unnecessary. Since it is often difficult to see a direct link between the arts and learning, arts programs are often the first to go. In addition, the recent emphasis on accountability and standardized testing has pushed teachers to focus narrowly on reading, writing and mathematics, and often does not provide them with opportunities to be creative or take risks. For these reasons, many schools, especially low-income and low-performing schools, have had to justify their arts programs by showing that the arts have the value of “transfer” (Harvard Project Zero, 2000), i.e., they support learning in those basic, non-arts, content areas. Several studies have demonstrated that learning through the arts does increase academic skills and performance and, in addition, can engage students and hold their interest. Goldberg (2001) writes:

Not only do the arts serve as an engaging medium, but they provide students with the tools to work with ideas as well. In so doing, they also expand the expressive opportunities available to children in the classroom. Whereas traditional schooling relies heavily on testing and writing as the principal modes of assessment and expression, the arts expand the modes available to children as they seek to understand and express their conceptions of the world around them. (p. 2)

Catterall, Chapleau and Iwanaga's (1999) analysis of 25,000 students using National Educational Longitudinal Survey (NELS) data showed that students who participated in the arts outperformed those without art education on virtually every measure. Furthermore, they found evidence that sustained involvement in music and theater were highly correlated with success in mathematics and reading. In addition, the Chicago Arts Partnerships in Education (Catterall & Waldorf, 1999), which developed innovative arts-integrated curricula, made significant impacts in 14 high poverty schools in Chicago. When compared to similar, arts-poor schools, the CAPE schools advanced more quickly and showed significant gains. Commentary on this study questions the link made between the improvements in CAPE schools and the arts program, suggesting it could be due to the Hawthorne effect (Winner, 2002), i.e., the schools may have improved because they were implementing a new program and were part of a research study, not necessarily because the program was effective. Additionally it was suggested future studies compare CAPE schools with similar schools that implement new and innovative, but non-arts, programs. However, the CAPE study is widely noted as demonstrating the positive impacts of the arts in education, especially among urban low performing schools.

The *Champions of Change* (Fiske, 1999) compendium of studies on the value of a variety of arts education programs found similar themes across all studies. Researchers discovered that arts programs reached students and made positive impact on their lives in several ways. The arts:

- Reach students who are not otherwise being reached.
- Reach students in ways that they are not otherwise being reached.
- Connect students to themselves and each other.
- Transform the environment for learning.
- Provide learning opportunities for the adults in the lives of young people. Students see that learning is a lifetime process.
- Provide new challenges for those students already considered successful.
- Connect learning experiences to the world of real work. The work place has changed and the development of ideas and creativity are becoming more and more valued.

Many researchers also believe that the arts are a way to “level the playing field” (Fiske, 1999, p. viii). Arts participation is highly correlated with socioeconomic status, the most significant predictor of academic achievement. Economically disadvantaged children have extremely limited access to the arts in their communities, and therefore research shows that arts programs in their schools are important, even if just for increased exposure to the arts. Catterall, Chapleau and Iwanaga (1999) found high arts involvement had a greater impact on academic achievement for children from lower income families than for children from higher income families.

An integral part of sustaining arts in education programs involves evaluation and assessment. As mentioned above, due to a lack of funding, schools, especially low-income schools, have to justify their use of resources. Often, in order to maintain an arts program, a strong evaluation needs to be in place to show positive impacts on students. In many cases, arts supporters attempt to show “transfer” to other academic areas (Harvard Project Zero, 2000), leading to student success in those non-arts disciplines. However, arts organizations and schools face the challenge of showing significant results fast enough for funders to accept the worthiness of their programs. Many artists and educators believe that the effects of even the strongest arts programs will not show immediate impacts in the form of higher test scores in one academic year. Bransford and Schwartz (2000) found that the effect of interactions among domains and disciplines (e.g., music and reasoning) could be known only over time. They argue that longitudinal studies are needed to examine the long-term effects of learning across various situations.

Accurate measurement and methodologies are important in showing the effects, if any, of arts programs in schools and:

Knowing the full range of effects of arts learning requires assessment instruments that can validly and reliably identify and measure the outcomes of arts instruction. Discerning the impact of that learning in other domains requires instruments other than the currently available tests of reading and mathematics achievement (Critical Links, 2002, p. iv).

Researchers argue that these tests do not accurately reflect the effects of arts learning, but also that they cannot even measure the complexities of mathematics or language learning themselves (Bradley, 2002; Catterall, 2002; Baker, 2002). With limited forms of measurement and assessment available (usually standardized test scores), arts in education advocates face the challenge of “proving” their programs are worthy of funding, time and resources.

In *Champions of Change* (Fiske, 1999), the researchers point out that art programs not only benefit students, but teachers and communities as well. The addition of arts resources can help reenergize teachers and engage students (Seidel, 1999). For students in urban settings, it is important to have examples of strong education programs, including arts education. Further, a study of the Chicago Arts Partnerships in Education (CAPE) found that well-constructed partnerships among schools, artists, and arts organizations can increase student achievement (Catterall & Waldorf, 1999). The challenge for evaluators and arts advocates is to show that the arts are as important to education as any other subject. As the Harvard Project Zero (2000) study argues, “let’s stop requiring more from the arts than of other subjects. The arts are the only school subjects that have been challenged to demonstrate transfer as a justification for their usefulness” (p. 3). They argue that non-arts measures, e.g., mathematics and reading scores, should not be used to validate arts programs. However, realistically, because it is difficult for most funders and the public to see an explicit connection between the arts and positive student outcomes, and not to see art merely as “fluff,” policy makers and stakeholders need to see that the arts will demonstrate increased performance in basic non-arts skills; skills that are seen as valuable to the workplace and to the public.

Researchers face a challenge regarding the future of the arts in education. Harvard Project Zero (2000) recommends two types of future studies to demonstrate the importance of the arts. One is a “theory-building study” in which researchers conduct in-depth studies of high performing schools that offer strong arts programs and other effective educational programs. The other type of study suggested is a “theory-driven study,” which tests the hypothesis that learning through the arts is more effective for certain types of students. Although Harvard Project Zero (2000) opposes “justifying the arts based on their secondary effects, there may well be educational value in programs that use the arts as vehicles that foster understanding of non-arts content” (p. 3). The arts could be used as entry points into history or mathematics lessons, engaging at-risk or detached students, and result in higher achievement in non-arts content areas. For example, Shaw (1999) reported that inner-city children increased their mathematics scores by more than two grade levels when exposed to a Mozart sonata.

While not addressed in the CACs Arts in Education Demonstration Project, another focus of research is the neurological effects or brain-imaging associated with the art education. For example, Shaw and other colleagues are examining the effects of exposure to classical music on spatial performance, spatial-temporal reasoning, and brain wave activity (Shaw, 1999; Rideout & Laubach, 1996; Shaw & Bodner, 1999).

Whatever the methodology may be, more research is needed on the topic of arts in education. It is important for arts advocates and educators to learn more about using data and showing impacts on student learning for full funding of the arts to continue. It is equally important for stakeholders and policy makers to allow enough time for projects to show results, and be realistic in their expectations of what types of results an arts in education program will show depending on the dosage (i.e., intensity and duration) of the program.

The CAC's Arts in Education Demonstration Project intended to fill current gaps in research and evaluation, as well as identify successful models that could be replicated in other settings. Unfortunately, the project ended early due to state budget cuts. Although project implementation and evaluation could not be completed, some grantees were able to demonstrate positive impacts on students, teachers, artists, and parents and community members. This report will present what was accomplished through the two years of the Demonstration Project.

TECHNICAL ASSISTANCE

In addition to conducting the statewide evaluation, WestEd was contracted to provide technical assistance to grantees and their local evaluators. Technical assistance was provided through a listserv, conferences, direct assistance through numerous telephone and email conversations, and the provision of customized data entry files.

Listserv

WestEd launched a listserv in Winter 2002. The purpose of the listserv was to facilitate communication and information sharing among the CAC, WestEd, and CAC grantees and their local evaluators. This on-line group, operated through Edgateway and maintained by WestEd, was intended to post critical information about timelines, conference dates, requests for information, updates about the project, and common questions shared by grantees. All subscribers received posted messages through email. Message postings proved to be an effective method for disseminating critical information in a timely manner. For example, the listserv was instrumental in:

- Allowing grantees to download attachments, such as the statewide measures and the final report template created by WestEd
- Providing easily accessible contact information for grantees and evaluators
- Posting information about federal Arts in Education funding opportunities
- Relaying important information about conferences, including dates and locations
- Posting timelines for report due dates
- Providing information on dates and procedures regarding contracts and invoices
- Addressing commonly asked questions for all grantees

All project coordinators and local evaluators subscribed to the listserv, and it was continually updated as new project personnel and evaluators joined. Although the primary intent was for the CAC and WestEd to post information pertaining to all grantees, the site was available for grantees to pose questions to individual staff members of the CAC and WestEd. The listserv also enabled discussion members to view e-mail

addresses of all grantees, local evaluators, CAC staff, and WestEd evaluation staff. Demonstration Project grantees and local evaluators were shown how to access and use the listserv at all California Arts Council/WestEd conferences, and were provided with a list of “Frequently Asked Questions.” This information was also conveniently placed in a binder for conference participants to take with them and reference when necessary.

Throughout the project, grantees found the listserv to be a useful and efficient communication tool that provided subscribers with information about the grant, as well as a way for grantees to ask questions as they arose.

Conferences

In the first year of the project, WestEd sponsored four conferences on evaluation for grantees, two for grantees in Northern California and two for grantees in Southern California. The first pair of evaluation conferences were held in June 2001 and provided each grantee with a binder entitled “Proving Your Point.” The binder included information about evaluation approaches, along with conference handouts and a series of worksheets for clarifying goals and objectives, identifying activities and the outcomes of those activities, and how these outcomes would be measured. The conferences also included workshops in which WestEd staff met with demonstration grantees individually and in small groups to discuss specific goals, objectives, and evaluation plans. The participants at each conference varied from professional evaluators hired by some project staff to those who considered satisfaction surveys alone to be sufficient evaluation data. In order to further assist the grantees, WestEd sponsored the second pair of one-day follow-up conferences in August 2001 to provide technical assistance to sites needing ongoing help to refine their goals, objectives, and evaluation plans.

These conferences disseminated needed information to grantees and also provided them with an opportunity to meet each other, share ideas, and discuss strengths and challenges of the various projects. Presentations provided information about the listserv, discussed the new request for proposals (RFP) for grantees, and shared some project accomplishments and challenges. In addition to informational presentations, several grantees performed, providing an artistic balance to the conferences.

In the second year of the project, separate conferences were held for evaluators and project coordinators, although both were welcome to attend each conference. WestEd sponsored the evaluators conference and the CAC sponsored the project coordinator conference. In November 2002, evaluators were the primary audience. The conference focused on the statewide evaluation and the role of local evaluators. Local evaluators

were presented with a set of statewide measures compiled by WestEd and the Statewide Advisory Committee (See Chapter II for more information on the statewide measures and the Statewide Advisory Committee). The measures were intended to provide a common method to assess project impact so data could be aggregated across the state. Conference attendees were provided with a binder containing a hardcopy of the statewide measures, and electronic copies of the measures were distributed via the listserv.

The CAC-sponsored conference, held in February 2003, was intended for project coordinators. Attendees participated in a Social Marketing Workshop that focused on mapping the authorizing environment, diagnosing the authorizing environment, developing a case statement, and prioritizing next steps. Additionally, presentations discussed evaluation plans and processes, the RFP for the next year of funding, the statewide evaluation, and models of professional development. At all conferences, attendees were provided opportunities to network and discuss projects with other grantees, as well as CAC and WestEd staff.

Direct Technical Assistance

WestEd staff members were available to provide direct technical assistance to project coordinators and evaluators as needed. Direct technical assistance was primarily provided through phone and email conversations. Project coordinators and evaluators requested assistance on a variety of topics, including research methodology, statewide measures, data analysis, evaluation requirements, and reporting requirements. Additionally, WestEd staff helped project coordinators locate local evaluators and identify appropriate instruments to measure impacts on project level outcomes.

Data Entry Files

WestEd also provided customized data entry files to grantees and local evaluators. Data entry files were created for each statewide measure with space to include demographic variables such as grade and gender, tracking variables such as identification numbers, and survey data for pre and post administrations. WestEd customized data entry files for each grantee based on the intended outcomes listed in the evaluation plan. By providing customized data entry files to grantees, WestEd hoped to receive data in a common format with identical coding so data could be aggregated across multiple sites. Additionally, providing data entry files saved the grantees and local evaluators time and effort creating their files.

Chapter II

Evaluation Methodology

EVALUATION METHODOLOGY

Throughout the evaluation, WestEd used a combination of methods to learn about project characteristics as well as successes and challenges encountered during implementation. WestEd used content analysis, case studies, and developed a statewide system of measures to gather qualitative and quantitative data. In year one, we conducted a content analysis of the 46 Final Reports received by the cut-off date (several projects received a no-cost extension; therefore, their Final Reports were not expected until the completion of their contract year). In addition to content analysis, in-depth case studies were conducted on nine CAC Demonstration Project sites. In year two, statewide measures were added for a common method of assessing project impacts.

Content Analysis

In year one, WestEd created templates for Interim and Final Reports to be completed by project coordinators and evaluators. The templates required grantees to report on various characteristics of their projects, including the population served (e.g., number of teachers, students, artists), the services provided (e.g., professional development, arts supplies, artists-in-residence), the visibility plan, how challenges, goals and objectives of the project were addressed, and the evaluation design. The Interim and Final Report templates were similar. However, the Interim Report template focused more on project implementation, where as the Final Report template focused more on outcomes, impacts, and measures.

In the second year of the projects, only Final Reports were required. WestEd provided a Final Report template with separate sections for project coordinators and local evaluators to complete. Project coordinator sections included questions about how the project was implemented, changes between the first and second year, population served, the services provided, overall accomplishments and challenges, project visibility, and sustainability of the project. Local project evaluators were asked to complete a separate page for each intended outcome with questions about data sources, instrumentation, methodology, analyses, findings, and interpretation of data. WestEd designed the Final Report template so the evaluator sections could also serve as the evaluation report for the project where appropriate.

Case Studies

An additional part of the evaluation was based on the case studies conducted by WestEd. Nine sites were originally selected by the CAC and WestEd, but only eight sites continued with the Demonstration Project in its second year. (The other project did not reapply for funding in year two). Sites were selected based on a variety of factors including geographic location, urban/rural setting, project goals, and the population being served. (For detailed information about the sites, please see Appendix).

WestEd conducted two-person, two-day site visits to each of the nine case study projects in Winter 2002. The case studies included observations, interviews, focus groups, and reviews of documents and artifacts. In addition to interviewing key informants (teachers, artists, project coordinators, evaluators, principals and administrators), we observed the programs and collected curricula, lesson plans, and other pertinent documents when available.

Site visits were not feasible the second year due to reduced funding. Instead, phone interviews were conducted with the project coordinators and the local evaluators. Project coordinator interviews asked about project goals, accomplishments, best practices, challenges, project partners, visibility, performances or exhibitions, and plans for sustaining the project. Evaluator interviews asked about data collection, findings, evaluation successes and challenges, project successes and challenges, intended outcomes, and findings from site visits.

Statewide Measures

During the first year of the Demonstration Project, grantees did not have local evaluators. Therefore, many grantees experienced difficulty locating and/or creating appropriate tools to measure goals and objectives. Some grantees relied on informal feedback from teachers and artists, while others created their own general question surveys that did not always yield the desired information.

In the second year, adjustments were made to overcome evaluation difficulties encountered in the first year. Some grantees hired an external evaluator (referred to as the local evaluator) during the first year of funding, and in year two this was a requirement. Local evaluators helped many grantees identify clear, measurable goals and objectives as well as identify appropriate measurement tools. Additionally, based on the content analysis of year one reports, the CAC, WestEd, and the Statewide Advisory Committee identified specific intended outcomes shared by many of the grantees. (The

Statewide Advisory Committee consisted of seven local evaluators experienced in arts education evaluation). These statewide intended outcomes created a common language for discussing goals and impacts. Based on the intended outcomes, WestEd and the Statewide Advisory Committee developed a set of statewide measures addressing each intended outcome. Statewide measures provided grantees and local evaluators common tools for assessing change and allowed data to be aggregated across multiple sites. WestEd also provided each grantee with a customized Excel document to enter their data and collected the data files in order to analyze data across sites.

Evaluation Terminology Explained in Simplified Terms

Pretest: The survey or test given to participants before the start of the arts program.

Pretest Mean: The average of all of the scores from surveys before the arts program started.

Posttest: The survey or test given to participants after completing the arts program.

Posttest Mean: The average of all the scores from surveys after completing the arts program.

t-value: A measure of the difference between pretest and posttest taking into account how the scores are spread out among the participants who responded to the pretest and posttest.

p < .05: The proportion of time this could have occurred by chance. In other words, less than 5 times out of 100 would this difference between pretest and posttest happen by chance. This indicates that this is more likely a real occurrence, not just something that happened by chance. Betting that an increase would occur when this arts program was given the next time would be a very good bet.

Chapter III

Demonstration Project Information

PROJECT CHARACTERISTICS

This chapter provides an overview of project characteristics for the 55 grantees funded by the CAC Arts in Education Demonstration Project. The chapter begins by presenting demographic information, including the number of people reached through the projects, some characteristics of the people reached, and regional characteristics. This is followed by an overview of how the arts were used by projects, how the Visual and Performing Art (VAPA) Standards were addressed, and how other core content standards were addressed.

Demographics

Target Population

Grantees worked with students, teachers, and artists from many schools and districts across California. During the 2001-2002 school year, 64,195 students participated in Demonstration Projects representing 97 school districts. As can be seen in Table 1, these numbers increased to 92,653 students and 185 school districts in the 2002-2003 school year. A greater number of projects reported data for the 2002-2003 school year and several grantees expanded their projects and reached additional students.

Table 1

Numbers Reached in 2001-2002 and 2002-2003 School Years

	2001-2002 (of 46 projects)	2002-2003 (of 52 projects)
Students	64,195	92,653
Teachers	2,711	4,138
Artists	813	1,028
Schools	461	496
Districts	97	185

The CAC grant provided many children with art education who would not otherwise have access to the arts. For example, one rural project involved every teacher from six different school districts. Another project increased the number of classes

participating from 2 to 5, reaching an additional 90 students. One project expanded the music curriculum to another grade level and was able to reach an additional 120 students.

Grantees also worked with students from a wide range of grade levels. Some projects focused on a specific grade level, such as 2nd or 3rd graders. Other grantees worked with multiple grade levels, including some that worked with all students k-12 within the school or district. As can be seen from Table 2, the majority of grantees worked with students between kindergarten and 5th grade. Just over half worked with 6th through 8th grade students, and almost one-third worked with 9th through 12th grade students.

Table 2
Targeted Population

	Number of Grantees	Percent of Grantees
Students K – 5	40	79.9
Students 6 – 8	28	53.8
Students 9 – 12	16	30.8

n = 52

Population Characteristics

Many grantees included specific populations they hoped to reach through the Demonstration Project. As can be seen in Table 3, the majority of grantees targeted students from economically disadvantaged communities and ethnic minorities. Nearly three-quarters of grantees involved English Language Learners, with projects intended to increase literacy skills and English language proficiency. Just over one-third of grantees worked with students enrolled in special education classes or classified as “at-risk.” Students classified as “at-risk” included juvenile offenders, children of immigrants, gang members, high school dropouts, and students failing their classes. For example, one project worked with students enrolled in a continuation school, and another focused on children participating in a special program for first-time juvenile offenders.

Table 3
Population Characteristics

	Number of Projects	Percent of Projects
Economically Disadvantaged / Low SES	42	80.7
Ethnic Minority	42	80.7
English Language Learners	37	71.2
Special Education	20	38.5
At Risk	19	36.5

n = 52

Regional Characteristics

One goal of the CAC was to distribute funds throughout the state representing multiple counties in Northern and Southern California, as well as urban, suburban, and rural settings. As can be seen from Table 4, projects were located in 22 different counties, with Los Angeles and San Francisco counties having the highest number of grantees. Although some projects worked with teachers and students from multiple counties, such as one project that involved teachers from six different counties, only the home county of the grantee is represented in the table.

Table 4*California Counties Reached by 2002-2003 CAC Demonstration Projects*

	Number of Projects
Los Angeles County	12
San Francisco County	8
Santa Clara County	4
Alameda County	3
Marin County	3
San Diego County	3
Ventura County	3
Mendocino County	2
Placer County	2
Sacramento County	2
Contra Costa County	1
Madera County	1
Merced County	1
Napa County	1
Orange County	1
Plumas County	1
Riverside County	1
San Luis Obispo County	1
Sonoma County	1
Trinity County	1
Yolo County	1
Yuba County	1

n = 54

The CAC also funded projects representing a variety of settings, with some projects serving multiple settings. As can be seen in Table 5, approximately half the grantees served people in urban settings, and approximately one-third served people from suburban and rural settings.

Table 5
Regional Description

	Number of Projects	Percent of Projects
Urban	27	51.9
Suburban	18	34.6
Rural	16	30.8

n = 52

Overview of How the Arts were Used

Some grantees focused on one art form, such as music or theater. However, many grantees worked with a variety of talented artists representing a wide range of art forms. Dance was the most common art form used, followed closely by visual arts, music, and drama (Table 6).

Table 6
Art Forms Addressed

	Number of Projects	Percent of Projects
Dance	36	69.2
Visual Arts	35	67.3
Music	35	67.3
Drama	35	67.3
Literary Arts	30	57.7
Media Arts	18	34.6

n = 52

Within each of the general art forms were a variety of mediums. Dance included folk dances, hip-hop, movement classes, and choreography. The visual arts included painting, drawing, calligraphy, cartooning, ceramics, etching, murals, tile painting, sculpture, and architecture. Music included reading sheet music, playing instruments, rhythm, and singing. Drama included acting, storytelling, puppetry, and scriptwriting. Literary arts included creative writing and poetry. Media arts included digital imaging, graphic design, storyboarding, web page design, and video production.

Each project was also unique in how the arts were used. Many projects placed artists into classrooms to teach art-integrated lessons. For example, one project partnered a local artist with every participating teacher to collaborate on an arts-integrated project.

Another project placed artists in classrooms as mentors to not only provide art instruction to students, but to also teach the teacher how to plan and develop standards-based lessons that incorporated arts instruction. In some projects, the artist co-taught art lessons with the teachers. Such was the case with one project that began the year with the artist leading the class and with the teacher's assistance, but ended the year with the teacher leading the class with the artist's assistance.

Another common use of the arts was to develop or co-develop curriculum units integrating the arts. Several projects teamed artists and teachers to co-develop lesson plans. These projects hoped to develop high-quality, arts-integrated curricula by utilizing the skills and talents of both the artist and teacher. For example, one project provided professional development workshops for artists and teachers on curriculum development and asked the artist-teacher team to work together to create lessons that integrated the arts with social studies. Additionally, some projects planned to field test and expand upon existing curricula. For example, one project added an artist residency to complement its science-integrated arts curriculum. Another project expanded its music integration curriculum to another grade level.

Many projects provided professional development to teachers on topics such as introducing the VAPA Standards, integrating art with other core content standards, assessing student artwork, tapping into external resources, and basic instruction on art techniques and terminology. Delivery of professional development also varied; projects provided summer institutes, weekend workshops, in-classroom instruction, afterschool seminars, and/or used district in-service days.

Another method of arts delivery was to expose students to professional performances. Some projects brought touring artists to the schools to perform, while others transported students to local theaters to view special matinee performances. For example, one project integrating theater arts and literacy took students to view professional performances at the local theater, and allowed students to perform their end-of-year production at the theater. While the art forms used or the exact method of delivering the arts varied greatly, the primary use was to expose students and teachers to the arts.

Overview of How VAPA Standards were Addressed

Projects addressed the VAPA Standards in a variety of ways. Some projects, either during the project period or in previous years, developed curriculum specifically designed to address the VAPA Standards and provided the curriculum units to teachers. For

example, one project worked with artists and art specialists to develop standards-based curriculum units during the first part of the year, then provided the units to teachers with an orientation on how to implement them. Other projects expanded their existing VAPA Standards-based curriculum into new schools, classrooms, or grade levels. One project modified the existing curriculum to be appropriate for older children, and another project added professional development workshops to complement the arts-based curriculum.

While some projects were field-testing their already developed curricula, other projects teamed artists and teachers to develop new curriculum units that addressed the VAPA Standards. In one project, artists provided the theater skills and teachers the language arts skills. Together, they developed a set of integrated curriculum units they hope to publish so others can replicate the project. Some projects relied on the artist to address the VAPA Standards. For example, one project that teamed teachers and artists had the teacher decide what standards he or she wanted addressed, and the artist designed a curriculum unit that addressed those standards.

In some cases, the artists were also responsible for educating the teachers on the VAPA Standards. Several projects employed artists to provide workshops to teachers on the Standards and how to implement them in the classroom. Other projects provided professional development to both teachers and artists to help them both understand and integrate the Standards. Overall, every project addressed at least some of the VAPA Standards, and some projects worked to address all Standards within the specified art form.

Overview of How Other Core Standards were Addressed

The majority of projects addressed standards from one or more other content areas, such as language arts, mathematics, social studies, or science. Similar to how projects addressed the VAPA Standards, many projects implemented already existing curricula that integrated both the VAPA Standards and other core content standards. One project provided teachers with music lessons from different cultures that corresponded to the cultures being presented by the social studies curriculum. Another project integrated arts with the science curriculum by having students draw, paint or sculpt items found in nature such as leaves, plants, and trees.

Other projects asked artists and teachers to co-develop new lesson plans that integrated VAPA and other core content standards. Again, projects used teachers' knowledge of the core content standards and artists' knowledge of the VAPA Standards to develop high-quality, standards-based curriculum. Additionally, some projects

provided professional development workshops to the artists on the content standards. For example, one project collaborated with university faculty to train and support artists. Another project developed a training program designed to provide artists with hands-on professional development to work in the classroom and teach arts-integrated lessons to students.

The majority of projects included integration of both the VAPA Standards and other core content standards. However, some projects only addressed the VAPA Standards, and some addressed one or two content standards. For example, one project working with kindergartners addressed some of the dance standards and did not integrate any other content standards. Another project focused primarily on visual arts standards and incorporated some grade-specific vocabulary words. Other projects required integration of VAPA and other core content standards, but allowed the artists and teachers to decide which standards were most appropriate. Regardless of which other core content standards were addressed (language arts, mathematics, science, or social studies), most projects integrated at least some other core content standards with the VAPA Standards.

Chapter IV

Demonstration Project Intended Outcomes and Impacts

PROJECT INTENDED OUTCOMES AND IMPACTS

Based on content analyses conducted during the first year of the study, the CAC, WestEd, and the Statewide Advisory Committee identified separate intended outcomes for students, teachers, artists, schools, and parents and the community. Seven intended outcomes were identified for students:

- 1) Improved academic achievement;
- 2) Improved attitudes and behavior in school;
- 3) Healthier self-concept;
- 4) Improved creativity;
- 5) Improved artistic ability and knowledge;
- 6) Improved confidence in the arts; and
- 7) Increased enthusiasm for the arts.

Two intended outcomes were identified for both teachers and artists: increased awareness and use of the VAPA Standards and improved teacher-artist collaboration. Three additional intended outcomes were identified only for teachers: 1) increased confidence, knowledge, and skills for using the arts in the classroom; 2) increased awareness and teaching to the VAPA Standards with other core content areas; and 3) continued use of developed lesson plans. Statewide intended outcomes for schools included 1) increased support through additional instructional time, materials and supplies, and 2) increased overall academic performance. Increased support and awareness of arts within the schools was identified as a statewide intended outcome for parents and the community.

Although the above were identified as the statewide intended outcomes, not all projects were expected to impact each outcome. This statewide list was derived from the most common outcomes listed in the first year reports. Grantees reported on only those statewide intended outcomes appropriate for their project, and were encouraged to measure any additional “local” intended outcomes expected.

WestEd and the Statewide Advisory Committee identified and/or developed measures to assess each of the statewide intended outcomes. Where possible, information was gathered from multiple data sources, e.g., to measure student confidence,

student, teacher, and artist surveys were developed. Detailed information about the measures is provided within the section describing each intended outcome.

This chapter of the report discusses findings for the student, teacher, artist, school, and parents and community statewide intended outcomes, as well as findings for local intended outcomes identified by individual projects. Each section begins with a description of the intended outcome and any statewide measures made available. Statewide findings and highlights from individual project findings are then presented.

Aggregated statewide findings are presented where possible. Of the 55 grantees, 44 (80%) sent files containing data for the statewide measures administered. Three projects relied on local instruments and did not use any statewide measures; one project closed its doors before posttests could be administered; and seven projects did not provide their data. From the 44 projects that sent data files, eight were not included in the aggregated data; seven data files were in an unusable format (e.g., data not coded or improperly coded), and one evaluator recommended the data not be included due to questions arising from the survey administration.

Although 36 data files were considered usable, the potential to aggregate data remained limited. Grantees intended to impact different areas and used the measures specific to their project's intended outcomes. Also, using statewide measures was highly recommended but not required (the intention was that they would be required in the third year of funding). Additionally, the statewide evaluation intended to measure change which requires pre-post data; grantees who were unable to collect pretest data could not be included in the statewide analyses.

INTENDED OUTCOMES FOR STUDENTS

The CAC, WestEd, and the Statewide Advisory Committee identified seven common intended outcomes for students: 1) improved academic achievement; 2) improved attitudes and behavior in school; 3) healthier self-concept; 4) improved creativity; 5) improved artistic ability and knowledge; 6) improved confidence in the arts; and 7) increased enthusiasm for the arts. For each intended outcome, WestEd and the Statewide Advisory Committee provided at least one measure to assess projects' impact. In addition to the common statewide intended outcomes, several projects identified and measured local intended outcomes for students as well. Statewide and individual project findings for the statewide intended outcomes for students, as well as findings from local project intended outcomes, are presented in this section.

Improved Academic Achievement

Improved academic achievement through the arts encompassed improved student learning and critical thinking; increased quality of student work, grades, and test scores; and improved skills of English Language Learners (ELLs) in other core content areas. Several projects intended to improve student knowledge in other core content areas such as language arts, social studies, and mathematics.

For the statewide evaluation, we hoped to collect SAT-9/CAT-6 standardized test scores prior to and after implementation of the project. However, schools were yet to receive test scores for the 2002-2003 school year, and projects ended prematurely making aggregated data analysis impossible. Therefore, this section focuses on findings from individual projects that measured academic achievement.

Individual Project Findings

The following are findings from individual projects:

- ❖ Art integration at a community day school for at-risk youth and juvenile offenders found students improved their language skills an average of one grade level and their math skills an average of two grade levels. (Yuba County Office of Education)
- ❖ Students participating in a storytelling project showed significant improvements in their listening comprehension scores. Although a comparison group also improved its scores, the difference was not significant. (Stagebridge)

- ❖ Two thirds (67%) of the students working with resident artists reported having arts instruction helped them become better writers and 56 percent reported it helped them become better readers. (Cal Poly, San Luis Obispo)
- ❖ Students participating in a project integrating animation and literacy showed significant improvements in their writing scores. (City of Glendale Arts and Culture Commission)
- ❖ A visual arts curriculum improved students' mathematics abilities, with the number of students correctly answering each question increasing between 25 and 74 percent. (Institute for the Renewal of Modern Culture)
- ❖ Significant increases were found in district writing scores among students who participated in play writing workshops; scores for a similar group of students not participating in the project declined. (Playwrights Project)

Individual projects were able to document gains in student learning and achievement, especially in areas focused through the art form. For example, storytelling enhanced students' listening comprehension and drama improved students' public speaking skills. However, additional data are needed to draw conclusions about the connection between the arts and improved subject matter knowledge.

Improved Attitudes and Behavior in School

Improved attitudes and behavior in school included student motivation and engagement, improved attendance and behavior, and a reduced need for discipline. Three statewide measures were used to assess the projects' impact on student attitudes and behavior, including a measure for students, teachers, and artists. The 38-item survey for students in grades 6 through 12 had a 6-point response scale (strongly agree to strongly disagree), while the kindergarten through 5th grade survey had a 2-point response scale (yes/no). The teacher and artist surveys were identical. Teachers and artists responded to three statements, indicating what percentage of students was representative of each statement with response categories ranging from fewer than 11 percent to more than 90 percent.

Twenty-six grantees indicated improved student attitudes and behavior was an intended outcome of the project. Teacher data from four projects were aggregated; no student or artist data could be aggregated because of limited pretest data.

Statewide Findings

Teacher data on student attitudes and behavior for four grantees were aggregated and analyzed using independent t-tests. At posttest, teachers indicated a greater proportion of students showed respect for classmates' art, participated more when arts were used, and were engaged when arts were used. These improvements were not statistically significant. However, teacher pretest ratings were high leaving little room for change (Table 7).

Table 7
Improved Student Attitudes and Behavior

	Pretest mean	Posttest mean	t-value
My students show respect for classmates' art	4.28	4.93	2.25
My students participate more when arts were used	4.83	5.18	1.29
My students are engaged when arts were used	5.03	5.39	1.41

*p < .05

The scale is from 1 to 6

Individual Project Findings

The following are findings from individual projects:

- ❖ The average number of absences for Native American students participating in the project was significantly lower than a matched comparison group of students not in the project. Additionally, participating students were less likely to be absent the day the artist visited than any other day of the week. (Valley Center-Pauma Unified School District)
- ❖ Survey results indicated a 40 percent increase in students' ability to work together and participate in team activities. Students also scored higher than a comparison group of students in peer negotiation, leadership skills, and team working abilities. (San Jose Children's Musical Theater)

- ❖ Teachers and artists reported significant increases in the percentage of students' who showed respect for classmates' art, participated when art was used, and were engaged when art was used ($p < .05$). (Riverside Arts Council)
- ❖ During dance lessons taught by artists, 32 percent of students indicated they are better behaved than during other lessons. (Aman Folk Ensemble)
- ❖ Teachers whose students participated in a visual and performing arts education project reported significantly better attitudes and behavior than a comparison group of teachers ($p < .05$). (Merced County Arts Council)
- ❖ Three-quarters (75%) of teachers indicated that 90 to 100 percent of their students were fully engaged in lessons that integrated the arts. (East Bay Center for the Performing Arts)
- ❖ All teachers interviewed reported the arts contributed to a more positive school experience for their students and 56 percent of teachers reported their students were more excited to come to school on art days. (Crocker Art Museum)
- ❖ After working with students for up to 12 weeks, artists reported marked improvement in students' attitudes and behaviors, particularly in terms of students' time on-task and enhanced perceptions about art and artists. (Performing Arts Center of Los Angeles County: Music Center Education Division)

Although statewide data did not show a significant change in students' attitudes and behavior, there was a positive shift. Additionally, individual projects were able to demonstrate significant improvements in students' attitudes and behavior. This is promising considering the limited duration of some projects and prior research indicating that minor shifts in attitudes are the precursors for student change. Additional research, including longitudinal studies, is needed to assess the actual impact of an arts in education project on students' attitudes and behavior.

Healthier Student Self-Concept

Healthier self-concept included the areas of self-efficacy, empathy, aspirations, humor, and personal skills including communication and cooperation. WestEd and the Statewide Advisory Committee made available a statewide measure that allowed grantees to assess project impact from the student perspective. The measure consisted of three scales,

achievement motivation, self-concept, and self-efficacy, in addition to a global self-concept scale that combined the self-concept and self-efficacy scales. The student survey consisted of 21 questions answered on a four-point scale from strongly agree to strongly disagree.

Thirteen grantees indicated improving student self-concept was an intended outcome of the project; however, only eight administered the statewide measure to students. We were unable to aggregate data for improved student self-concept because of limited pretest data. Therefore, only individual project findings are discussed.

Individual Project Finding

The following section contains specific grantee findings and comments regarding improved student self-concept.

- ❖ One project reported significant student improvements in the areas of self-satisfaction and planning ($p < .05$). Other aspects of self-concept were already high at the pretest. (Arts Council of Napa Valley)
- ❖ During focus groups, teachers said students had become more engaged and focused in all areas of their studies and had higher self-esteem. One teacher provided the example of Spanish-speaking students who were more motivated to learn English in order to understand the poems shared during the workshop. (Arts for the Schools)
- ❖ Survey data showed students participating in the project had better self-concepts than a comparison group of students ($p < .05$). (Cal Poly, San Luis Obispo)
- ❖ A measure of writing self-efficacy revealed significant improvements among students participating in the project ($p < .01$). Further, project students' scores increased while scores from a comparison groups decreased. (Playwrights Project)

Other projects' failure to find significant improvements in student self-concept is not surprising given projects' duration (one to two years) and the complexity of an individual's self-concept. Additional research, such as longitudinal studies, is needed to further assess the impact of arts in education projects on student self-concept.

Improved Creativity

Individual projects assessed students' creativity as it related to each projects' specific art form(s). Some examples of creativity include improved expression, use of visualization, and creative thinking or problem solving. WestEd and the Statewide Advisory Committee made available a statewide measure that allowed grantees to assess project impact from the student perspective. The measure comprised of four scales, elaboration, flexibility, fluency, and originality, and consisted of 18 questions answered on a three-point scale with higher scores reflecting greater or increased creativity or interest.

Fourteen grantees indicated improving student creativity was an intended outcome of the project; however, only nine administered the statewide measure to students. We were unable to aggregate data for improved student creativity because of limited pretest data and incomplete data sets. Therefore, only individual project findings are discussed.

Individual Project Findings

The following section contains specific grantee findings and comments regarding improved student creativity.

- ❖ One project reported fourth graders with California Arts Council-funded instruction had a significantly higher average than fourth graders from the previous year who did not receive the arts instruction on a teacher measure of creativity ($p < .01$). (Cal Poly, San Luis Obispo)
- ❖ Several projects reported an increasing trend of students indicating they would be interested in a job that would require a lot of their talents. (Cultural Odyssey, HeArt Project, Institute for the Renewal of Modern Culture, Riverside Arts Council)
- ❖ Middle school students at one project demonstrated gains on most measures of creativity after participating in art classes. (Institute for the Renewal of Modern Culture)
- ❖ Projects noted a trend that repeated and continued exposure had a positive impact on students' creativity. In one project, this resulted from enrollment in an art class for an entire year; in another it resulted from exposure over the course of two years. (American Composers Forum - Los Angeles Chapter, Yuba County Office of Education)

- ❖ During a focus group, 100 percent of students agreed their participation in the arts had increased their personal creativity. (Ojai Festivals, Ltd.)
- ❖ Students had slight increases on 90 percent of the areas assessed by the statewide measure of student creativity. (Riverside Arts Council)

Two noteworthy findings from individual projects were the trend that students became more interested in jobs that would require use of their talents and the positive impact that resulted from prolonged exposure to the arts. These findings are promising and highlight the need to continue funding and evaluating arts programs that attempt to improve students' overall educational experience.

Improved Artistic Ability and Knowledge

Improved artistic ability and knowledge included students' knowledge about art as well as their creative and artistic abilities. Two statewide measures were provided for assessing project impact on student artistic ability and knowledge. These measures allowed projects to assess impact from the teacher and artist perspectives. The teacher and artist surveys were identical. Teachers and artists responded to eight statements, indicating what percentage of students was representative of each statement. The six response categories ranged from fewer than 11 percent to more than 90 percent.

Twenty-two grantees indicated improving students' artistic ability and knowledge was an intended outcome for the project. Nineteen grantees used the statewide teacher measure, and eight used the artist measure. Only teacher data from six projects were aggregated, and no artist data could be aggregated because of the small number of grantees who used the measure and collected pretest data.

Statewide Findings

Teacher data on students' artistic ability and knowledge for six grantees was aggregated representing approximately 50 teachers. Data were analyzed with independent-samples t-tests. For all questions, teachers indicated statistically significant improvements in their students' artistic ability (Table 8).

Table 8
Improved Student Artistic Ability and Knowledge

	Pretest mean	Posttest mean	t-value
Write creatively and engaging	3.20	4.57	5.35*
Make connections between art and other subjects	3.07	4.16	3.86*
Critique others artwork	2.57	3.65	3.40*
Use art-related materials	2.70	4.02	5.35*
Learn art skills	2.61	4.31	6.10*
Familiar with art vocabulary	2.10	3.63	5.51*
Identify art elements	2.15	3.57	5.21*
Improve artistic ability	3.17	4.70	5.90*

* $p < .01$

The scale is from 1 to 6

Individual Project Findings

The following are individual project findings regarding students' artistic ability:

- ❖ Seventy-two percent of teachers reported at least 75 percent of their students learned new skills, specifically acting and poetry skills. Additionally, 67 percent of teachers indicated 75 to 90 percent of their students demonstrated increased ability in art. (Performing Tree, Inc.)
- ❖ Teacher surveys reflected significant differences between treatment and comparison groups in the following areas: creative and engaging writing, making connections between art and other subjects, critiquing others artwork, using art-related materials, learning art skills, familiarity with arts vocabulary, and identification of art elements ($p < .05$). (California State University, Sacramento)
- ❖ Students receiving poetry instruction scored significantly higher than a comparison group on all poetry-related items of a student artistic ability and creative writing survey ($p < .05$). Teacher and artist retrospective surveys also showed significant improvement in students' poetry-related abilities ($p < .05$). (California Poets in the Schools)

- ❖ Teacher comparisons of students who did and did not participate in the arts in education project reported those who participated made significant improvements in artistic ability ($p < .01$). (Cal Poly, San Luis Obispo)
- ❖ Fifty-three percent of treatment teachers indicated more than 76 percent of their students possessed various art-related skills (e.g., make connections between art and other subjects, use art-related materials), while only five percent of teachers from a comparison group gave such ratings. (Young Imaginations)
- ❖ Students made significant improvements over a comparison group in their knowledge of playwriting concepts as reflected by their ability to identify elements of a script and define play obstacles and settings ($p < .01$). (Playwrights Project)

Statewide and individual project findings indicate exposing students to art and providing students with art instruction results in improved artistic ability. Reports from teachers and artist across many projects appear to support these findings. While additional study involving standardized instruments of artistic ability is necessary, the current findings are promising.

Improved Confidence in the Arts

Individual projects measured student confidence as it related to each project's art form(s). Examples include liking to perform or show artwork. WestEd and the Statewide Advisory Committee made statewide measures available that allowed grantees to assess project impact on student confidence from three perspectives: students, teachers, and artists. The student survey consisted of four yes/no questions. The teacher and artist surveys were identical. Teachers and artists responded to five statements, indicating the percentage of students representative of each statement. There were six response categories ranging from fewer than 11 percent to more than 90 percent.

Thirty-one grantees indicated improving student confidence was an intended outcome of the project. Where possible, WestEd aggregated data for improved student confidence within each data source (student, teacher, or artist) when grantees used the statewide measure. Only teacher reports of improved student confidence from four projects were aggregated. No student or artist data could be aggregated because of limited usable pre-post data.

Statewide Findings

Teacher surveys about student confidence were aggregated and analyzed using matched t-tests. Teachers indicated a significantly greater proportion of students were confident in their artistic ability, proud of their artwork, and eager to share their artwork at posttest than at pretest. Teachers also indicated that a significantly lower proportion of their students were fearful about making mistakes and reluctant or unable to get started at posttest than pretest (Table 9).

Table 9
Improved Student Confidence

My students are...	Pretest mean	Posttest mean	t-value
...confident in artistic ability	2.93	4.30	7.07*
...proud of artwork	3.95	4.98	3.57*
...eager to share their artwork	4.10	4.93	2.68*
...fearful of making mistakes in art	3.25	2.45	2.81*
...reluctant to get started in art	2.93	2.14	3.00*

* $p < .05$

The scale is from 1 to 6

Individual Project Findings

The following section contains specific project findings and comments regarding improved student confidence.

- ❖ At posttest, 95 percent of students reported other people enjoyed their artwork; 93 percent reported they like to show their artwork to others; 90 percent reported they liked the way their artwork looked; and 71 percent reported they like to perform in front of an audience. (Arts for the Schools)
- ❖ Students at one project had significantly higher scores on the statewide measure of student confidence ($p < .05$). This finding was reinforced by teacher reports reflecting a majority of students being confident, eager, and proud. (Brava! For Women in the Arts)

- ❖ Data from one project revealed significant growth in students' affinity for and attitudes about poetry. Students scored significantly higher than a comparison group on questions related to performing in front of an audience, others enjoying their art, and showing their art to others ($p < .01$). Teacher ratings supported these findings as they reflected significant increases from pretest to posttest on students' confidence and pride in poetry ($p < .01$), and a significant decrease on students' fear of making mistakes in poetry ($p < .01$). (California Poets in the Schools)
- ❖ A grantee that collected pre- and post- data with a comparison group found the treatment group to have a significant increase over the course of the project while the comparison group did not ($p < .01$). (Opera Piccola)
- ❖ One student wrote in his/her journal, "When I'm on stage I kind of get shy and feel weird in the stomach and get a little dizzy, but I got over it very soon. Now, I can talk in front of people without feeling sick. Now I'm comfortable." (San Jose Children's Musical Theater)
- ❖ A teacher participating in an artist-mentor project shared: "[student name] had attempted suicide earlier in the year, and had believed that her story didn't matter to anyone else and that she had nothing anyone would want to hear. She became one of the star poets, and was surprised at her own abilities to move others." (Aunt Lute Books)

In summary, aggregated statewide data from teachers revealed significant improvements in student confidence in the arts. Additionally, student data from individual projects indicated improvement in confidence in the arts, which was reaffirmed through teacher responses.

Increased Enthusiasm for the Arts

Increased enthusiasm for the arts was the most common intended outcome for students. Thirty-seven grantees hoped to build enthusiasm among students and their families through increased access and exposure to the arts. Along with enthusiasm were increased excitement, motivation, appreciation, and interest in the arts.

WestEd and the Statewide Advisory Committee made statewide measures available that allowed grantees to assess project impact on student enthusiasm from three perspectives: students, teachers, and artists. The student survey consisted of seven yes/no

questions, and one happy/sad question. The teacher and artist surveys were identical. Teachers and artists responded to five statements, indicating what percentage of students was representative of each statement. There were six response categories ranging from fewer than 11 percent to more than 90 percent.

Of the 37 grantees who indicated increased enthusiasm as an intended outcome, 25 used the statewide student survey, 17 used the statewide teacher survey, 8 used the statewide artist survey, and 15 used locally developed surveys. Although most grantees provided their data to WestEd, only teacher data from four grantees could be aggregated. No student or artist data could be aggregated because of limited pretest data and incomplete data sets.

Statewide Findings

Teacher survey data were aggregated for four grantees, representing approximately 50 teachers. Independent sample t-tests were used to analyze the data. As can be seen from Table 10, four out of five questions showed significant increases. The only question that did not reveal a significant difference asked about students' reading. It approached statistical significance and also started with the highest pretest score of all the questions; therefore leaving less room for change.

Table 10
Increased Student Enthusiasm

My students...	Pretest mean	Posttest mean	t-value
...are enthusiastic about art	4.31	5.21	3.58*
...enjoy making art	4.32	5.20	3.48*
...read about art or artists during silent reading time	4.42	4.95	1.75
...enjoy their own artwork	3.93	4.67	2.76*
...enjoy the artwork of others	4.07	4.93	3.30*

*p < .01

The scale is from 1 to 6

Individual Project Findings

Some notable findings from individual projects include:

- ❖ More than 90 percent of students indicated they look forward to art classes, enjoy making art, and desire more art in school. Additionally, 76 percent reported they would be sad if there were no arts in school, and 70 percent reported they would like to be an artist. (Arts for the Schools)
- ❖ One student stated, “Meeting the author of the book and interacting with her makes it more interesting and exciting. It becomes more real and stops being just an English class book because we can hear where the stories came from and why the author did it the way she did.” (Aunt Lute Books)
- ❖ Students working directly with artists indicated significantly higher enthusiasm for poetry, including writing poetry, listening to poetry, and being a poet ($p < .01$). (California Poets in the Schools)
- ❖ After participating in an arts in education project, 31 percent of teachers believed their students understood the value of studying the arts compared to 16 percent prior to the project. The increase was statistically significant ($p < .05$). (City of Glendale Arts and Culture Commission)
- ❖ One project found statistically significant increases in students’ self assessment of enthusiasm for the arts ($p < .01$). Teacher ratings were not statistically significantly. However, pretest means were already very high leaving little room for improvement. (California State University, Los Angeles, Auxiliary Services)
- ❖ Teachers working with arts specialists rated their students significantly more enthusiastic than a comparison group of teachers ($p < .05$). (Plumas County Arts Commission)
- ❖ Nearly all students (95%) reported they would like to take more theater classes after their experiences working with a musical theater company. (San Jose Children’s Musical Theater)
- ❖ One project found student ratings of enthusiasm for the arts increased after participating in the project. Ratings from a comparison group of students showed decreases in enthusiasm for the arts. (San Jose Repertory Theater)

- ❖ Nearly all parents (95%) reported their child's art skills and knowledge increased as a result of the arts in education project. Additionally, 90 percent reported their children enjoyed the art lessons, and 85 percent indicated the artists motivated their children to learn more. (Willits Charter School)

Statewide and individual project findings indicate a trend toward increased enthusiasm. Teachers, more so than students, believed the arts in education projects increased student enthusiasm for the arts. Many individual projects reported increased enthusiasm among students.

Other Intended Outcomes for Students

Some grantees identified and measured intended outcomes beyond those included by the CAC, WestEd, and the Statewide Advisory Committee. In these cases, the grantee and/or local evaluator located an appropriate existing measure, modified an existing measure, or developed a new measure to assess the impact on the intended outcome. In this section, findings specific to intended outcomes of individual projects are presented.

- ❖ Survey data from a project that introduced students to multicultural dances found significant improvements in students' understanding and attitudes toward their peers from different cultural backgrounds. Additionally, increases were found in students' interest in learning about different cultures and understanding of social studies content; however the differences were not statistically significant. (Aman Folk Ensemble)
- ❖ Students participating in the arts reported more positive relationships than a group of students not involved in the arts. (Merced County Arts Council)
- ❖ The vast majority of teachers (86%) indicated participating in the arts in education project increased students' problem solving skills and writing skills. (Cal Poly, San Luis Obispo)
- ❖ Students learning multicultural music from artists-in-residence demonstrated increased multicultural awareness, and teachers became more aware of various cultural backgrounds of their students. (Arts for the Schools)

- ❖ Half the teachers participating in a music integration project reported that between 50 and 90 percent of their students exhibited improved critical thinking skills. (American Composers Forum - Los Angeles Chapter)

Results from individual grantees demonstrated the arts can impact students in aspects beyond those identified as common intended outcomes.

INTENDED OUTCOMES FOR TEACHERS AND ARTISTS

Two intended outcomes were identified for both teachers and artists, increased awareness and use of the VAPA Standards and improved collaboration between teachers and artists. Three additional intended outcomes were identified for teachers:

- 1) Increased confidence, knowledge, and skills for using the arts in the classroom;
- 2) Increased awareness and teaching to the VAPA Standards with other core content areas; and
- 3) Continued use of project-developed lesson plans.

Findings from each intended outcome are presented here, along with findings from additional intended outcomes for teachers identified by individual projects. Each section begins with a description of the intended outcome and statewide measures made available. Aggregated data are presented when possible, and each section highlights specific findings from individual projects.

Increased Teacher and Artist Awareness and Use of the VAPA Standards

Grantees hoped to increase teacher and artist understanding of and their ability to teach lessons that appropriately meet the California Visual and Performing Arts (VAPA) Standards. Twenty-seven grantees reported this intended outcome for teachers, and twenty grantees reported the intended outcome for artists. The statewide measure provided post and retrospective pretest data so evaluators could assess knowledge and use of the VAPA Standards prior to and after the project was implemented. (Retrospective pretests ask respondents to answer questions based on their beliefs or practices before participating in the project). The teacher measure consisted of six before/now questions while the artist version consisted of five before/now questions. Both measures also had three qualitative questions that asked about the VAPA strands, use of the VAPA Standards, and challenges encountered in addressing the VAPA Standards.

Twenty-three grantees provided WestEd with their data on the statewide measure for teachers. Data from 20 grantees were aggregated representing approximately 165 teachers; data from 3 grantees were removed because of missing pretest data. An

additional 3 grantees used local measures either in addition to or instead of the statewide measure.

Similarly, 18 grantees provided WestEd with their artist statewide data. Data from 17 grantees were aggregated as one grantee did not provide sufficient pretest data. An additional 7 grantees used local measures either in addition to or instead of the statewide measure. Aggregated statewide findings and highlighted individual project findings are presented below.

Statewide Findings

WestEd was able to aggregate teacher data from 20 grantees representing approximately 165 teachers and artist data from 17 grantees representing approximately 160 artists. Matched t-tests on the pre-post data were conducted both for teachers and artists. As can be seen in Table 11, statistically significant increases were found between teacher pre- and post- tests.

Table 11
Teacher Awareness and Use of VAPA Standards

	Pretest mean	Posttest mean	t-value
Knowledgeable about VAPA Standards	1.90	3.04	14.92*
Able to discuss VAPA Standards	1.82	2.87	12.83*
Comfortable integrating VAPA Standards	2.14	3.16	13.89*
Confident implementing VAPA lessons	2.22	3.18	12.66*
Committed to addressing VAPA Standards	2.25	3.26	12.86*
Understand the VAPA Standards	1.94	3.06	11.52*

*p < .01

The scale is from 1 to 4

Although artist pretest means were somewhat higher than teacher pretest means, the positive trend was similar for both groups and artists demonstrated slightly greater gains between pre- and post- tests. As with the teachers, significant increases were found on all five questions (Table 12).

Table 12
Artist Awareness and Use of VAPA Standards

	Pretest mean	Posttest mean	t-value
Knowledgeable about VAPA Standards	2.33	3.68	15.53*
Able to discuss VAPA Standards	2.29	3.65	15.86*
Comfortable integrating VAPA Standards	2.54	3.69	14.50*
Confident implementing VAPA lessons	2.57	3.68	12.83*
Understand the VAPA Standards	2.49	3.77	11.97*

* $p < .01$

The scale is from 1 to 4

When aggregated, teacher and artist data revealed significant improvements in knowledge and use of the VAPA Standards. Many individual projects were unable to show statistically significant changes because of small sample sizes. The significant differences found using aggregated data demonstrate arts in education projects can increase teacher and artist knowledge and use of the VAPA Standards.

Teachers and artists responded differently when asked to describe ways in which the VAPA Standards were addressed in the past year. Teachers responded with a variety of projects such as dramatic readings, acting out vocabulary words, creating cultural masks, attending performances, chanting songs, aesthetic valuing, artist presentations, and lessons about multicultural music. Artist responses included activities such as lesson planning, curriculum development, conducting workshops, and the direct teaching of students. The disparity found between teacher and artist responses show the differing perspectives of these two groups.

Teachers and artists identified similar obstacles to addressing the VAPA Standards. Both teachers and artists most commonly cited time as the greatest obstacle in addressing the VAPA Standards. This included time to plan lessons, time to set up materials, and time to clean up the classroom. Other obstacles cited by both teachers and artists included lack of supplies and lack of training on the Standards. Despite some similarities, teachers and artists differed when identifying additional obstacles. Obstacles reported by teachers included difficulty planning lessons that integrated art with other content areas and insufficient time to focus on the arts because of the emphasis on other content areas such as language arts and mathematics. Obstacles reported by artists included overcoming teacher and administrative opposition, the format and wording of the VAPA Standards (artists reported finding the terminology of the Standards to be

educationally based rather than artistically based), and difficulty in developing standards-based lessons without stifling students' creativity.

Individual Project Findings

Teacher related findings from local evaluations included:

- ❖ Significant improvements were found on teachers' understanding and use of the VAPA Standards ($p < .001$), with the mean score increasing one full point on a four-point scale. (Arts Orange County)
- ❖ A model professional development project for teachers found significant increases in teachers' awareness and understanding of the VAPA Standards ($p < .01$) regardless of the art form associated with the professional development. (City of San Diego Commission for the Arts & Culture)
- ❖ Survey results showed an overall increase from "somewhat disagree" to "somewhat agree" in teachers' understanding and use of the VAPA Standards. (Arts Council Napa Valley)
- ❖ After working with resident artists, teachers' responses to the statewide measure increased from a range of 1.17-1.50 up to a range of 2.67-3.50. Additionally, most teachers were able to list the VAPA strands, and the greatest obstacle to implementing the VAPA Standards was lack of instructional time. (California College of Arts and Crafts (CCAC) Center for Art and Public Life (CAPL))
- ❖ Teachers reported significant increases in familiarity with the VAPA Standards ($p < .01$), and understanding of the different components of arts education ($p < .05$). (City of Glendale Arts and Culture Commission)
- ❖ Project staff reported the professional development focus on learning about the Standards, how to use the Standards, and the importance of the Standards in teaching art helped account for the significant increases ($p < .01$) in teachers' awareness and use of the VAPA Standards. (Young Audiences of San Jose and Silicon Valley)

Artist related findings from local evaluations included:

- ❖ Survey results showed significant improvements in artists' awareness and use of the VAPA Standards. These findings were supported by interviews and document review of lesson plans, which indicated increased use and understanding of the Standards. (Performing Tree, Inc.)
- ❖ One project teaming resident artists with classroom teachers found slight, but not statistically significant, increases in artists' awareness and use of the VAPA Standards. However, artist pretest scores were very high, leaving little room for growth. (Valley Center-Pauma Unified School District)
- ❖ A review of weekly journal entries found artists were more likely to address the Artistic Perception, Creative Expression, and Historical and Cultural Context strands of the VAPA Standards than the Aesthetic Valuing, and Connections, Relationships and Applications strands. (Young Imaginations)
- ❖ A countywide project providing professional development workshops to artists and art organization staff found significant improvements ($p < .01$) in self-reported knowledge and understanding of the VAPA Standards. However, only approximately one-third could correctly name the five VAPA strands. (Los Angeles County Arts Commission)
- ❖ One artist stated, "Someone with an education-related degree would learn the VAPA Standards, while another individual with an art degree would learn the art concepts. Both individuals would learn the same ideas but in a different format." (Arts for the Schools)

Overall, statewide and individual project findings indicated Demonstration Project grantees were able to impact teacher and artist awareness and use of the VAPA Standards. Both teachers and artists reported time as the greatest obstacle in implementing standards-based art education. Several artists commented that prior to participating in the project they were unaware VAPA Standards existed. Projects that provided professional development to teachers and artists significantly impacted their awareness and use of the VAPA Standards.

Improved Collaboration between Teachers and Artists

A common goal for many grantees was to increase collaboration between teachers and artists. More specifically, grantees wanted to increase the time teachers spend working, consulting and planning lessons directly with artists. The statewide measure to assess teacher-artist collaboration included three post-project questions, and two post-retrospective-pre questions that asked teachers and artists to respond for both before and after participating in the project. Responses for all questions were on a four-point scale, ranging from strongly agree to strongly disagree.

Twenty-four grantees identified improved teacher-artist collaboration as an intended outcome. Twenty grantees provided usable teacher data files to WestEd representing 301 teachers, and 17 grantees provided usable artist data files representing approximately 200 artists. Seven grantees also used local teacher measures and eight used local artist measures either in addition to or instead of the statewide measure. Statewide and local project findings for teacher-artist collaboration are presented in this section.

Statewide Findings

Teachers and artists were asked to answer two questions both in terms of their current level of agreement, and their level of agreement prior to the project: 1) I understand the importance of teachers and artists working together; and 2) I discussed VAPA and other content standards with an artist (or teacher on the artist measure). Although individual project data from the statewide measure revealed few projects making an impact on teacher-artist collaboration (possibly because of the small number of artists participating in individual projects, some projects had only two or three artists), matched t-tests conducted on the aggregated data revealed statistically significant findings for both teachers (Table 13) and artists (Table 14).

Table 13
Teacher Collaboration with Artists

	Pretest mean	Posttest mean	t-value
Understand the importance of collaboration	3.33	3.78	10.17*
Discussed standards with an artists	2.20	2.86	11.18*

*p < .01

The scale is from 1 to 4

Table 14
Artist Collaboration with Teachers

	Pretest mean	Posttest mean	t-value
Understand the importance of collaboration	3.42	3.90	10.28*
Discussed standards with an teachers	2.56	3.24	8.98*

*p < .01

The scale is from 1 to 4

The teacher and artist measures also asked three post-project questions regarding teacher participation in artist taught lessons, collaboration with the other, and time available to collaborate. Teachers and artists reported similar levels of teacher participation (Table 15). However, a higher percentage of artists reported collaborating with teachers than teachers reported collaborating with artists. Additionally, just over half the artists believed sufficient time was available to collaborate with the teachers, although 85 percent of teachers believed sufficient time was available.

Table 15
Teacher-Artist Collaboration

	Teachers %	Artists %	Difference %
Teacher participated in artist lessons	87	79	8
Collaborate with other on projects	53	73	20
Sufficient time available to collaborate	85	57	28

Individual Project Findings

Teacher and artist findings from local evaluations included:

- ❖ Teachers reported significant increases in their belief that teacher-artist collaboration was beneficial for their students ($p < .01$). (Cal Poly, San Luis Obispo)
- ❖ One teacher stated, “The presence of the artists has given the teachers another lens through which we can view our students. Their perspective and their ability to skillfully use alternative methods of learning than we might regularly use has provided our students with amazing opportunities to engage meaningfully with their education.” (Museum of Children’s Art)
- ❖ One local evaluator reported only slight increases in teacher excitement about working with an artist, but noted pretest levels were extremely high, leaving little room for change. (City of Glendale Arts and Culture Commission)
- ❖ An artist-in-residence noted “amazing” changes in teachers’ perceptions of artists, with teachers becoming more aware of the artist’s abilities and viewing the artist as a resource. Another artist noted teachers were extremely supportive and attended fundraisers and art exhibitions outside of the school. (Arts for the Schools)
- ❖ Participating artists from one project demonstrated a consistently high level of commitment to collaborate but were frustrated by the insufficient time available to work with teachers. (Museum of Children’s Art)
- ❖ An artist-in-residency project reported significant increases in artists understanding of the importance of collaboration, and in artists discussing VAPA Standards with teachers ($p < .05$). (Performing Tree, Inc.)
- ❖ An artist working on a multiyear project reflected on the first year stating, “We were on probation with the school...they might not want us, or did not yet know if they wanted us.” By the second year, artists had developed positive relationships with the teachers and were able to truly influence the curriculum and teaching. (Museum of Children’s Art)

- ❖ Artists from one site reported difficulty building collaborative relationships with teachers because teachers had little planning time or after school time to prepare or participate in professional development activities. (Ojai Festivals, Ltd.)
- ❖ Artists working with multiple teachers reported teachers were generally supportive of the artist-taught lessons, and more than half the teachers provided artists with professional and confidential feedback. (Cal Poly, San Luis Obispo)
- ❖ One grantee noted that during the first year, teachers and artists struggled to collaborate. They were unfamiliar with each other's backgrounds and styles. During the second year, after much relationship building, teachers and artists developed strong and supportive collaborative relationships. (Museum of Children's Art)

The last finding brings up an important point - teachers and artists need time to build a collaborative relationship and learn to work together. During the second year of the Demonstration Project, many grantees continued working with the same cohort of teachers, potentially having a greater impact on the level and quality of collaboration. For example, one grantee working with new and returning teachers found returning teachers were able to accomplish more and extend the art integration into additional subjects. Another project coordinator indicated returning teachers were essential in gaining buy-in and participation from new teachers. These findings demonstrate not only the positive impact projects had on improving teacher-artist collaboration, but also the benefits gained from multiyear projects.

Overall, statewide and individual project findings suggest projects increased teacher-artist collaboration. Time to meet and plan within busy schedules appeared to be the greatest difficulty encountered by the teachers and artists.

Increased Confidence, Knowledge and Skills for Using the Arts in the Classroom

Increased confidence, knowledge and skills for using the arts in the classroom was the most common intended outcome for teachers, identified by 31 grantees. To assess project impact on teachers' confidence, knowledge and skills, WestEd and the Statewide Advisory Committee provided grantees with a teacher survey. The survey asked questions about importance of the arts in the classroom, personal experience teaching the arts, prior training in using the arts, and confidence in personal abilities to teach one or

more art forms. Each question was on a five-point scale with ranges appropriate to the question. The survey also asked teachers to complete a table indicating the number of weeks and week per year each art form was available in the classroom.

Nineteen grantees used the statewide measure to assess teacher confidence, knowledge and skills. Fourteen grantees provided data files to WestEd, but only four could be aggregated due to a lack of pre-post data, or incomplete data sets. Thirteen grantees used local measures either in addition to or instead of the statewide measure. Findings from the statewide measure and individual project findings are presented.

Statewide Findings

Data from four grantees representing 44 teachers were aggregated. Teacher responses on the number of hours per week and weeks per year varied greatly by art form; data for any specific art form were insufficient to conduct statistical analyses. Therefore, only responses to the first four questions could be aggregated. Matched t-tests found statistically significant differences between pre- and post- test data on all four questions (Table 16).

Table 16
Teacher Confidence, Knowledge and Skills for Using the Arts

	Pretest mean	Posttest mean	t-value
Arts are important in the classroom	3.77	4.25	3.41*
My personal experiences teaching the arts	2.84	3.30	3.56*
When I last participated in arts training	3.44	2.49	3.55*
Confident in ability to teach art	2.86	3.26	2.96*

*p < .01

The scale is from 1 to 5

Individual Project Findings

The following section contains specific grantee findings and comments regarding teacher confidence, knowledge and skills for using the arts in the classroom.

- ❖ The percentage of teachers confident in their ability to teach poetry to students increased from 53 percent to 100 percent after working with and learning directly from poets. (California Poets in the Schools)
- ❖ Teachers participating in an Arts in Education Demonstration Project reported significantly higher confidence, knowledge and skills for using the arts than a comparison group ($p < .05$). (Merced County Arts Council)
- ❖ Focus groups revealed increased confidence in teachers' abilities to teach and apply the arts in different ways. Additionally, artists reported improved teacher confidence in teaching art and increased integration of the arts into lesson plans. (Arts for the Schools)
- ❖ After participating in a literacy though dramatic arts project, teachers could list specific skills acquired through the project, and teachers were very confident in their ability to teach literacy though the arts (mean of 4.83 on a 5-point scale). (Brava! For Women in the Arts)
- ❖ Several projects that did not report statistically significant increases in confidence, knowledge and skills indicated pretest means were already very high (means in the 4's on a 5-point scale), leaving little room for improvement. (Arts Council of Napa Valley, Brava! For Women in the Arts, California Institute of the Arts (CalArts), City of Glendale Arts and Culture Commission, Cultural Odyssey, Museum of Children's Art)
- ❖ Survey data revealed no significant differences for one project. During focus groups, teachers reported not understanding the project was meant to impact them as well as their students. Many teachers were able to identify skills and knowledge learned through the project that was not expressed through the teacher survey. (Gualala Arts, Inc.)

Statewide and individual project findings demonstrate arts in education projects can impact teachers' confidence, knowledge and skills for using the arts in the classroom. Teachers were able identify specific skills learned through project participation. By successfully increasing teachers' confidence, knowledge and skills for using the arts,

grantees also increased the possibility that teachers will continue to use the arts in their classrooms, thus exposing many new children to art experiences they may not otherwise receive.

Increased Integration of VAPA and other Core Content Standards

One common intended outcome for teachers identified by the CAC, WestEd, and the Statewide Advisory Committee was increased integration of the VAPA Standards into the teaching of other core content standards. The goal was to develop teacher competency in teaching content standards (including language arts, mathematics, science and/or social studies/history) through the arts. Rather than teaching each subject separately, teachers would be able to integrate content from multiple subjects, such as addressing both drama and language arts standards, or social studies and visual arts standards.

To assess project impact on teachers' integration of the arts and other core subjects, WestEd and the Statewide Advisory Committee provided grantees with a teacher survey. The survey asked questions about interest in using the arts, use of the arts as a tool to enhance teaching, and comfort integrating the arts into other curricula. Each question was on a five-point scale ranging from not at all to extremely. The survey also included a chart for teachers to indicate which art forms were integrated with which subject areas, if any integration occurred. Findings from the statewide measure and individual project findings are presented.

Statewide Findings

Twenty-nine grantees indicated increased integration of the arts with other core subjects as an intended outcome. Twenty-one grantees provided their data files to WestEd; however data from only six grantees representing approximately 50 teachers could be aggregated due to limited pre-post data or incomplete data. Additionally, no data from the chart about integration of specific art forms with each subject area could be aggregated; each teacher had different patterns of integration making aggregated analyses impossible. Changes between pre- and post- test were not statistically significant (Table 17).

Table 17***Teacher Integration of VAPA and other Core Content Standards***

	Pretest mean	Posttest mean	t-value
Interest in learning to use the arts	4.42	4.56	1.36
How often do you use the arts as a teaching tool	3.55	3.88	.25
Comfortable integrating the arts	3.55	3.54	-.08

*p < .05

The scale is from 1 to 5

The pretest means indicate the teachers began the project with higher than average levels of interest, use, and comfort. This could be expected, especially among projects in which teachers volunteered to participate. It is possible the lack of change between pre- and post- test resulted from a ceiling effect with the teachers already high on the scale, the instrument not sensitive enough to measure change, or projects not affecting teachers integration of the arts with other core subjects. Additional research should be conducted to explore these possibilities.

Individual Project Findings

Although the statewide evaluation did not find significant changes in teachers' integration of the VAPA Standards with other core content standards, some individual projects had notable findings.

- ❖ More than half (57%) the teachers working with art specialists reported strong or above average ability in integrating the arts, compared to only 29 percent of teachers not working with artists. (Plumas County Art Commission)
- ❖ Teacher surveys revealed statistically significant increases in their ability to use the VAPA Standards and integrate art into the curriculum. Three quarters (75%) of teachers reported the project adequately prepared them to integrate art across the curriculum. (Young Audiences of San Jose and Silicon Valley)
- ❖ A project designed to integrate music with social studies found teachers highly valued the project as a way to teach the social studies content, and teachers now integrated music with more subject areas than any other art form. (American Composers Forum - Los Angeles Chapter)

- ❖ Teachers from one school reported that because of the schoolwide emphasis on mathematics and language arts, they are not required to include arts instruction or keep a copy of the VAPA Standards to assist with lesson planning. (Armory Center for the Arts)
- ❖ Teachers from a project school were significantly more likely to use the arts to teach other core subject areas than a comparison group of teachers from a non-participating school. (Merced County Arts Council)
- ❖ One project using a post-retrospective-pre survey found significant increases in teachers' comfort for integrating the arts with other core content areas ($p < .01$). (Cal Poly, San Luis Obispo)
- ❖ A teacher working with an artist-in-residency stated, "I have grown tremendously in my knowledge and use of the arts in teaching and learning. The partnership with the visual artists has been invaluable to myself and my students." (Museum of Children's Art)
- ❖ Artists indicated they intentionally developed lessons that integrated the arts with other core content areas. Teachers included that without integrated lessons their students would not receive arts education. (Arts for the Schools)

Despite the lack of significant findings from the statewide data, many individual projects demonstrated an impact on teachers' integration of the VAPA Standards with other core content standards.

Continued Use of Project-Developed Lesson Plans Using the Arts

Twenty-two grantees hoped to leave teachers with arts-integrated lesson plans that teachers would continue to use even after the project ended. The statewide measure asked teachers to indicate whether or not they planned to use the project-developed lesson plans in the future, and why or why not.

Statewide Findings

Fifteen grantees provided usable data representing 151 teachers; the majority of whom (86%) indicated they would continue to use the lesson plans. Some reasons teachers listed for continuing to use the project-developed lesson plans included: students responded positively to lessons, lessons were easy to use and implement, lessons

enhanced the curriculum, and students were more engaged and interested when lessons included art. Other teachers reported they found the art strategies useful for teaching, classroom management, and student assessment. Teachers also indicated they applied the strategies and concepts from the project-developed lessons to other subject areas and built upon the lesson plans to further develop students' learning. Some teachers also reported sharing the project-developed lesson plans with other teachers and volunteering to teach arts lessons in other classrooms. The primary reasons cited for not continuing to use the lesson plans included lack of supplies, lack of time, teachers retiring or changing grade levels, and teachers not feeling qualified or comfortable teaching the lessons.

Individual Project Findings

Focus groups and interviews conducted and surveys administered by local evaluators also found teachers responding positively to the project-developed lesson plans. In one case, the project-developed lesson plans will be distributed to all teachers and the principal will require teachers to teach at least one of the lessons. Teachers from another project indicated the lesson plans provided a toolbox of ready-made teaching techniques. One teacher indicated continued use of the lesson plans because "the artist designed lessons that were easy both for the kids to understand and for me to teach without her." By sharing useful strategies and lesson plans with teachers, grantees provided many future students opportunities to receive arts instruction beyond the life of the project.

Other Intended Outcomes for Teachers

Some grantees selected and measured intended outcomes for teachers beyond those identified by the CAC, WestEd, and the Statewide Advisory Committee. In these cases, the grantee and/or local evaluator located an appropriate existing measure, modified an existing measure, or developed a new measure to assess the impact on the intended outcome. Findings specific to intended outcomes of individual projects included:

- ❖ After two years of participating in the project, survey results indicated teachers viewed the arts as equally important as other subjects and now recognized the power of the arts. (Museum of Children's Art)
- ❖ After professional development sessions, 90 percent of teachers reported increased confidence in their ability to develop and use rubrics for grading student art work. (Armory Center for the Arts)

- ❖ Teachers responded positively to the art workshops. All teachers (100%) agreed instructors were helpful, knowledgeable, and well prepared; and 92 percent agreed content and materials were clearly written and comprehensive. (Forestville Union School District)
- ❖ One project found statistically significant increases in teachers' use of technology and the Internet as a resource for planning and teaching art. The number of teachers using web-based resources increased from 23 to 41 percent ($p < .05$), and the percent of teachers prepared to use web-based resources increased from 28 to 60 percent ($p < .01$). (Young Audiences of San Jose and Silicon Valley)

SCHOOL AND DISTRICT RELATED INTENDED OUTCOMES

The CAC, WestEd, and the Statewide Advisory Committee identified two schoolwide intended outcomes: increased support and awareness of the arts within the school, and improved academic performance. However, many projects focused on a specific grade level or group of grade levels rather than the whole school. For example, one project focused on only 2nd grade students while another project worked with 3rd through 6th grade students. Although only a small number of projects worked with entire schools, some findings for these statewide intended outcomes are discussed in this section.

Increased Support and Awareness of Arts within the School

Twelve grantees indicated a schoolwide goal to increase support and awareness of the arts. This included schools purchasing additional art supplies and materials, providing more art classes either during or after school, exposing students to art performances or exhibitions, and schools hiring additional art teachers or art specialists. Grantees were provided the Model Arts Program (MAP) Toolkit to assess the resources, time, and funding available for a variety of activities across the different art forms.

Nine grantees provided WestEd with MAP Toolkit data. However, no data could be aggregated across sites. Some projects were unable to provide pre and post test data, and because of the various art forms addressed by grantees, insufficient data were available to conduct aggregated analyses. Therefore, only findings from individual projects are highlighted.

- ❖ Teacher survey data showed significant increases for the arts being supported within the school, teachers holding a common vision of the arts, and teachers sharing artistic ideas and materials ($p < .01$). Teachers also reported stronger administrative support for the arts ($p < .05$). (Young Audiences of San Jose and Silicon Valley)
- ❖ A project focused on the performing arts found 94 percent of principals reporting their schools offer performing arts-related assemblies and field trips, 82 percent reported parents financially support performing arts activities, and 75 percent reported professional development opportunities in the performing arts were available to teachers. (University of California, Davis)

- ❖ CAC funding allowed one project to double the money available to participating middle schools to purchase supplies and instructional time. These resources facilitated more focused arts instruction and integration of the arts into other subject areas. (Performing Arts Center of Los Angeles County: Music Center Education Division)

Although these findings indicate an impact on schoolwide support for the arts, additional research is needed because many projects focused on one or two grade levels rather than a whole school approach.

Improved Academic Performance

Seven grantees indicated the goal of schoolwide improved academic performance. For the statewide evaluation, we hoped to collect school Academic Performance Index (API) scores prior to and after implementation of the project. However, schools were yet to receive API scores for the 2002-2003 school year and projects ended prematurely, thus making aggregated data analysis impossible. Therefore, this section focuses on findings from individual projects that measured schoolwide academic performance.

- ❖ One multiyear project working with several schools found increases in API scores between 17 and 36 points between 2001 and 2002. Standardized test scores also show students performed at a higher level and showed greater gains than similar schools. (Museum of Children's Art)
- ❖ Two out of three schools showed improved test scores. The third school only received one year of project services compared to two years at the schools showing academic gains. (East Bay Center for the Performing Arts)

As with increased support for the arts within the school, continued evaluation of projects working with the entire school is needed to truly assess the schoolwide impact on academic performance.

PARENT AND COMMUNITY INTENDED OUTCOME

Increased Support and Awareness of Arts within the School

Seventeen grantees indicated increased parent and community support and awareness of the arts within the school as an intended outcome. The goal included increasing awareness of the arts in the classroom, taking students on field trips to performances and exhibitions, building awareness of schoolwide art activities, and inviting parents and community members to watch or teach lessons in the classroom.

WestEd and the Statewide Advisory Committee provided a measure to assess parent and community support and awareness from the teacher perspective. A post-retrospective-pre survey asked teachers to respond to eight questions regarding parents and the community prior to and after implementing the arts in education project. Responses for all questions were on a four-point scale ranging from strongly agree to strongly disagree.

Fifteen grantees used the statewide measure to assess parent and community support and awareness of arts within the schools, and five grantees used local measures either in addition to or instead of the statewide measure. Statewide and individual project findings are presented in this section.

Statewide Findings

WestEd was able to aggregate data from 12 projects representing approximately 165 teachers. Matched t-tests were used to analyze the data. Statistically significant increases were found on all eight questions from the statewide survey. The greatest increases were found in parents understanding the value of exposing their children to the arts and overall parent and community awareness of arts in the schools (Table 18).

Table 18*Parent and Community Support and Awareness of the Arts within Schools*

	Pretest mean	Posttest mean	t-value
Parents are involved in the classroom	2.47	2.61	4.07*
Parents observe art lessons	1.90	2.20	6.09*
Parents understand the value of the arts	2.56	3.03	9.58*
Community artists speak to the students	2.18	2.61	7.26*
Community members teach art lessons	2.04	2.56	7.07*
Students take field trips to arts events	2.25	2.66	5.95*
There is support for arts in the school	2.97	3.39	7.02*
Parents and community are aware of the arts in the school	2.62	3.20	9.29*

*p < .01

The scale is from 1 to 4

Individual Project Findings

Findings from local evaluations included:

- ❖ A survey completed by parents shows a willingness to be much more involved in the classroom, including volunteering to assist with and teach art lessons, donating money for the arts, and chaperoning student field trips to performances or exhibitions. (Armory Center for the Arts)
- ❖ Over half (56%) of the parent surveys indicated more school time should be devoted to the arts, and nearly three-quarters indicated they would attend a schoolwide art day with their children. (Arts Council of Napa Valley)
- ❖ Parent surveys revealed that two-thirds of students talked to their parents about the arts in education project, parents supported the project, and parents noticed improvements in their child's confidence and enthusiasm. (Youth in Arts)

Overall, statewide and individual project findings demonstrate that arts in education projects can increase parent and community support and awareness for the arts. Some projects did not find statistically significant results, which could be a result of either

small sample size or lack of impact. Those projects that reported greater increases often had project components specifically designed to involve parents and the community, such as family art nights, parent orientation meetings, or special student exhibits or performances outside of the school.

Additionally, one project found parents willing to be much more involved than current activity suggested. It is possible that parents and community members are willing and able to assist, but are unaware of when or how to help. Schools and teachers should explore and tap into resources (including time) available through parents and local community members.

Chapter V

Common Themes

COMMON THEMES FOR PROJECT IMPLEMENTATION

Content analysis of grantees' final reports identified several commonalities among projects. Presented in this section are themes that emerged within project implementation, including project accomplishments beyond intended outcomes, successful implementation practices, project challenges, successes and challenges related to project visibility, resources developed, and project sustainability.

Project Accomplishments Beyond Intended Outcomes

Grantees accomplished many goals beyond the intended outcomes identified for students, teachers, artists, and schools. As with the intended outcomes, project accomplishments varied by the goals and objectives for each individual project. Despite individual project differences, common accomplishments included curriculum development, and parent and community participation in the arts.

Grantees reported the development of arts-integrated curriculum units as an accomplishment. Some grantees were pleased that the curriculum units they developed were successfully implemented in the classroom and teachers provided project staff with positive feedback about the ease of use and anticipated continued use of the units in the future. Other grantees were proud of the high-quality curriculum units developed by the teacher-artist teams and hope to publish the documents so other teachers can also expose their students to the arts. Such is the case for one grantee that applied for a grant to publish more than 100 lesson plans developed through the Demonstration Project. Additionally, some grantees viewed the completion of curriculum units as an accomplishment because of struggles and challenges encountered during the development phases.

Another accomplishment many grantees cited was the high level of participation and exposure to the arts by parents and community members. Attendance at student performances and exhibitions exceeded many expectations. One project had 40 people attend the student performance in year one; 400 people attended the performance in year two thanks to the efforts of the project staff to arrange food, transportation for students and their families, and publicity for the performance. The high number of parents who attended a family art night at the school and participated in arts activities with their children pleasantly surprised staff at another project. Several projects also indicated their events sold out, including student performances, performances by professional touring artists, and workshops taught by local artists. Overall, many grantees were proud to cite

successful introduction of the arts to parents and community members as a project accomplishment.

Successful Implementation Practices

Grantees identified a wide range of practices they found essential for successful project implementation. Although implementation practices varied by project and some were listed by only one or two projects, patterns emerged across the sites suggesting the importance of specific elements. This section will discuss implementation practices common across multiple projects including:

- District and school commitment
- Support for teachers and artists
- Planning and communication
- Orientation meetings for relationship building
- Multiyear implementation and evaluation

District and School Commitment

District and school commitment was the most commonly cited essential for successful project implementation. Whether building on existing partnerships or developing new relationships, grantees needed the support and commitment of the district and school administration for successful project implementation.

Most grantees reported that without strong district and school support, their projects would not be as successful or stable. Some projects built upon existing partnerships with districts and schools, while others worked to develop new relationships. For example, one project established a partnership with the district several years ago. From this prior relationship, the arts organization and the district collaborated to apply for the CAC funding and created a new artist-in-residence project at one school with hopes to expand the project into all elementary schools in the district. The project built upon an already existing partnership, rather than establishing new relationships, adding to its success.

Some projects hoped to initiate new partnerships with districts and schools. For example, one project built new relationships with six schools in a rural community. During the first year of the project, the coordinator met with principals regularly and

attended every school board meeting to garner support for the project. The project coordinator indicated these steps were necessary to build district commitment. The project was successfully implemented in all six schools.

In contrast, several grantees cited the lack of district and/or school support as a challenge to implementing the project. Grantees who were not as successful building support for their projects struggled with fully implementing the project. For example, with one project, the state assumed responsibility of the bankrupt district and many new staff members were hired. Other priorities took precedence, and new staff were not committed to the arts in education project, which made project implementation difficult.

Support for Teachers and Artists

Teachers and artists play very important roles in arts education, and grantees found supporting them was essential for project success. Support from the grantees also came in different forms. Some grantees offered professional development workshops while others held weekly or monthly meetings to discuss what was working in the classrooms and what needed improvement. The types of support offered to teachers and artists are presented in this section.

Teacher support came in many different forms. Some projects provided professional development workshops throughout the school year. Several projects teamed teachers and artists or placed artists-in-residence at the schools to provide constant and readily available support to the teachers. Some project coordinators scheduled weekly meetings with teachers to ensure their needs were being met. Other projects provided technical assistance to teachers implementing arts-integrated curricula and arranged for artists to visit classrooms and assist with curriculum units.

Similarly, support for artists was provided through a variety of means. Some projects provided professional development workshops for artists, including such topics as the VAPA Standards, content integration, and the Open Court curriculum. Some grantees also supported artists through regular meetings to allow them to share experiences, discuss accomplishments and challenges, raise concerns or questions about how to best work with teachers and students, and discuss standards and curriculum. These meetings met an important need for artists who specialize in one or two art forms but are sometimes asked by teachers to incorporate an art form out of their area of expertise. For example, if a teacher requested a lesson using puppets, the artist could go to the weekly meeting and get input from the puppeteer about possible lessons and

activities. Support for artists was a critical component for many projects, especially for artists with little to no experience working in classrooms or with state content standards.

Regardless of the method employed to support teachers and artists, grantees indicated proper support was necessary for successful project implementation. Support for teachers and artists provided them with the tools needed to implement the project and the assistance needed to overcome any challenges encountered.

Planning and Communication

Many grantees could not stress enough the importance of proper planning and effective communication. Project planning often took place prior to implementation and outlined the goals, objectives, events, processes, and activities for the project. Communication was necessary throughout the project to keep all parties informed about any changes that occurred or upcoming project activities. Both proper planning and effective communication were important factors for project success.

Proper planning was essential for successful project implementation. The planning process allowed grantees to set clear goals and objectives, link project activities to the goals and objectives, and keep the project moving forward. Many grantees instituted advisory or steering committees to help guide project implementation. For example, one project organized a steering committee that included arts organization staff, district personnel, school principals, teachers, and even parents. The steering committee provided all parties a voice in project implementation and brought additional ideas and perspectives to the planning process.

Effective communication was also needed for project success. One practice grantees identified as successful was scheduling regular meetings to ensure sufficient communication took place. Several projects held monthly artist meetings to discuss strengths and challenges related to the project. Some project coordinators met regularly with both the teachers and artists to ensure they were communicating, and bringing everyone together provided an opportunity to share ideas and help each other with difficult situations. Grantees also recommended open lines of communication beyond face-to-face meetings. One project found that email was the best means of communication, while another project relied on telephone conversations and conference calls. Regardless of the means, grantees agreed communication was necessary for project success.

Orientation Meetings for Relationship Building

Strong relationships are important for the success of any project. Although some of the arts in education projects built on existing relationships, for many grantees it was necessary to develop new relationships. Orientation meetings opened lines of communication between the schools and arts organizations, outlined the goals and objectives for the year, and provided an opportunity to discuss important issues. Several projects also invited the local evaluator to discuss evaluation procedures, data collection requirements, the teacher role in evaluation, and to provide an overview of why evaluation was important to the project. Orientation meetings ensured everyone was knowledgeable about the project and prepared to participate. This was especially important for the teachers and artists who were expected to partner and collaborate on a project. Grantees indicated orientation meetings were a successful way to build new relationships.

Several grantees arranged orientation meetings prior to the start of the school year. These orientation meetings were opportunities for school, district, and project staff to make connections early on and develop strong relationships. For example, one project sponsored an orientation day where artists, teachers, and other school staff met for the first time. The day included performances and displays of artists' work, which built excitement among the teachers and enabled the project to start off on a positive note.

Another project took the orientation meeting a step further and held a week-long summer institute where teachers and artists met, learned more about the project, and participated in professional development activities. Additionally, the artists and teachers were provided time to work together during the week to develop standards-based lesson plans for the upcoming school year. Project staff felt the summer institute initiated team building that continued throughout the school year. Furthermore, one teacher who was unable to attend the entire institute noted that her absence resulted in difficulties working effectively with her partnered artist. Many grantees commented that the orientation meetings were vital to project success.

Multiyear Implementation and Evaluation

Several grantees reported the multiyear approach to implementation and continuous evaluation and feedback were important elements for successful implementation. The multiyear approach allowed grantees to pilot their projects and make modifications to improve both implementation and outcomes. Evaluation, although new to most grantees,

provided data and findings from project participants and other stakeholders to assess the impact of the project. Grantees believed the multiyear approach coupled with evaluation allowed for increased success as the projects progressed.

Grantees reported being in the schools and working with teachers for consecutive years was a benefit to the projects. One project experienced some teacher resistance the first year and project staff and artists spent many hours building trusting relationships with the teachers. The second year of the project soared and much more was accomplished because collaborative partnerships were already in place. The evaluation of another project found significant improvements among students in schools that participated in the project for two years that were not present among students who participated for only one year. Grantees also learned many lessons during the first year of implementation that were addressed during the second year. For example, one project found that its afterschool component was not as effective as in-class instruction; thus the afterschool classes were eliminated and additional hours were allotted for in-class instruction.

Most grantees began the Demonstration Project unfamiliar with evaluation and somewhat resistant to evaluating their projects. After the second year of funding, grantees cited evaluation as important practice for successful project implementation. Grantees reported project evaluation allowed them to see the impact of their work and provided feedback allowing them to refine their projects and have even greater impact. Grantees always believed their work through the arts was powerful and positively affected students. Through evaluation, grantees collected data to document that impact. Several grantees even used their evaluation findings to secure new funding.

Project Challenges

Case studies conducted during the first year of funding found six common challenges grantees encountered: 1) time; 2) space; 3) funding; 4) communication; 5) qualifications of artists; and 6) evaluation. Content analysis of the final reports in year two revealed three of these challenges were addressed and no longer an issue: space, artist qualifications, and evaluation. Time, funding, and communication continued to be a challenge. Additionally, two new challenges were encountered, population changes and scheduling project activities.

Resolved First Year Challenges

Grantees made adjustments to their projects based on challenges encountered and lessons learned during the first year of funding. These changes resulted in three common challenges being resolved, space, artist qualifications, and evaluation. Examples of how each of these was a challenge and how they were resolved are presented in this section.

Space

During the first year of the project, space was a challenge for many grantees. Schools often lacked available storage space for art supplies and office space for resident artists. The lack of space placed additional strain on artists who needed to transport art supplies or modify projects because of insufficient space. Additionally, the lack of office space for resident artists limited the time the artist could remain on campus and be available to assist teachers.

In the first year, many schools participating in CAC funded projects did not have sufficient space available for storing art supplies. Many artists carried their supplies around from classroom to classroom whenever they visited schools. One artist reported needing to purchase a larger car in order to tote supplies around to the various school sites. Some schools worked to overcome this challenge by purchasing additional cabinets and creating “art closets” to house supplies for both the artists and teachers.

One project intended for the artist-in-residence to have an on-campus office to store supplies and to be available for teachers. However, renovation of the school limited the space available, making an on-campus office impossible. The lack of office space also meant a lack of storage space for needed supplies and materials. Some teachers volunteered their cabinet space; however, access was limited during school hours. The artist struggled to transport sufficient supplies around campus and often needed to modify projects to work with the available materials. By the second year of the project, renovation was completed and the principal designated an office and additional storage space to the resident artist.

With increased value and importance of the arts generated by the Demonstration Project, school administrators were more willing to dedicate space to store materials and supplies.

Artist Qualifications

During the first year of the projects, teachers and principals reported difficulty working with artists who had little or no experience with educational systems. Some teachers found their partnered artist was unqualified to work with students because of limited classroom management skills, lack of knowledge about core content standards, and/or lack of knowledge about the various developmental needs of students. Both teachers and artists became frustrated, making collaboration and completion of projects difficult.

For example, teachers from one project reported that artists needed more guidance and direction about expectations when working with schools. The artists were unfamiliar with the developmental stages of the students and set unrealistic goals. Additionally, some artists lacked classroom management skills, leaving the teacher to control discipline rather than co-teach the arts-integrated lesson. Another project found students working with an inexperienced artist were making less progress than those working with more experienced artists. The inexperienced artists lacked the necessary skills to work with the students and move them through the curricula.

Individual projects overcame the challenge of artist qualifications in different ways. In the project where students were not making as much progress, the coordinator intervened and helped the students and the artist develop new skills. Another project addressed artists' inexperience in classrooms through engaging in honest and critical dialogue to help address challenges. Other projects addressed artist qualifications through professional development. Artists attended workshops covering topics such as the VAPA Standards, other core content standards, classroom management, and curriculum development. Some projects avoided the issue by only working with very qualified and experienced artists. In some cases, artists learned from the classroom teacher and by working directly with students. One artist commented that by working with students from kindergarten through sixth grade, she learned about child development and what to expect from children at each grade level. Regardless of the means employed to overcome the challenge, artist qualifications was no longer a problem in the second year of funding.

Evaluation

In the first year of the Demonstration Project, evaluation was a new area for many grantees and most projects spent the first year developing evaluation plans and learning about evaluation practices. Only a handful of grantees hired external evaluators while

most relied on internal evaluators or the project coordinator conducted the evaluation in addition to managing project activities. Some project coordinators expressed frustration with the evaluation process. In some cases, evaluations were incomplete with little useable data or meaningful findings.

Many grantees were unable to collect adequate data, draw meaningful conclusions, or attribute change to the project. Several grantees were unable to collect pre-treatment data for a variety of reasons, including vague objectives and lack of appropriate measurement tools. Others were unfamiliar with how to analyze the data and draw conclusions. Grantees also found conducting an evaluation consumed much of their time and took away from managing the project. The unfamiliarity with evaluation and multiple roles of the project coordinator resulted in difficulty detecting the change or impact of many projects.

To overcome the challenge of evaluation in the second year of the Demonstration Project, each grantee was required to hire a local project evaluator. This removed the strain from many project coordinators who were overwhelmed attempting to both coordinate and evaluate the project. Local evaluators helped grantees clearly define their goals and establish measurable objectives. Further, WestEd and the Statewide Advisory Committee provided a set of measures to assess impact across the statewide intended outcomes, and WestEd provided technical assistance to help grantees and local evaluators identify additional measures needed for their projects. These changes helped resolve the challenge of evaluation, and helped many grantees clearly define their project and measure its impact.

Continued Challenges

Three challenges were cited both years of the Demonstration Project: time, funding, and communication. Although some projects resolved these challenges by the second year, others encountered them for the first time. Examples of each challenge and how grantees are attempting to overcome them are presented in this section.

Time

Time was a challenge for many projects. For some projects, the difficulty was finding sufficient time for teachers and artists to meet and plan lessons. For other projects, curriculum units required more time than allocated and lessons were rushed or incomplete. Additionally, many teachers felt pressured to prepare students for state

testing and believed the arts project took away valuable classroom time. Although the specifics varied, time was a continuing challenge encountered by many grantees.

Finding enough time for artists and teachers to meet and plan lessons was a challenge for many projects. Teachers and artists lacked adequate time in their schedules to plan lessons and debrief about how the lessons were carried out, including discussions of what worked well and what should be changed. For example, artists involved with one project did not feel there was enough “closure” to their lessons. They wanted to return to the classroom and make deeper connections between the art and core content. Several grantees made changes to help resolve this issue. Some grantees worked with the school and district to allocate professional development days to the project. Other grantees found it necessary to pay artists and teachers for planning and collaboration hours.

Some projects underestimated the amount of time needed to teach the curriculum units to students. For example, in the first year of the project teachers were unable to cover all the material in the time allotted, i.e., what was intended to take one semester actually took the full school year. Since it was a pilot program, staff were uncertain how long it would take to implement the curricula. The difficulty completing the curricula in the allotted time led to modifications of the curriculum units for year two and influenced the development of new curricula.

Related to time was the belief that participating in art activities removed valuable time from preparing students for standardized testing. Teachers felt pressured to cover the content students are tested on, leaving little time for art and creativity. Some teachers were reluctant to participate in the project because of the focus on testing. Additionally, some schools were implementing new curriculum to better prepare their students for the tests. Teachers reported they needed time to learn the new curriculum and could not participate in project activities. For example, one school implemented the Open Court literacy curriculum and teachers were overwhelmed with learning how to teach it. To overcome this challenge, arts organization staff participated in the Open Court training sessions, and artists worked with teachers to integrate the arts into the curriculum so they complemented each other rather than competed for instructional time. Project coordinators and artists worked to show teachers the arts could enhance student learning; however, balancing art and other academics remains a challenge for many projects.

Funding

Funding was a challenge for grantees in year one, and more so in year two. State budget cuts reduced the amount of funding projects received in year two, and eliminated funding for year three. During the first year, funding challenges primarily related to limited art supplies or inability to compensate teachers and artists for professional development time. For year two, the budget cuts also resulted in many projects reducing their services or eliminating some project components.

Funding limitations challenged many grantees to find creative and resourceful ways to get the most from the funding they received. For example, one project did not have enough funding for artists to buy necessary supplies, resulting in the creative use of what was available, such as making props using cardboard and costumes using streamers. Another project functioned in a low-economic district that lacked funding for art supplies; however, artists and staff managed by developing effective art lessons using available materials such as paper and pencils.

In addition to funds for supplies, many projects lacked funds to compensate teachers and artists for their time outside the classroom. Some artists reported that if they were paid for planning time, they could have planned better lessons. In some cases, teachers were reluctant to attend professional development activities because they were not compensated for their time. To resolve this issue, one school district agreed to compensate teachers for their time spent in professional development workshops related to the CAC project.

In year two, several grantees encountered a lack of adequate funding to fully implement their projects as planned. For example, one grantee needed to reduce the number of classrooms participating in the project and another reduced the number of professional development activities for teachers. One project serving a large rural community reduced the number of multicultural performances from four in the first year to only one in the second year. Without CAC funding for the third year, additional projects are expected to reduce services and/or eliminate project activities. (Some projects were able to use evaluation findings to secure new funding to continue services or expand into new areas).

Communication

Communication, or lack thereof, was one of the most common problems encountered by projects in year one. In year two, some projects were able to find effective means of communication as indicated in successful implementation practices, while others continued to struggle in this area. Communication was essential to keep all parties informed about any changes that occurred or upcoming project activities, yet communication difficulties existed between artists and teachers, teachers and administrators, school/district staff and project staff, and at times, within districts. Lack of communication resulted in confusion about roles and responsibilities, unclear expectations, and unfulfilled goals and objectives.

Communication problems between teachers and artists were a common challenge. Teachers and artists sometimes misunderstood or were unclear about the others' role in the classroom, possibly related to a lack of time available to plan lessons. In one project, friction existed between a teacher and artist because students were not prepared when the artist came to the classroom; the artist had to introduce core content, which was the teachers' role in preparing students before the artist arrived. Additionally, confusion about roles and responsibilities led to delays in implementation and reduced project activities.

Intra-district communication difficulties was something project staff members felt they had little control over, yet it greatly affected their work. For example, one project worked with a school district integrating art with the Open Court literacy curriculum. After the project began, the district decided it belonged in a different department since it was being integrated with Open Court. The lack of communication and cooperation between the two district departments complicated project implementation and limited what the project was able to accomplish.

Project coordinators reported a variety of efforts employed to improve communication. Several project coordinators believed holding an orientation meeting was useful to outline expectations and open lines of communication. Some coordinators found it necessary to schedule monthly meetings with artists and teachers to facilitate discussions. Coordinators also tried multiple methods of communicating; one found email to be most effective while another reported phone calls worked best. Adequate communication was a challenge, and grantees needed to identify the means of communication best suited for their participants.

New Challenges

Content analysis of final reports identified two new challenges grantees encountered, population changes and scheduling project activities. This section discusses these challenges and grantees' attempts to overcome them.

Population Changes

Many grantees embraced the multiyear approach as an opportunity to provide services to teachers and students for an extended period of time and increase project impact. However, changes in project populations limited the potential impacts of two years of project participation compared to only one year of participation.

Population changes were experienced both at the arts organization and school levels. Several grantees experienced difficulties because of the natural attrition of project staff, artists, and teachers. Some projects hired new coordinators who needed to learn about the project and its goals before they could move the project forward; in some cases this delayed project implementation in the second year. Some projects lost talented artists and needed to hire and train new artists. Similarly, teacher turnover required project coordinators to introduce the new teachers to the project, gain their support and participation, and provide professional development that other teachers received during the first year. The loss of any one teacher or artist resulted in time spent building new relationships and collaborative partnerships.

In addition to staff turnover, some projects experience unexpected changes in the student population. Projects intended to use the multiyear approach to develop sequential art experiences that built on the previous year. Unexpected changes among the student population made building on prior years difficult. For example, one district redrew their school lines and between one half and three-quarters of the students changed schools. The high number of new students created a challenge for artists who planned to build on the previous year's skills.

Scheduling Project Activities

Scheduling, organizing, and planning project activities was as a common challenge encountered by grantees. Dates and times for project activities often needed to be changed or cancelled because of other district and school priorities. Additionally, artists reported difficulty working around teachers' already busy schedules. Project

coordinators cited a need to be very organized and flexible to successfully implement project activities.

Project coordinators reported scheduling professional development and other project activities was difficult because of changing schedules and other district and personal priorities. For example, one project scheduled a year-end meeting to complete evaluation forms and discuss the project. Unfortunately, at the last minute the district called a meeting to discuss testing, and the year-end project meeting could not be rescheduled. Project staff were disappointed about the loss of valuable information. Another project coordinator reported being unable to make a presentation to the school board because of other district priorities.

Artists and project coordinators also found they needed to be very flexible in working with classroom teachers. For example, one artist scheduled training sessions after school, before school, and on the weekends. Many other artists who partnered with teachers to complete projects or develop curricula were willing to work with the teachers to arrange times they could both meet.

Resources Developed

The majority of grantees hoped to develop some arts-related resources as part of the project. While specific resources varied greatly, the most common were curriculum units that integrated the arts with other core content standards. Other resources developed by the projects included guidebooks and compilations of student work.

Nearly half of all grantees developed curricula teachers could continue to use beyond the Demonstration Project. Many projects either used art specialists or artist-teacher teams to develop lesson plans that could easily be replicated in other classrooms. Further, many of these projects hope to publish the curriculum units, including one project that created more than 100 different arts-integrated lesson plans. Additionally, at least three grantees have placed the curriculum units on the Internet for public distribution, and more intend to do so if funding permits.

In addition to curriculum development, some projects developed guidebooks and resource directories. For example, some grantees developed guidebooks or training manuals that provided teachers with the necessary information to teach an art form, including terminology and techniques. Further, several grantees produced a directory listing all local artists willing to work in the classroom and help teachers create arts-integrated lessons. Teachers can access the directory and identify an artist with expertise

in a specific art form. Similarly, some grantees developed a directory of touring artists who can perform at the school site.

Several grantees also produced compilations of student artwork. For example, one project published a book of student poetry. Another project created compact discs of student music and sold the discs at local events to raise money for the project. Additionally, artwork from many projects was displayed at local venues and several projects produced permanent school displays such as murals.

Project Visibility

Project visibility was a core component of the Demonstration Project. Grantees were required to develop visibility plans and participate in an Arts Marketing Institute sponsored by the CAC. Grantees tackled the task to visibility with methods most appropriate to their target population, such as articles in newspapers, radio and television spots, promotional videos, and presentations at conferences. The methods grantees used to gain project visibility and challenges related to visibility are discussed in this section.

Visibility Methods

Grantees most commonly published materials to gain visibility. More than one-quarter of the grantees contacted local newspapers to publish articles describing the project and several newspapers ran articles with full color pictures. Similarly, some art organizations published articles in their newsletters and brochures describing project activities and advertising student performances and exhibitions. One arts organization dedicated a page in every playbill of its professional performances to discuss its participation in the Arts in Education Demonstration Project.

Several grantees worked with media beyond newspapers and other printed materials to publicize their projects. Some grantees worked with public access and cable television stations to air segments about the Demonstration Project and their local project. Grantees also reported creating promotional videos documenting project activities and distributing the videos to various agencies and organizations across the state, and in some cases across the nation. Some grantees also worked with local radio stations to broadcast information about the projects. Project coordinators were interviewed for talk radio shows, and an artist from one project was interviewed about a compilation CD of student music that was produced and sold to raise money to support the arts. Additionally, many

grantees designed web pages describing their project and the arts activities students experienced.

Another common method of project visibility was through an array of presentations. Many project coordinators made presentations to local school boards and at community events to increase awareness of the Demonstration Project. One project presentation included building a mini museum in the school board room. Students stood by their artwork and others performed as board members, parents, and community members toured the exhibit and spoke with students about their art experiences and the project. Some grantees presented their projects and evaluation findings at state and national conferences, and staff from one project presented their work at a conference in Canada. These conference presentations exposed the Demonstration Project to many audiences, including administrators, teachers, district superintendents, and government officials.

Visibility Challenges

Despite the success many grantees experienced with their visibility plans, some common challenges were encountered. This section presents such challenges related to project visibility and discusses ways grantees overcame or attempted to overcome these obstacles.

The challenge cited most often was the lack of time and funding necessary to implement a thorough visibility plan. Project coordinators found designing and implementing a visibility plan time consuming and said it took away from managing project activities. For example, working with the media was a new venture for many grantees and project staff spent hours learning how to navigate through the publication process because they were unfamiliar with it and submission deadlines associated with publishing articles. To overcome this challenge, some grantees hired promotional liaisons to design and implement the visibility plan, which allowed coordinators to focus on project activities.

Another obstacle encountered by several grantees was an overall lack of interest by the media. Grantees struggled to show the importance of the arts to members of the press, and in some cases reporters and journalists simply would not respond to the grantees. In one instance, newspaper staff only wanted to publish evaluation findings with supporting data, which would not be available until the end of the year and thus limited press coverage during the year. Project staff worked to demonstrate the importance of the arts to the media through constant communication and inviting journalists to project events to see the power of the arts first hand.

Grantees working in rural communities experienced some challenges those in urban and suburban settings did not face. For example, in some rural communities no local newspapers or radio stations existed. Project staff became creative and focused on local visibility by attending community events and working with local businesses to display student artwork and flyers advertising project activities.

Overall, grantees were able to overcome many challenges faced in gaining project visibility and learned from their experiences to better plan future visibility activities. Additionally, grantees stated they would continually search for alternative methods to gain project visibility and share their success with parents, community members, government officials, and other policy makers.

Project Sustainability

As previously discussed, the Demonstration Project was intended to be a three-year venture but was reduced to two years because of state budget cuts. Although grantees will no longer be funded by the CAC, 52 out of 55 grantees are taking steps to secure new funds to continue the projects (the other 3 grantees are ending their projects). To sustain their projects, grantees are using a variety of methods to gain new funds and continue implementation.

The most common approach cited for gaining new funding was submitting proposals to federal agencies or private foundations. More than half the grantees are requesting funds from federal agencies or private foundations. A few had already secured new funding at the time of this report and were finalizing implementation plans for the 2003-2004 school year.

In addition to seeking funds from federal agencies and foundations, approximately 30 percent of CAC grantees are writing proposals to local community businesses and agencies, conducting community fundraising, or receiving funds from the district. For example, one grantee is writing a block grant to the county government to cover the current cost of the project and an expansion to include an afterschool component. One grantee approached local businesses for both monetary and supply/material donations, and another raised funds by selling compilation CDs of student music and specially made quilts donated by a community group. Additionally, four grantees received funds directly from the school district in order to continue the project. The school boards allocated special or general funds to maintain the projects in their schools.

Ten grantees plan to sustain their projects by modifying implementation. Five grantees reported the need to cut project components in order to continue work within the

available arts organization budget. For example, two grantees are considering reducing the number of schools that can participate. Another project plans to work with only the most committed teachers who are willing to donate some of their time to participate in the professional development activities. Additionally, three grantees reported they will begin to charge schools and districts for their services because of the loss of the state funding. It is uncertain whether the districts will be able to allocate funds for the project services, or if the districts will stop working with the arts organizations. Two additional grantees reported they plan to refine their projects components and will actually expand their services and work with additional schools and classrooms.

Three projects became self-sustaining as the costs were incorporated into the organizational budgets. For example, one project instituted a Masters of Education program at the university. The program will be sustained through the university system and tuition fees paid by those enrolled in the program. Similarly, another college-based project will continue to support the partnerships of art students and local classroom teachers.

Over the two years of the project, thousands of teachers gained arts experiences and hundreds of lesson plans were developed. Whether or not projects will be sustained is unknown. However, grantees are optimistic in their search for new funds to continue and expand their projects.

REFERENCES

- Baker, T. (2002). Reflections on visual arts education studies. In R.J. Deasy (Ed.) *Critical links: Learning in the arts and student academic and social development* (p. 145-150). Washington, DC: Arts Education Partnership.
- Berman, P., Chambliss, D., et al. (2000). *Readiness of low-performing schools for comprehensive reform*. Emeryville, CA: RPP International.
- Bransford, J., & Schwartz, D. (2000). Rethinking transfer. Chapter in *Review of research in education, 24*. Washington, DC: American Education Research Association.
- Bradley, K. K. (2002). Informing and reforming dance education research. In R.J. Deasy (Ed.) *Critical links: Learning in the arts and student academic and social development* (p. 16-18). Washington, DC: Arts Education Partnership.
- Catterall, J. S. (2002). Research on drama and theatre in education. In R.J. Deasy (Ed.) *Critical links: Learning in the arts and student academic and social development* (p. 58-62). Washington, DC: Arts Education Partnership.
- Catterall, J. S., Chapleau, R., & Iwanaga, J. (1999). Involvement in the arts and human development: General involvement and intensive involvement in music and theater arts. In E.B. Fiske (Ed.) *Champions of change: The impact of the arts on learning* (p. 1-18). Washington DC: The Arts Education Partnership and The President's Committee on the Arts and the Humanities.
- Catterall, J. S., & Waldorf, L. (1999). Chicago arts partnerships in education: Summary evaluation. In E.B. Fiske (Ed.), *Champions of change: The impact of the arts on learning* (p. 47-62). Washington DC: The Arts Education Partnership and The President's Committee on the Arts and the Humanities.
- Fiske, E. B. (Ed.) (1999). *Champions of change: The impact of the arts on learning*. Washington DC: The Arts Education Partnership and The President's Committee on the Arts and the Humanities.
- Florida, R. (2002). *The rise of the creative class*. New York, NY: Basic Books.
- Goldberg, M. (2001). *Arts and learning: An integrated approach to teaching and learning in multicultural and multilingual settings*. (2nd ed.). San Marcos, CA: Longman.
- Harvard Project Zero. (2000). The arts and academic improvement: What the evidence shows. Special Issue of *The Journal of Aesthetic Education*, 34(3-4).
- Rideout, B. E., & Laubach, C. M. (1996). EEG correlates of enhanced spatial performance following exposure to music. *Perceptual and Motor Skills*, 82, 427-432.
- Secretary's Commission on Achieving Necessary Skills (SCANS Report). (1991). Washington, DC: US Government Printing Office.

Seidel, S. (1999). "Stand and unfold yourself" a monograph on the Shakespeare & Company research study. In E.B. Fiske (Ed.) *Champions of change: The impact of the arts on learning* (p. 79-90). Washington DC: The Arts Education Partnership and The President's Committee on the Arts and the Humanities.

Shaw, G. L. (1999). *Keeping Mozart in mind*. New York, NY: Academic Press.

Shaw, G. L., & Bodner, M. (1999). Music enhances spatial-temporal reasoning: Towards a neurophysiological basis using EEG. *Clinical Electroencephalography*, 30(4).

Winner, E. (2002). Commentary on Chicago Arts Partnerships in Education: Evaluation summary. In R.J. Deasy (Ed.) *Critical links: Learning in the arts and student academic and social development* (p. 72-73). Washington DC: Arts Education Partnership.

Appendix

Case Study Site Reports

AMERICAN COMPOSERS FORUM

Project Description

The arts organization implemented an interdisciplinary, multicultural music education program in the school district. The project focuses on bringing musicians and music education to local elementary schools. The highly portable materials and curricula allow elementary school teachers to address music education standards through integration with language arts and social studies. The program also includes an English language learner component with materials provided in Spanish to help meet the needs of diverse language populations.

The music program consists of three instructional units and provides teachers with a teacher's guide, lesson plans, musical instruments, and various resources that are mobile and adaptable. The arts organization developed the units for the second grade during the first year of funding and added a third grade component in the second year. The second grade units focus on African American, Asian, and Hispanic music traditions. The third grade units focus on Native Indian, Middle Eastern, and European music traditions. In addition to the materials provided, a composer visits each class nine times over the course of the year, three times per unit. The visits reinforce what students are learning and provide opportunities for composers to mentor teachers and assist with the music lessons. The curriculum is designed to be flexible so teachers can adapt lessons to better meet student needs.

Goals

The overarching goal of the project was to develop a curriculum to present to teachers that would address VAPA Standards in music and creativity while integrating some standards into language arts and social studies. Specifically, the project was designed to impact students' creativity, confidence, music skills, artistic ability, enthusiasm for the arts, and critical thinking skills. For teachers, intended outcomes included increased confidence, knowledge and skills for using the arts, increased awareness and use of the VAPA Standards, and increased integration of the VAPA Standards with other core curriculum.

Alignment with Standards

Both the second and third grade units were developed specifically to address the California Music Standards. Teacher curriculum guides cite the standards met through each unit. Additionally, the curriculum units were designed to infuse core content standards from language arts and social studies for an integrated approach to learning.

Partners

The arts organization partnered with one school district. Three elementary schools participated in the project.

Project History

The project evolved during the second year of CAC funding based on findings from year one. In year one, two variations of the music education program were implemented to determine which was more effective and efficient. The other approach that was implemented brought a composer into the classroom each week to teach the curriculum units rather than having the teacher teach the units. Findings indicated that both variations of the programs had similar impacts. Given the greater ease and feasibility of implementing the teacher-taught music program, the arts organization decided to concentrate efforts on this version and eliminated the composer-taught program.

In addition, the project expanded. In year one the project was only implemented in the second grade. For year two, the arts organization developed new curricula and expanded the project into third grade classrooms. Overall, the basic structure and implementation procedures of the project did not change.

Evaluation

An internal evaluator from the national office of the arts organization and a local external evaluator conducted an evaluation for the project. The evaluation plan used quantitative and qualitative methods, including observations and focus groups, to collect student data on confidence, creativity, artistic ability, enthusiasm for the arts, and critical thinking skills. The evaluators also collected teacher data on confidence, knowledge and skills for using art, awareness and uses of VAPA Standards, and integration of the VAPA Standards with other core content.

Impact

Students

The evaluators examined the impact of one versus two years of exposure to the project. Students who participated in either version of the program in year one were compared to students for whom this was their first year of participation. On a creativity assessment modified for music, third grade students with two years of exposure scored significantly higher than third grade students with one year of exposure. This trend was similar with regard to confidence in the arts; students with two years of project participation scored higher than those with one year, but the difference was not statistically significant. Enthusiasm for the arts also followed this pattern, the difference between first and second year students approached, but did not reach, statistical significance.

Teachers were also asked to report on improvements observed in their students. Data regarding students' artistic ability reflected positive improvements. Teachers reported the units were effective in teaching students music. Further, all teachers indicated that more than half their students learned to connect music to the social studies curriculum and could identify various music instruments and styles. Teacher reports on student creativity were more mixed. Some teachers indicated little change in their students, while other teachers indicated greater improvement. Third grade teachers were more likely to report improvements in student creativity, possibly an effect of the second year of music exposure for some of their students.

Overall, the project coordinator reported students loved the project and looked forward to the music lessons. Students intently participated and were excited about the project. Teachers reported the project had a positive impact on students' critical thinking and creativity across subjects, as well as their ability to learn music.

Teachers

The project intended to impact teachers' confidence, knowledge and skills for using art, awareness and use of VAPA Standards, and integration of art with other core content standards. Upon completion of the project, teachers reported improved confidence in using the project curricula to teach standards-based music. Teachers said the materials were valuable, especially in teaching about the music traditions from different cultures. Teachers also reported an increase in their awareness and confidence in implementing standards-based art lessons in their classrooms.

Teachers indicated a high level of interest and comfort in integrating art with other content areas. When asked what other subjects they integrated with the arts, common responses were reading, writing, and social studies. Music, visual arts, and creative writing/poetry were the most common art forms teachers reported integrating into their curricula. Additionally, five out of six teachers (83%) reported they would continue using the project curricula to integrate music; the sixth teacher indicated it would be dependent on time.

Overall, the project coordinator reported teachers felt positive about the music program and were enthusiastic about participating. Specifically, teachers were enthusiastic about the multicultural aspect of the curriculum and how it could be incorporated into other subjects. Teachers indicated they were satisfied with the project, adding the curricula were engaging, fun, and comprehensive. Teachers commented the materials allowed students and teachers alike to become familiar with the music traditions of other cultures, and one teacher noted the material was useful for teachers with little music background.

Artists

The project was not expected to impact artists.

Schools

The staff did not identify schoolwide outcomes because the project focused only on second and third grade students.

District(s)

The project did not intend to impact the district.

Parents and Community

The project did not intend to impact parents or community members.

Visibility Plan

Many attempts were made to gain project visibility. Original plans included a partnership with other grantees to combine forces and resources to garner multi-project media coverage. Lack of time and commitment from other projects prevented the partnership from moving forward. The arts organization worked with a marketing consultant to write press releases and contact various media sources, but encountered difficulty finding newspapers, television or radio stations interested in covering the project. Persistence from project staff succeeded in getting the local press agency to run an article in their three local newspapers, including a color photo. Additionally, the national arts organization office published several articles about the project in its monthly newsletter distributed across the country.

Successes & Best Practices

The project experienced success in developing the music program. Teachers were able to use the materials effectively and students responded eagerly to the lessons and the composer visits. Teachers found the materials very useful as a tool to teach music and enrich the language arts and social studies curricula. The artists brought a unique facet to the project, as they deepened learning about the arts and culture by “bringing the music alive for the students.” Additionally, teachers expressed a desire to continue using the materials provided by the project.

Working closely with the teachers and building strong relationships was identified as a best practice for project implementation. An orientation meeting was held to introduce teachers to the project and gain their confidence. Teachers received careful explanation about the research goals and their role in developing and testing the materials. Project staff ensured teachers were a part of the project, not just a recipient of goods and services. Staff kept open lines of communication and encouraged teachers to call for any reason. These details were essential for the project’s success.

Challenges & Lessons Learned

The primary challenge encountered related to time. Project funding was received later than hoped for, delaying the development of the third grade curricula. The materials did not reach the teachers until the middle of the school year. Teachers experienced difficulty finding time to incorporate all the components of the year-long curricula into

one semester. The result was condensed units and/or eliminating certain components of the curricula, limiting its potential impact on students.

Project staff learned four things in implementing this project: 1) a strong commitment from and partnership with the school administration is essential; 2) teachers are highly qualified professionals; they are crucial team members and provide valuable input for curriculum development; 3) artists can enrich the education experience significantly; and 4) it is possible for teachers with little music training to effectively communicate basic music concepts to children. Additionally, staff understood the hectic schedules of teachers and artists and the need to develop flexible and adaptable curricula to meet the needs of diverse student populations.

Next Steps

Project staff continue to seek funds to maintain and expand the project. The arts organization is in the process of developing a curriculum program for the fourth grade that will be pilot tested during the upcoming school year. Current materials will be revised and updated based on feedback from participating teachers. The project will also be sustained among the teachers who participated this year. They were able to keep the materials and indicated they will continue to teach the music curriculum to future classes.

ARMORY CENTER FOR THE ARTS

Project Description

The arts organization collaborated with the school district to build upon its existing partnership to teach interdisciplinary curricula to fourth through sixth grade students and introduce arts instruction to kindergarten through third grade students via a full-time artist-in-residency program at the school. In addition to providing art instruction to the students, the artist also provided professional development and technical assistance to support the teachers to integrate art throughout their instruction.

The project began as an expansion of two already successful curricula programs. The first is an eight-week program (three hours per week) for fourth grade students that integrates art into learning about the environment. Students are transported to local canyons for two and a half hour sessions during which the artist works with the students to create art, including drawings, sculptures, and poetry inspired by the environment. The second is a fourteen-week program (one and a half hours per week) for fifth and sixth grade students that integrates the visual arts with language arts and literacy. Both these programs are taught by visiting artists at all elementary schools in the district. However, only one elementary school participated in the CAC funded project and received the artist-in-residency program. One resident artist taught the curricula programs, provided the additional kindergarten through third grade art instruction, and conducted teacher professional development workshops.

In addition to teaching the fourth through sixth grade curriculum units, the artist designed curriculum units for kindergarten through third grade. Kindergartners received one hour of arts instruction for four weeks and first through third grade students received one and a half hours of instruction for six weeks. The artist worked with all students to model art techniques and worked directly with teachers to train them on arts instruction and integrating art into other curricula. Additionally, the artist held professional development workshops for teachers, organized exhibitions of student work, and worked one-on-one with teachers to plan and assist with lessons that integrated the arts into other disciplines.

Goals

The overarching goal for the project was to develop a school culture that values arts education as a core component of instruction. The project objectives were to increase the

artist's capacity to plan and deliver integrated visual arts instruction aligned with standards and increase the teachers' capacity to plan and deliver arts-integrated lessons and assess student art learning. Outcomes for students included improved confidence and increased enthusiasm for the arts. Outcomes for teachers included increased confidence, knowledge and skills for using the arts, increased awareness and teaching to the VAPA Standards with other core content standards, and improved teacher-artist collaboration. Additionally, the project hoped to increase parent and community support and interest in the artistic activities presented by the school.

Alignment with Standards

The VAPA Standards and other core content standards were addressed by the artist and incorporated into classroom lessons. Each curriculum unit addressed multiple standards and identified the specific standards met by the lesson. The lessons also incorporated the Open Court literacy curriculum, except for the fourth grade units that focused on the science standards.

Partners

The project built upon the existing partnership of the arts organization and the school district. The project was designed to develop an effective collaboration between the arts organization and the elementary school. The Parent-Teacher Association (PTA) at the school was also involved and supported the project by donating \$3,000 for supplies and assisting with the Family Art Night. The local education foundation and arts council also became involved, seeking funds to expand the artist-in-residency program into other elementary schools in the district.

Project History

In year one, the project focused on the fourth through sixth grade curricula and an afterschool component. However, because of difficulties with coordination, the afterschool program was eliminated mid-year and the time was dedicated to working with the first through third grade teachers. Kindergarten classes were not included until the second year of the project. Additionally, the number of hours the artist spent in the first through third grade classes and the number of hours of professional development for teachers increased in the second year of the project.

Evaluation

A local evaluator was hired to provide project staff an outside perspective to help define and refine the project goals and create an atmosphere open to growth and suggestions for change. The evaluator also became a part of the project, building the artist's capacity to provide standards-based instruction and conducting a teacher professional development workshop on how to use rubrics to assess art.

Although the project included kindergarten through sixth grade students, the evaluation focused on the impact on fourth through sixth grade students who received more exposure to the arts. Data collected include student surveys, teacher surveys, teacher interviews, an artist interview, review of student work, and a limited number of classroom observations.

Impact

Students

The project focused on providing arts experiences for students to improve confidence and increase enthusiasm for the arts. At the end of the project, students reported high levels of confidence. The majority of third through fifth grade students (80%) were willing to share their artwork with others and believed others enjoyed their artwork, and 85% liked how their artwork looked. Sixth grade students reported lower levels of confidence, (46% and 40% respectively). Further, a review of student artwork revealed sixth graders lacked serious commitment to the art projects, and the resident artist reported attitude and behavior difficulties with these students, which may account for the lower levels of confidence.

Students also reported moderately high levels of enthusiasm for the arts, especially female students. A greater percentage of female students indicated they want more art in school (97% compared to 83% of males), enjoy making art (86% compared to 71%), look forward to art classes (86% compared to 68%), engage in art activities outside of school (78% compared to 55%), and attend artistic performances (60% compared to 36%). Overall, students were enthusiastic about the arts and enjoyed participating in the arts.

Teachers

The true impact on teachers' confidence, knowledge and skills for using the arts in the classroom was difficult to ascertain. For example, only 35 percent of teachers reported

receiving arts instruction within the past two years, but more than half attended an arts assessment workshop and all teachers had the resident artist in their classrooms. This discrepancy may indicate teachers perceived the project as an experience for their students, but not a professional development experience for themselves. Additionally, only 30 percent of teachers reported being confident in teaching at least one art form, yet 65 percent reported being confident in teaching some visual art, such as watercolor or collage. During focus groups, teachers indicated learning about and implementing the new Open Court language arts curriculum left them with little time or energy to focus on arts instruction.

Findings for teacher awareness and teaching to the VAPA Standards with other core content standards were also mixed. Approximately 80 percent of teachers reported interest in using the arts to enhance teaching, and 76 percent reported comfort with integrating the arts in their instruction. However, 84 percent reported moderately low arts integration. During focus groups, teachers again reported the time commitment for the Open Court curriculum limited the time available to incorporate the arts. The resident artist worked to develop lessons that integrated the arts with Open Court, and project staff are optimistic that teachers will integrate more art as they become familiar with the Open Court curriculum.

The project also intended to improve collaboration between teachers and artists. Nearly all (95%) teachers reported they participated in the lesson when the artist was teaching, but only 30 percent reported working on a project with a local artist, indicating teachers may feel the artist-in-residency is part of the school faculty rather than a community artist. Significant increases were found in teachers understanding of the importance of working with an artist, and teachers discussion of VAPA and other core content standards. Overall, it appears the project improved teacher-artist collaboration.

Artists

Only one artist, the artist-in-residency, was involved with the project, limiting conclusions that can be drawn about the impact on the artist. The artist reported the project provided her with opportunities to enhance her teaching abilities, learn classroom management skills from working with teachers, and become more aware of child development stages by working with kindergarten through sixth grade students. Additionally, she is excited about the relationships developed with the teachers, befriending several of them.

Schools

The project provided the school an opportunity to show their support for the arts, but the impact on the school was limited. Recent changes (a new principal, remodeled school, new language arts curriculum, and reduction in the student body) in addition to the arts project impacted the school culture, making the true impact of the project difficult to ascertain. Additionally, teachers did not embrace the project as a professional development opportunity.

District(s)

The school district was very supportive of the project and interested in expanding the artist-in-residency program to other elementary schools. The school district also adopted its own visual and performing arts standards, an adapted version based on the VAPA Standards, as part of its commitment to the arts in education.

Parents and Community

During the second year, the project gained support from parents and the community. The school PTA donated \$3,000 for supplies and had a member on the project steering committee. The Family Art Night was also a success, with more than 300 people in attendance. Teachers also reported the project impacted parent involvement. Specifically, significant increases were found in parental support for the arts, awareness of art activities at the school, classroom involvement, and observations of classroom art lessons. Further, teachers reported increases in community involvement, with more community members teaching art lessons in the classroom, community artists speaking to the students about art, and student field trips to local art agencies.

Parents who attended the family Art Night were asked to complete a survey about art instruction. Nearly all (98%) parents believed visual arts should be taught during the school day. Additionally, half (50%) of all parents reported they would help with Family Art Nights, 33 percent reported they would help raise money for the arts, and 30 percent reported they would help with art instruction in the classroom. Parents support the arts and the arts in education project.

Visibility Plan

The project focused their visibility plan on ensuring all parents were informed about the project and that the community was aware of the artistic presence at the school. Flyers describing the project and invitations to the Family Art Night were sent to all parents. The resident artist made presentations at the Family Art Night, PTA meetings, and school assemblies. Community awareness about the project was created through articles in the art organization publications, a banner at the school, and displays of student artwork at the art organization and the school district office.

Successes & Best Practices

The project experienced success in developing curriculum units that integrated the arts with the Open Court curriculum. The curriculum units and teacher professional development helped provide the school with a comprehensive, sequential visual arts program. Additionally, the resident artist became a valuable asset to the school and its teachers in making the arts a integral part of the school day.

The Family Art Night proved to be both a success and a best practice. Parents learned about the project their children were participating in and also experienced the arts first hand through seven art activities that took place throughout the evening. This generated support, enthusiasm, and knowledge for the project as well as for the arts as a whole.

Challenges & Lessons Learned

Unforeseen circumstances at the school challenged the project. A new principal who needed to be introduced to the project came to the school. The school was being renovated so teachers changed classrooms often and packed many classroom supplies. The district implemented the Open Court literacy curriculum for which teachers spent extra time and effort to familiarize themselves. Additionally, the school boundaries were redrawn, drastically changing the student body and reducing the number of students attending the school. Project staff worked through these changes to keep the project moving forward, including ensuring the resident artist was trained in Open Court to better support the teachers and integrate the arts.

An additional challenge the project faced was teacher participation in professional development workshops. In the first year, the artist scheduled training sessions at different days and times in an attempt to get more teachers to attend, but to little avail. In

year two, teacher training occurred during regularly scheduled, required meetings. This was especially important to the school faculty who already felt overwhelmed incorporating the new Open Court curriculum.

Next Steps

The second year of the project focused on teacher professional development to build capacity to teach arts in the classroom. Curriculum units were developed to provide documentation for implementing projects that integrate the arts with language or science standards. The school district is interested in training other elementary school teachers on the curriculum units to support arts in education throughout the district. Additionally, the arts organization, the school, and the district undertook fundraising efforts to build financial support for the project and expand its impact to other teachers and schools.

The arts organization applied for several grants to raise additional funds to continue the project. Whether or not additional funds are generated, the two original curricula programs will continue next year. The arts organization will provide the fourth grade program to students free of charge, and the school has dedicated funds to support the curriculum program for the fifth and sixth grades.

BRAVA! FOR WOMEN IN THE ARTS

Project Description

One case study project teamed teachers and artists to improve students' literacy skills through theater arts. The project provided students a full year of theater arts instruction collaboratively taught by the teacher-artist team and provided teachers professional development opportunities throughout the school year. Teachers and artists worked together to develop theater arts curricula aligned with the VAPA and language arts standards.

During the school year, students received two hours of theater instruction from the resident artist each week, attended nine performances by the project theater company, and culminated the year with their own performance at the local theater. Teachers received eighty hours of professional development during a five-day summer institute and three in-service days. Artists also met with the teachers forty-five minutes each week to co-create lessons and prepare resources and materials for upcoming lessons.

Goals

The overarching goal of the project was to foster collaboration between teachers and artists in order to create and implement a theatre arts-based literacy program. While the immediate objective was to improve literacy through the use of theater art, the long-range goals were to increase student academic achievement and appreciation for the arts. Through building relationships between teachers and artists, it was intended that teachers would develop skills and knowledge about theatre arts that transferred to their classrooms and artists would improve their abilities to teach literacy. Another objective of the program was to increase parent involvement and investment in student learning. Outcomes the project intended to achieve included improved student literacy and confidence, increased confidence, knowledge and skills for teachers, and improved collaboration between teachers and artists.

Alignment with Standards

The teacher-artist teams worked to develop theater arts-based curriculum that addressed the VAPA and language arts standards. The artists and teachers were trained together on the Standards and worked to address all five strands of the VAPA Standards over the

course of the school year. In addition to addressing the state standards, the project also addressed the English-language development standards developed by the school district.

Partners

The arts organization partnered with five elementary schools in one school district.

Project History

The project design remained similar between the first and second years of funding except for changes in the allocation of time. Artists doubled the time spent in the classroom each week from one to two hours. The number of performances students attended also increased from one in year one to nine in year two. Planning time for artists and teachers to collaborate also was increased. Additionally, in year one a two-week summer institute was held to introduce the project and provide professional development. In year two, the summer institute was reduced to one week, and the remaining professional development time was scheduled throughout the year. This allowed teachers time to experience the project, provide input on additional assistance needed, and then receive professional development in the areas most requested. Additionally, in year two the project hired artistic consultants (e.g., choreographer, musician) to improve the production quality of the student performance.

The project also expanded in the second year. In year one, two elementary schools and a middle school were a part of the project. Due to staff turnover and other issues, the middle school did not participate in the second year. Project staff rushed to identify a new school to participate. Rather than making a quick decision on one school, three elementary schools were added as pilot sites with plans for one school to continue into the third year of funding.

Evaluation

In the first year, the interim director of education at the arts organization also served as an internal evaluator to measure the impact of the project on students and teachers. The second year of funding required projects to hire an external evaluator. The external evaluator improved upon some of the measures already being used and incorporated additional measures to conduct a comprehensive evaluation of the impact of the project on students, teachers, and artists.

Impact

Students

The impacts examined regarding student literacy included reading, writing, oral communication, and performance skills. Within reading, significant improvements were found in student engagement, fluency, and analysis. For writing, significant improvements were found in student fluency, description, and dimension. Oral communication skills also showed significant improvements in expression, responsiveness, and clarity. As expected, the greatest changes were found in performance skills with significant improvements in student movement, voice, narrative, and preparation.

In addition to literacy skills, the project also hoped to improve student confidence. Significant improvements were found in student confidence despite already high pretest scores. The percentage of students self-reporting high levels of confidence ranged from 79 percent to 85 percent. Posttest percentages ranged from 85 percent to 92 percent. Only one area, liking their own performance, showed a slight decrease of 5 percentage points from 90 to 85 percent. One possible explanation is that once students learned more about theater arts, they gained a better perspective for the quality of their performances. Teachers also reported high levels of confidence in their students, indicating the majority of the students were proud of their performances, eager to perform, and confident in their abilities. Overall, the data indicated the project successfully improved students literacy skills and confidence.

Teachers

The impact on teachers was less evident. Survey data about teachers' confidence, knowledge and skills for using the arts in the classroom revealed no significant changes. However, teachers were able to list specific skills they acquired as a result of the project. It is possible the teachers were already confident and comfortable integrating the arts, but learned new skills for integrating theater arts.

In addition to learning specific skills, the project also improved teachers' collaboration with artists. Teachers reported they participated when the artist was in their classroom and collaborated with the artist on the theatrical projects. Teachers also showed improvements in understanding the importance of teachers and artists working

together and in discussing VAPA and other content standards with artists and other teaching professionals.

Anecdotal evidence also suggested that teachers changed their teaching styles because of the observed impact on students, specifically, their literacy skills. Teachers enjoyed being a part of the project and requested to continue the project next year. Additionally, all teachers stated they would continue using the curriculum units developed through the teacher-artist collaboration.

Artists

The primary intended outcome for artists was to increase their collaboration with classroom teachers. This was accomplished through pairing the artist with a teacher for a yearlong partnership. Artists spent two hours in the classroom working with students every week, and an additional hour of planning time with the teacher. Artists reported significant increases in their level of collaboration with teachers, but some believed the teachers could have participated more in the planning of lessons. Overall, the project increased artist collaboration with teachers.

Schools

Schoolwide intended outcomes were not identified as the project focused on third through fifth grade students.

District(s)

The project did not intend to impact the district, but rather individual schools within the district.

Parents and Community

An indirect goal of the project was to increase parent involvement and investment in student learning. This year, 400 people attended the year-end student performance, compared to 40 last year, showing an increase in parent involvement. Teachers also indicated parents were very excited to see their children perform on stage, and some teachers provided anecdotal evidence of individual cases of improved parental involvement.

Visibility Plan

Increased parent and community involvement in the arts and schools was a goal for the project. Project staff designed a web page placed on the arts organization website and created a window display describing the project at the theater. The arts organization included a page about the project in the programs for all of its theater productions and created a promotional video that was disseminated to politicians, community leaders, and school district administrators. Parents and community members were also invited to free and low-cost daytime performances at the theater. Email notices were sent out inviting people to the year-end student performance at the theater; approximately 400 people attended, a huge increase compared to the 40 who attended the previous year's performance.

Despite the accomplishments in visibility, project staff believe much more can be done. This year a new project coordinator was hired and the focus was on project implementation and improvement, both in classroom instruction and professional development. Less time was spent on project visibility than desired, and staff feel they can implement a more extensive visibility plan in the future.

Successes & Best Practices

In its second year, project staff focused on improving the project for better results. Project improvements included: doubling the time artists spent in the classroom from one to two hours, increasing planning time for teachers and artists, improved evaluation measures, professional development provided throughout the year, development of unique and replicable lesson plans, hiring additional consultants to improve the student performance, and increasing the number of theater company performances students attended from one to nine. Staff members believe these improvements strengthened the project and resulted in a greater impact on students and teachers.

Staff identified several components that contributed to the success of the project. The teacher-artist partnerships were an excellent tool for providing job-embedded professional development for teachers that impacted how they taught their students. The model of professional development workshops (one week of intensive training with follow-up workshops throughout the year) built excitement and knowledge from the beginning and continued to support teachers by meeting their needs throughout the year. Bi-monthly meetings with all the teachers and artists provided opportunities for sharing best practices and challenges, building a sense of community and distributing information

to the group. Additionally, staff believed establishing strong relationships with the school administrators and having detailed, advanced planning were extremely important in implementing the project.

Challenges & Lessons Learned

Project staff faced several challenges that jeopardized the success of the project. As one school dropped out of the project, staff rushed to find an appropriate replacement. Rather than working with one new school, three schools were piloted as possible replacement sites. Natural attrition of teachers and artists also posed a challenge as new staff needed time to learn about the project and build a collaborative relationship with their partner. Scheduling professional development proved difficult, but based on lessons learned in the first year and adopting new strategies (e.g., making half the day mandatory and half voluntary), the project was able to achieve 100 percent participation at professional development workshops.

A challenge encountered in the first year became an accomplishment in year two. In year one, only 40 parents attended the student performance held at the theater. Project staff made great efforts to increase attendance. In year two, invitations were sent to parents in English, Spanish, and Chinese. Dinner was provided to students and their families prior to the show and transportation services were made available after the show. Students were transported to and cared for at the theater immediately following school rather than allowing them to return home. This ensured students were at the performance and encouraged parents to attend. These efforts increased the number of people attending from 40 to 400 and parents were very proud to witness their children performing on stage.

Possibly the greatest challenge stemmed from the varied levels of proficiency among the artists. In one case, an artist posed a significant challenge to the success of a class; in another case, the artist posed a challenge to the growth and development of the overall project. In the first instance, the project coordinator was able to step in and work with the artist and the class to finish the school year. With the second artist, the decision was made to remove the artist from the project and bring in a new artist to work with the project. Although project staff were skeptical about replacing the artist because the change meant time lost for the new artist to develop a working relationship with the teacher and students, the result was a tremendous improvement in the students' engagement, literacy, and theater skills.

Next Steps

Project staff and district personnel are working to secure funding for future years. Proposals are being submitted to federal and state agencies, as well as private foundations. A fundraising event is also being planned to support keeping the artists in the schools. If sufficient funding is secured, project staff hope to continue their efforts to improve literacy skills through publishing the developed curriculum units, expanding the project into new schools, and gaining project visibility to show the arts are central to every child's education.

CROCKER ART MUSEUM

Project Description

The arts organization (a museum) partnered with the school district to develop the arts in education project. The project designed and built an arts laboratory in two elementary schools to enhance and support the district's Open Court language arts curriculum for the second through sixth grades. The project offered an alternative framework for infusing arts in education by providing an aesthetically rich and challenging environment (the lab), professional training and mentoring for teachers, curriculum development, and the documentation and dissemination of results.

The art lab is composed of twelve different activity centers representing all four disciplines including activities in dance, karaoke, puppetry, drama, music, technology, and language arts games. Teachers attended professional development workshops to learn about the lab and how to infuse lab activities with instruction, as well as workshops specific to addressing the VAPA Standards. Additionally, three artists (a storyteller, musician, and cartoonist) visited the schools to work directly with the students.

Project staff provided suggestions to teachers about how to incorporate the art lab in instruction, but how the students worked in the lab was left to the teachers. Teachers brought their students to the lab an average of 15 times (45 minutes per session) over a 5-month period. Some teachers allowed students to choose which activity center they wanted to work at while other teachers designated students to a specific station and rotated them through all of the activity centers. The project allowed teachers the flexibility to use the art labs in the manner most appropriate for their individual classes.

Goals

The artistic goal for the project was to integrate instruction and the art labs to enable students to explore art processes, gain experience with art materials, and become aware of artistic concepts. The educational goals of the project were to use the arts as an entry point to improve reading comprehension, vocabulary development, literary response and analyses, and oral communication skills as taught through the Open Court curriculum. The student intended outcomes for the project included improved academic performance, improved attitudes and behavior in school, and increased enthusiasm for the arts. The project also hoped to improve teachers' confidence, knowledge and skills for using arts in instruction.

Alignment with Standards

The art labs were designed with a focus on the VAPA Standards. Activity stations were planned to promote skills in art appreciation, skill-based knowledge of art materials, and an understanding of how art reflects society and culture. The art labs allowed teachers to integrate the VAPA Standards with the language arts standards to improve students' knowledge and abilities in both disciplines.

Partners

The arts organization partnered with the local school district to place art labs at two elementary schools.

Project History

The first year began slowly as a result of staffing turnover at both the district office and the arts organization. As a result, the project lost momentum. After a turbulent beginning and new staff hired to replace those who moved on, the project was able to re-focus its plans and implementation strategies. The arts organization convened a team (consisting of a carpenter/builder, a community and promotion liaison, a curriculum specialist, a construction facilitator, and an external evaluator) to move the project forward. Additionally, the arts organization established a leadership team (consisting of arts organization and district staff), a project team (consisting of arts organization, district staff, and consultants in the fields of construction, evaluation, and community outreach), and an advisory committee (consisting of artists, teachers, art educators, and reading specialists) to guide efforts by defining the project plan and vision. Project staff worked to get the labs completed and curriculum developed through December 2002. Teachers then participated in a two-day professional development workshop that demonstrated ways to enhance curriculum by using the art labs before the labs were opened to students in January 2003.

The project originally intended to incorporate an afterschool component. However, difficulties working with already existing afterschool program structures and administration hindered implementation of the arts project. Teachers at the schools were also resistant to allowing non-trained personnel into the art labs for fear of improper application and use of materials. Therefore, the afterschool component was eliminated from the project plans.

Evaluation

In the first year of the project, no evaluation was possible because the arts labs were being planned and built. The project hired an external evaluator in March 2002 to measure the impact of the project once the labs and training sessions were completed. Quantitative and qualitative data were collected from teachers and students via surveys and interviews.

Impact

Students

Three intended outcomes were identified for students: improved academic performance and literacy, improved attitudes and behavior in school, and increased enthusiasm for the arts. To measure the impact on literacy skills, the evaluator attempted to obtain standardized test scores, grades, and Open Court writing prompt scores; however, these data were unavailable. Interviews with teachers revealed a belief that the art labs were linked to improved academic performance. Teachers noted improvements in overall attitudes toward learning, willingness to read, and specific improvements in vocabulary, fluency, oral communication, and writing. One teacher stated:

I feel art is a powerful way to get students to visualize and understand what they read because they need to be able to form pictures in their heads when they read in order to comprehend or at least make connections.

Teachers also reported improvements in students overall attitudes and behavior. Teachers indicated the art lab taught students respect for the materials and instruments and made students want to come to school on art lab days. Teachers noted students learned to appreciate art and were less afraid to try something new. Student pre-post attitudes and behavior surveys found only slight increases on three out of four scales, confidence, creativity, and relationships, and a slight decrease for engagement; however, student pretest scores were high, leaving little room for measurable improvements.

Data for student enthusiasm for the arts were inconclusive. Some teachers indicated students showed more enthusiasm for the arts after attending the art labs while others indicated their students were always interested in the arts. Some teachers were also very experienced with integrating the arts prior to the arts labs, so students were previously exposed to many arts experiences potentially limiting the impact of the arts labs. Data

from interviews found more students indicating their favorite thing in school was the art lab (32%) than recess (29%). However, students were informed the interviews were about the art lab, which potentially influenced their responses limiting the reliability of the data. In summary, the art labs appear to positively affect students' academic performance, but additional research is needed to interpret the impact on student attitudes, behavior, and enthusiasm.

Teachers

The impact of the project on teachers' confidence, knowledge and skills was mixed. Teachers rated themselves high for understanding the importance of art and above average for their experience and confidence in teaching art. However, teachers indicated the influence of the arts lab was minimal, potentially because some teachers were already very experienced and comfortable using the arts. Furthermore, teacher ratings indicated having an artist come work with the children as having more of an influence on their own confidence than the art lab itself, indicating a possible greater impact of professional development than resources.

Artists

Impact on artists was not an intended outcome for the project.

Schools

The project did not intend to impact the entire school, only the second and third grades. However, some teachers from other grade levels were envious of the teachers who were able to use the labs and were interested in taking their own students to the labs.

District(s)

The project did not intend to impact the district as a whole, but to focus on two schools to develop a model for possible districtwide expansion.

Parents and Community

Parents and community members were not intended to be impacted by the project, but efforts were made to inform them about the art labs.

Visibility Plan

The project visibility plan focused on building awareness and knowledge of the project among 1) professionals in the fields of education, art education, and museum education; 2) community members near the participating schools, and 3) the general public. A community/promotion liaison was hired to garner support for the project from local community members through networking with community and parent associations. Presentations were made at PTA meetings, community gatherings, and school-sponsored events. Additionally, the arts organization sent newsletters to parents, created a project website, developed a promotional video, and distributed project information through their brochure and the district newspaper. Staff also showcased the project through presentations at national and statewide conferences, including the California Art Education Association Conference and the American Association of Museums Annual Meeting.

Although project staff decided to postpone media distribution about the project (such as newspaper and television coverage), word of the project has spread across the state. Personnel from various agencies have requested information about the project, and several have toured the art labs. The project hopes to expand its visibility to other audiences and share evaluation findings to demonstrate the impact of the art labs.

Successes & Best Practices

Although the project's greatest accomplishment may be constructing the art labs, project staff identified three other successes: strong school district-museum partnership, school empowerment, and a new approach to curriculum enhancement. First, the project enabled the arts organization to work closely and build strong relationships with district personnel to advocate for arts education within the district. The partnership between the schools and the museum continues to grow as they collaborate on additional projects designed to enhance art education. Second, the project also was designed to support school empowerment and enhance teachers' sense of control and flexibility. The project provided the schools an opportunity to expand their capacity to address the VAPA and language arts standards and challenged principals and teachers to look at instruction in new ways. Third, the project brought together art and education professionals to develop a new approach to enhance curriculum. Artists and educators weaved their knowledge and skills to create an art-rich, multidisciplinary learning environment and materials that support and enhance the Open Court curriculum.

Staff members also identified best practices that contributed to the success of the project. Personnel at the art organization and the district built a strong, cooperative partnership that was crucial in moving the project forward. Staff also developed relationships with parents and community members through communication and visibility, which planted the seeds for advocacy and support for arts education in the schools. Diverse perspectives from artists, teachers, art educators, and reading specialists were incorporated into the art lab and curriculum units to reach multiple levels and learning styles. Additionally, arts organization staff became proficient in the Open Court language arts curriculum to fully understand its structure and goals in order to appropriately integrate art and enhance the curriculum.

Challenges & Lessons Learned

From the beginning, the project encountered several challenges, primarily related to staff turn over. Both the district office and arts organization experienced changes in staff, requiring time to find new employees, train them, and build new relationships between district and arts organization staff. As a result, construction of the art labs and developing the curriculum units was delayed. However, it positively impacted the project by bringing in people with the expertise, skills, and commitment to move the project forward. Once back on track, the art labs were built, the curriculum units developed, the teachers trained, and the labs opened to students.

Project staff identified several lessons learned through implementing this project. Staff members quickly recognized the importance of setting clear goals with measurable and realistic objectives. Staff found the need to reassess the project's goals and objectives and realized they had set out to do too much, limiting the time and resources to truly focus on implementing and evaluating the project. The importance of proper planning and excellent communication was also stressed. Arts organization staff found it necessary to have an extensive planning period to work out many details, and constant communication with the school district, including the superintendent, principals, teachers, and classified staff.

Next Steps

Building a permanent, physical environment requiring minimal supplies within the school created a sustainable project. The schools and teachers will continue to use the art labs with little additional support from the arts organization. Experienced teachers are able to train new teachers on how to use the art labs.

Staff members are seeking additional funds to support the project. They would like to continue the external evaluation to measure the impact of the art labs. Additionally, they would like to develop arts lab curriculum units for the fourth through sixth grades and build another art lab at a third elementary school. The arts organization is also collaborating with the County Office of Education to write a grant proposal to continue and expand the project into other communities in the county. They have received a three-year federal arts in education grant in partnership with the County Office of Education that will build Arts Labs into some other schools.

CALIFORNIA STATE UNIVERSITY, SACRAMENTO MOSAICS PROJECT

Project Description

A state university introduced the project in conjunction with a new Master of Arts (MA) program, where students receive an MA in Education with an emphasis in Arts in Education. Project participants were K–12 classroom teachers enrolled in the two-year MA program. The first cohort of students for the MA program graduated in June 2002, with new students completing their first year of the program during the 2002-2003 school year.

The university tailored the MA curriculum to provide the classroom teachers exposure and experience in providing arts education to students. As part of the two-year, thirty unit MA program, the classroom teachers learned about the VAPA Standards, were exposed to community artists, completed a final project or “culminating experience,” and received a stipend to facilitate their work. The MA classes covered education philosophy, research, curriculum development, arts education, and elective art courses. The underlying premise of the MA program was for the “arts to be integrated with academic subjects like the fibers of a tightly woven fabric.”

Goals

The primary goal for the project was to develop an exemplary, replicable MA in Arts Education program for K-12 teachers. Graduates from the MA program should be able to deliver experiences in the arts to all students and become teacher-leaders who can integrate the arts into standards-based curriculum. Through the trained teachers, the project hoped to indirectly impact students, improving their confidence, artistic ability, and increasing their enthusiasm for the arts.

Alignment with Standards

The VAPA Standards are a core component of the MA program. Coursework directly addresses the standards, and all culminating experiences must incorporate the standards. Students take classes to learn about the VAPA Standards and how to integrate them with other core content standards.

Partners

The university School of the Arts and College of Education were the primary partners in designing and implementing the MA program. Additional organizations, including many museums, assisted the project by sponsoring workshops, collaborating on conferences and professional development sessions, hosting in-services, and distributing recruitment materials.

Project History

In the first year of the project, the College of Education and the School of the Arts disagreed about which school should offer the courses for the MA program with courses in arts in education. In the end, the program was housed in the School of Education. As the second cohort of students entered the MA program, many issues were resolved and the two schools began collaborating to make the project a success. The coursework offered through the program underwent minor modifications as the two schools finalized the course of study.

Evaluation

In the first year of CAC funding, the project coordinator conducted an internal evaluation of the project. Data were collected through teacher observations, interviews, surveys, and review of journal entries. The evaluation consumed much of the coordinator's time, and an external evaluator was hired for the second year of funding. Additional data collected included teacher surveys, observations of teacher professional development workshops, review of video documentation, and review of teacher portfolios.

Impact

Students

Although the teachers enrolled in the MA program were the project focus, some data were collected about their students. No differences in attitudes and behaviors were found between students of project teachers compared to students of non-project teachers; both groups rated their students as having positive attitudes and behaviors. This was similar for student confidence in the arts, except that students of project teachers were more likely to share their artwork with the class. However, significant differences were found

in teachers reporting of student artistic ability. Project teachers rated their students higher on knowledge of arts-related materials, familiarity with art vocabulary, ability to critique others artwork, and ability to make connections between art and other disciplines. Additionally, project teachers reported greater levels of student enthusiasm for the arts than non-project teachers. Overall, student artistic ability and enthusiasm for the arts was greater for students whose teachers were enrolled in the MA program.

Teachers

Classroom teachers were the core recipients of services and professional development provided by the project. Upon completion of the project, participants receive a MA degree in Education: Curriculum and Instruction with an emphasis on Arts in Education. Teachers acquire skills to integrate the arts in classroom instruction and advocate for the arts in education. Additionally, significant differences were found in awareness and use of VAPA Standards between project and non-project teachers, project teachers were more knowledgeable about the VAPA Standards, more comfortable integrating the VAPA Standards in their instruction, more confident in implementing standards-based art lessons, and more committed to addressing VAPA Standards in their classes.

Artists

The university project was not intended to impact artists as recipients of services or as learners of new knowledge or strategies. Some artists in the community were involved with the project, primarily through individual teachers who hired them to provide workshops to students. In most cases, artists were introduced to the teachers through the project as resources available in the community.

Schools

The two cohorts of MA students represented 55 different K-12 schools. No data were collected to measure the impact at the school level since each school had only one to two teachers participating in the project.

District(s)

The two cohorts of MA students represented 21 school districts across 9 counties. No data were collected to measure the overall impact at the district level. However, teachers

reported that one school district plans to establish a new arts-focused charter school and another district is advocating for more use of the arts. One school district also hired an Arts Coordinator to manage arts activities districtwide.

Parents and Community

No significant differences were found in parent and community involvement between project and non-project teachers. Both groups indicated that while parents and community members were not very involved in the classroom, there was support for the arts in school and a belief that the arts are important in education.

Visibility Plan

The focus of the project's visibility plan was to build awareness for the MA program and the importance of integrating the arts into education. In 2002 and 2003, the university sponsored an Arts Resource Fair for local teachers, administrators, pre-service teachers, and university faculty. Presentations describing the MA program were made at many art and education conferences, including the Conference on Waldorf Education in Public Schools, the Arts in Education Partnership Meetings, and the International Conference on Imagination in Education held in Vancouver, British Columbia. Additionally, the project staff developed a website and created a short promotional movie.

The project was also visible at many schools of teachers enrolled in the MA program. Individual teacher projects solicited and received community support and awareness from local universities, art groups, and television stations. One teacher brought in a renowned Chicano poet to hold a poetry workshop for her students and their families. Another teacher connected with the local baseball organization, and her students were invited to paint tiles that would be permanently placed on the new stadium's pillars. Additionally, teachers displayed student work at their schools, local television stations, and district offices.

The Art Resource Fair and conference presentations resulted in a high level of visibility for the project. School districts are requesting invitations to the 2004 Art Resource Fair, and other universities have contacted project staff to inquire about developing similar MA programs. Project staff believe they successfully implemented a visibility plan that stressed the importance of the arts in education and increased awareness for the MA program.

One difficulty encountered in implementing the visibility plan was finding time and financial support to present at conferences, especially those out of the state. Project staff spent their own time and money to attend many conferences. The project also experienced resistance from those who did not see the arts as important or did not believe the arts should be taught through the College of Education. Sharing the success of the project was the most effective means to overcome these challenges.

Successes & Best Practices

The greatest success of the project was developing a sustainable and replicable MA in Arts in Education program at the university. The program was built into the structure of the university and housed within the College of Education. Additionally, the university is in the process of hiring a tenure-track position for the Arts in Education program. Further, the university requirements for a multi-subject teaching credential now include a course in visual and performing arts. Project staff and classroom teachers enrolled in the program acted as advocates for the arts and demonstrated to others the importance of the arts in education.

Project staff identified several best practices. They believe the model of providing professional development to the teachers was key for the project's success. The project combined classroom instruction by university professors and professional artists, hands-on workshops, seminars, and visits to local museums and art agencies. The project relied on the surrounding resources to help educate the teachers and develop them as leaders for their schools. Sustaining partnerships, building collaboration, using resources, and documenting the impact were all identified as best practices in implementing the project.

Another project success stemmed from the seed money provided to teachers to implement their projects. Teachers used the money creatively and efficiently for classroom supplies or art-related field trips and workshops directly benefiting students and further exposing them to the arts. The seed money nurtured a sense of autonomy among the teachers because they determined how the money would be spent. Project staff are looking for alternative funding sources to continue offering seed money to the teachers.

Challenges & Lessons Learned

The project initially met with much resistance from university faculty. Professors from the School of the Arts were resistant to an arts program being housed in the College of Education. Some were skeptical that the education department could provide adequate training in the visual and performing arts. Project staff overcame this resistance and worked with the School of the Arts to develop a MA program that both parties agreed upon. Project staff identified collaboration between the School of the Arts and the School of Education as a necessary component to sustain the MA program. In addition to gaining the support of the School of the Arts, project staff also gained the support of the university administration. This was extremely important in order to maintain the program as part of the university degree offerings.

Some classroom teachers participating in the project also experienced pressure from their school principals and site administrators to focus on other core content areas rather than the arts. With so much emphasis on increasing student achievement and test scores, specifically in language arts and mathematics, the arts were not viewed a priority. Some teachers who struggled with resistance from their principals opted to leave the MA program altogether.

An initial project challenge resulted from being a new program with little knowledge of university and department requirements. Many difficulties arose because of unknown timelines, deadlines, and processes for submitting thesis proposal applications and enrollment forms. Additionally, many of the Arts in Education theses looked different from traditional theses submitted for other MA programs. Initially, many of the thesis proposals were not accepted because they did not focus on conventional teaching or technical aspects of learning and pedagogy. As the project evolved and project staff learned the university requirements, this became less of a challenge.

Next Steps

The MA with emphasis in Arts in Education was accepted as a graduate program at the university and is supported by the structures of the university system. The core of the program will continue through the tuition paid to the university. Additionally, the project staff are currently involve in writing grants to continue other aspects of the project, such as the teacher stipend.

GUALALA ARTS

Project Description

The arts organization developed and implemented the arts in education project in a large, rural community. The main focus of the project was to increase exposure to the arts through art integration with classroom curricula. To accomplish this goal, the arts organization partnered a local artist with each elementary school teacher (K-8) in the community. Thirty-three teachers from six schools across two counties participated in the project. The teacher-artist teams developed a proposal for an arts-based project, and the school principal and project steering committee approved each proposal. The proposal process and the teacher-artist partnership allowed teachers and artists to collaborate to meet the needs of the students by tailoring each project to the unique personality of the class.

Sixteen artists partnered with the thirty-three teachers to offer an array of expertise. Art forms represented in the project included dance, music, poetry, ceramics, drawing, murals, etching, and cartooning. Artists worked with students for six to twelve weeks depending on the project, spending an average of twenty-nine hours in the classroom. Each teacher-artist partnership developed a curriculum unit using either VAPA or other core content standards. The result was thirty-three separate projects covering a wide range of art forms, talents, media, and content areas.

Additionally, the arts organization hosted a multicultural performance. In year one, four performances were held, but due to budget cuts, only one performance was held in the second year. A banjo-ologist performed at three schools and an evening performance was held for family and community members. In addition to the musical performances, the banjo-ologist provided a study guide for students and incorporated local history into his performance.

Goals

The overarching goals of the project were to create a community partnership of teachers, artists, and parents to 1) make arts fundamental in the schools, and 2) to foster self-esteem and acceptance of diversity through exposure to multicultural performing arts. Specific implementation goals for this year were to gain 100 percent participation from teachers and to expose students to one multicultural performance. Outcomes the project hoped to achieve included improved student confidence, improved collaboration between

teachers and artists, increased teacher confidence, knowledge and skills for using arts in the classroom, and increased parent and community support and awareness of the arts within the schools.

Alignment with Standards

Every teacher-artist team project was required to address standards. The team decided together which standards to address, and while they could choose to address only VAPA Standards, the emphasis was placed on integrating art with other core content standards. In many cases, the teacher was the driving force in deciding which standards to address, and the artist designed a project to address those standards. For example, if a teacher wanted to address a specific set of standards, two to three artists would design a project that met those standards and present their ideas to the teacher who would then decide which project would work best with his or her students. Nearly all projects integrated some VAPA Standards with content standards from language arts, social studies, mathematics, or science.

Partners

The arts organization partnered with six schools, each representing a different school district. All kindergarten through eighth grade teachers from these schools were partnered with a local artist. The arts organization assumed responsibility for matching the teachers and artists, but worked closely with the local artist guild and another arts agency to identify and recruit artists willing to participate in the project.

Project History

Few changes were made between the first and second years of the project. In year one, four multicultural touring groups were contracted to perform and hold participatory workshops across the school sites. The performances included a vocal and percussion group playing music from around the world, folk dances of the immigrants, an African American a'capella group, and a Balinese shadow puppetry show. These shows were also performed at a local high school exposing kindergarten through twelfth grade students to the arts. Due to construction at the high school in year two, no performances could be held there. Further, in year two only one multicultural performance, the banjo-ologist, was feasible because of budget constraints.

Evaluation

In the first year of the project, staff experienced difficulty with evaluating the project and lacked a clear framework for goals and objectives. They hired an external evaluator who assisted in developing a clear framework with more measurable outcomes. The local evaluator continued to work with the project in its second year to develop an evaluation plan that included collecting data from participating students, teachers, and artists.

The evaluation and project staff also experienced difficulty in conducting the evaluation. Distribution and collection of evaluation forms across the large territory the project covered was a challenge. Being spread across two counties, tracking and follow-up on data collection was problematic. Further, some teacher-artist teams were reluctant to complete the forms, misunderstood the directions, or were unclear about the purpose or significance of the evaluation. Additionally, some teacher-artists teams did not complete the instruments in a timely manner resulting in missing or incomplete test data. Despite evaluation difficulties, data were gathered to measure the impact of the project on students, teachers, artists, the schools, the districts, and parents and the community.

In addition to completing surveys, all the teachers and artists were invited to participate in an end-of-year evaluation retreat. The parent-teacher association (PTA) arranged dinner and served the teachers and artists to show appreciation and support for the project. The retreat provided the evaluator an opportunity to collect final survey data, facilitate discussions, and conduct focus groups. The evaluator described the retreat as “illuminating, and it gave me a sense of the project, its issues, and its true power.” The retreat was identified as a best practice for evaluating the project.

Impact

Students

In the rural community served by the project, students are not privileged with many opportunities to experience the arts first hand. Through the arts in education project, students were not just exposed to the arts, but participated in hands-on art activities and worked directly with an artist from the community. Students were also able to experience a variety of artistic media, including painting, tile work, puppetry, dance, music, sculpture, poetry, murals, and calligraphy. Students were exposed to multiple art forms during the two years of the project and attended an exhibit to view other students' art projects. Without the grant from the CAC, many of these students would never be

exposed to different art forms. Through the project, 600 K-8 students experienced the arts this year.

In addition to exposing students to the arts, the project intended to impact student confidence. Although the implementation of the individual projects varied by classroom, some improvement in student confidence was found. For example, on the question “I like for people to see my art work,” the number of students responding affirmatively rose 12 percentage points to 77 percent. Furthermore, the number of students responding affirmatively to “I like the way my art looks” increased by 6 percentage points to 84 percent. Students also indicated they liked participating in the art projects and the projects helped them learn. One student responded, “It helped me understand my writing by drawing the pictures that went with the words.”

Teachers also provided some anecdotal evidence about the impact on their students. Teachers indicated students are more willing to take risks in the arts than other disciplines such as language arts or mathematics. Students who struggled with other content areas shone in the arts and gained the respect of their peers. Further, students learned through the arts that some work requires multiple drafts and not all work must be perfect.

Teachers

Teacher surveys results indicated the project had little impact on teaching practices or teachers’ confidence in using the arts as a tool for teaching. However, during the end-of-year retreat, teachers could easily list specific insights or skills they acquired as a result of the project. Focus group data found that initially teachers did not view the partnerships with the artists as a benefit for themselves. The teachers understood the goals and potential impact of the project for the students, but did not envision the project as a training or professional development opportunity for themselves. Once teachers were informed of the project’s objective to increase their ability to incorporate art, teachers were excited about the potential training and support the project could provide in the future. Next year the arts organization staff plan to hold an orientation and training day to more directly expose the teachers to the arts. Additionally, two-thirds (67%) of teachers indicated they would continue to use the curriculum units developed through the project.

Artists

The artists were very excited to participate in the project and work directly with students. Some artists reported being inspired by the students because “kids art is so simple and it is all feelings and directness.” The artists truly enjoyed working with the students and reported changes in their own artwork based on this experience. Additionally, pre-post surveys found the project significantly increased collaboration between artists and teachers. Artists reported engaging in more discussions about VAPA Standards and having a better understanding of the importance of working with teachers. Most of the artists involved with the project this year hope to continue their participation next year, and other artists are already lining up for their opportunity in the classroom.

Schools

The schools were hit hard by budget cuts, and many were unable to maintain fine arts programs or purchase supplies for art in the classrooms. The schools benefited by being able to provide art education to their students and provide professional development to their teachers by working and learning directly from a community artist. Additionally, some classroom projects involved beautification of the school campus, adding murals or sculptures.

District(s)

All six of the school districts involved were very committed to the project. The school board for each district passed a special resolution indicating their support of the project, and also approved the individual teacher-artist project proposals in their district. Each district also had a representative on the project steering committee.

Parents and Community

An indirect goal of the project was to increase parent and community involvement with the schools. Parents became more involved, with 200 people attending the opening night of the student art exhibit. The nature of the project increased community involvement by placing local artists in the classrooms to work directly with students and teachers. Further, local community groups are working to raise money for arts in the schools, such as a local quilting bee that is donating quilts to be raffled off to benefit the arts. The project not only involved parents and the community, but also opened the discussion

about the role of the arts in education. Further, anecdotal evidence found changes in how the arts community views education and how the education community views the arts, finding value in integrating the arts and education.

Visibility Plan

The community the project served represents a small population, but a geographically large rural community. Thus, the focus of the project's visibility was local newspapers and community outreach. Posters created by the students for a contest were displayed in local retail establishments and articles about the project were published in the local newspapers. Newsletters were sent to parents explaining their children's participation in the project, and in one class the artist sent home a letter to parents. A local radio station hosted a segment to discuss a CD of students' songs created by one classroom project. Copies of the CD and tile art from another class were sold at the county festival with the proceeds benefiting arts in education. Additionally, the arts organization sponsored a student exhibition that showcased displays from 30 classroom projects with 200 people in attendance the opening night of the exhibit. Overall, project staff reported success in visibility, but in the future they hope to reach more people and involve parents earlier in the year.

Successes & Best Practices

Project staff identified several best practices that contributed to the project's success. One best practice was the multiyear nature of the project. The second year allowed artists to return to classrooms and build upon preexisting relationships. Most teachers were already comfortable working with an artist, and the team was able to accomplish more because they could build off the previous year. Returning teachers also played a vital role in getting buy-in from new teachers who were unfamiliar with the project and resistant to having an artist in their classroom.

Another best practice was using mini-grants and a proposal process for the team projects. The proposals gave teachers and artists autonomy to tailor the project to their needs and interests and opened the discussions between the teachers and artists to plan the project and focus their work. Additionally, the school administration, district superintendent, and the project steering committee approved the proposals showing the administration and school district supported the project.

Project staff also noted the importance of a mandatory orientation meeting. The meeting introduced the project to new teachers and artists, set forth guidelines for projects and proposals, and provided teachers and artists an opportunity to meet and begin building relationships. Staff also indicated that future orientation meetings would include the external evaluator to explain the needs of the evaluation at the start and the importance of the research and collecting accurate data.

Challenges & Lessons Learned

The arts organization staff experienced several challenges in implementing the project. One challenge was administering a project that encompassed such a large, rural area, spanning across two counties and several school districts. Organizing thirty-three individual classroom projects and coordinating the multicultural performance proved difficult. Teachers, artists, and project staff traveled many miles to meet and work on the project. Communication was also a challenge because of the distance the project covered. Distributing materials and information, such as evaluation surveys, consumed many hours and resources. Additionally, working with six school districts required knowledge of each district's policies and procedures. The very committed staff worked hard to overcome the challenges presented by the large area span of the project.

The project staff also experienced difficulty in achieving 100 percent participation from teachers. Some teachers new to the schools and the teaching profession did not want to participate, but rather focus on classroom management and teaching practices. Coaxing and pressure from returning teachers convinced them to participate. One teacher had a bad experience working with an artist the previous year and was hesitant to work with another artist. By the end of the year, this teacher saw the impact of the arts on the class and attended a steering committee meeting to express his appreciation for the project.

Another challenge the program faced was in regards to the evaluation. In the first year the project did not possess a clear and workable framework, resulting in unusable data. An external evaluator was hired midyear who helped establish a workable framework and create more appropriate evaluation instruments. The evaluator continued to work with the project in its second year, but still faced some challenges: not all teachers and artists understood the purpose or goals of the evaluation, teachers were reluctant to complete instruments, and tracking and follow-up to collect data was difficult.

Although the project staff faced several challenges, they were able to overcome the challenges and make the project a success. The project staff, teachers, artists, and school and district administrators were all committed to the project. Everyone involved worked hard to make the second year of the project successful and hope the project can continue.

Next Steps

In Fall 2003, the arts organization plans to hold an in-service to expose the teachers to hands-on art experiences. Three artists will hold mini-sessions to introduce teachers to various art forms and how the arts can be integrated into teaching and learning. From the year-end retreat, the staff learned that teachers are often too involved helping students and managing classroom behavior to participate in the arts. The goal of the in-service is to expose the teachers to the same type of hands-on art activities their students' experience through the project.

Project staff continue to look for alternative funding sources to sustain the project, or at least some aspects of the project. Arts organization staff are working with the schools to find funding to support an afterschool arts program to replace the afterschool programs lost due to budget cuts. Project staff are exploring other funding options and will try to continue as much of the project as possible, but were uncertain of the project's future at time of this report.

RIVERSIDE ARTS COUNCIL

Project Description

The county arts organization project was an expansion of another program to include curriculum-based artist residencies and teacher training. Funding from the CAC allowed the program to be implemented districtwide in a school district that had no prior arts specialists or resources. The project provided teachers with professional development workshops on the VAPA Standards and placed resident artists in the classrooms. Artists worked directly with the teachers to develop curriculum units, provide classroom arts instruction, and mentor teachers on integrating the arts into instruction. Additionally, project staff worked to increase community awareness and support for the arts through outreach and parent participation activities.

Artists worked in the classroom for fifteen weeks, offering one hour of direct arts instruction to students each week. The classroom teachers provided an additional hour of arts instruction when the artist was not present for a total of 30 hours of arts instruction. Teachers and artists also received one hour of planning time each week and attended fourteen hours of planning and training workshops.

Goals

The project hoped to address the needs of the school district and the surrounding community by building the capacity for teachers and students to participate in the arts through standards-based art instruction integrated with other core curricula. Specific student outcomes the project hoped to achieve included improved attitudes and behavior in school, a healthier self-concept, improved creativity, and improved artistic ability. The project also wanted to increase teachers' confidence, knowledge, and skills for using the arts, increase teacher awareness and use of the VAPA Standards, and improve teacher-artist collaboration. Similarly, the project hoped to increase artists' awareness and use of the VAPA Standards and improve their collaboration with teachers. Additionally, through visibility and outreach the project wanted to increase family and community awareness, involvement, and support for the arts.

Alignment with Standards

The project focused on alignment with standards. The arts organization partnered with another art agency to provide afterschool workshops to train teachers on the VAPA Standards. Integrating the VAPA Standards with other core content standards was reinforced through specialized training sessions, artist-teacher workshops, and through the artist residencies.

Partners

The county arts organization and local school district were the primary partners involved in the project. Additional partners included the County Office of Education, the community arts collaborative representing several counties, the local community college, and six local artists.

Project History

Few changes were made to the project between the first and second year of CAC funding since this was an expansion of an existing program. Some teachers who participated in both years of the project expanded the focus of arts integration with language arts to include other subjects such as science or mathematics.

Evaluation

In the first year of the project, the evaluation design was based on an early education project evaluation and overseen by an internal evaluator from the County Office of Education. The evaluation design was chosen because it collected the type of data pertinent to showing the impact of the arts in education project: attendance, behavior, and referral data.

An external evaluator was hired to assess the impact of the second year of the project. The evaluator was hired late in the year, limiting pretest data collection. Additionally, the year-end evaluation meeting was canceled due to another priority scheduled at the district office, which limited the posttest data collected. Despite these challenges, some student, teacher, and artist level data were collected.

Impact

Students

Specific student outcomes the project hoped to achieve included improved attitudes and behavior in school, a healthier self-concept, improved creativity, and improved artistic ability. Teacher and artist assessments found significant improvements in students' attitudes and behaviors in school. Data indicated students improved in showing respect for their peers' art, participated more in lessons when art was incorporated, and were more engaged in the lessons when art was used.

Only data were collected on student self-concept. Results found more than half the students rated themselves positively on all aspects of self-concept. The majority of students rated themselves high on feelings of pride (84%), ability to make plans work (82%), having control of their future (68%), and feeling good about themselves (64%). The lowest rated categories related to school and achievement motivation. For example, 56 percent of students indicated they try their best on school activities, 57 percent try their best on homework and 59 percent work hard on tests. Additionally, comments from resident artists support an increase in student self-concept as a result of the project.

The project also impacted student creativity and student artistic abilities. A pre-post measure of creativity found increases on 16 out of 18 items. Items showing the greatest gains were students thinking about the meaning of a piece of artwork, students' ability to create mental pictures when reading stories, and students' enjoyment of writing their own stories. Teachers also reported significant increases in students' artistic abilities. Pre-post comparisons showed the greatest gains for students' ability to identify art elements, familiarity with art vocabulary, and general artistic ability. Overall, the project positively impacted student attitudes and behavior, self-concept, creativity, and artistic ability.

Teachers

The project intended to impact teacher confidence, knowledge, and skills for using the arts, increase teacher awareness and use of the VAPA Standards, and improve teacher-artist collaboration. Upon completion of the project, the majority of teachers (79%) believed the arts were very important in the classroom and 64 percent felt moderately comfortable teaching the arts. Significant gains were made in teacher awareness and use of the VAPA Standards; on all questions the mean increased by more than a full point on a four-point scale, moving teachers from the disagree level to the somewhat agree level.

This was similar for teacher-artist collaboration, with teachers reporting increases in understanding the importance of working with artists and in discussing VAPA and other content standards with artists. Teachers also indicated they participated in lessons the artist taught and had sufficient time to work with the artists. Additionally, teachers indicated they would continue to use the curriculum units developed as a result of the project. Overall, the project positively impacted teachers.

Artists

Intended outcomes for project artists were increased awareness and use of the VAPA Standards, and improved collaboration with teachers. Surveys and focus groups revealed significant use and knowledge of the VAPA Standards. Artists found the standards to be a useful tool for developing lesson plans and art activities. Artists also reported improved planning and collaboration with classroom teachers. However, unlike teachers, they indicated more time was needed to properly plan and implement arts instruction in the classroom.

Schools

The project provided students enrolled in the three schools with arts instruction, which was previously unavailable at the schools. Additionally, teachers were provided with professional development to continue integrating the arts in their instruction for future instruction. The arts are now more valued and supported at the schools as a result of the project.

District(s)

Through the project, the school district was able to provide arts experiences to their students. No previous art resources or art specialists were available through the district. The district supported the project by providing space for trainings and compensating teachers for time spent in training sessions. District personnel were very committed to the project and are now looking to incorporate additional arts experiences for their students.

Parents and Community

Parents and community members became more involved with the arts as a result of the project. Teacher ratings of parent and community support showed significant increases, especially on questions about understanding the value of the arts, awareness of art activities, and support for the arts. Parent surveys also showed a high level of support for the arts and a belief that participating in the arts will positively impact their children. Additionally, the community is now sponsoring arts-related activities, including an afterschool dance class, where no previous art activities were available.

Visibility Plan

The project took place in a very small, rural community that lacks a local newspaper or radio station making project visibility difficult. Project staff focused on direct outreach inviting parents and community members to the schools for Open House, Family Nights, and a Community Health and Arts Fair. Student artwork resulting from the project was displayed at local venues and presentations were made to the School Board, the County Supervisor, and other community organizations. The visibility of the project and its outreach activities showed the community the value of the arts to the schools and their students. Additional arts activities are planned including performances and art exhibitions, as well as an afterschool Ballet Folklorico class.

Successes & Best Practices

The greatest success the project experienced was placing artists and art resources into classrooms and exposing students to the arts in a community with no previously available art experiences. Students were able to experience the arts first hand and teachers were provided with professional development workshops and artist mentors to learn how to incorporate the arts into their instruction. Training teachers to integrate the arts with other subjects, such as language arts or mathematics, also ensured future students would be exposed to the arts after the artist residencies were completed.

Two best practices identified by project staff included working with a supportive district committed to the project, and gaining buy-in from the teachers. The district superintendent was an active participant in planning and implementing the project. Superintendent support played a vital role in getting teacher-buy in. The project and its artists were initially introduced to all school staff during a back-to-school orientation meeting. The orientation meeting helped teachers understand the focus and goals of the

project, and also built enthusiasm among the teachers. In addition to district support and teacher buy-in, project staff found the teacher-artist partnerships essential for creating a sustainable and replicable project for standards-based arts integration with other core content areas.

Challenges & Lessons Learned

Scheduling professional development workshops to maximize attendance rates proved to be a challenge. Twelve afterschool professional development workshops were provided and teachers were asked to assist with curriculum development. Meetings would last up to four hours, with some teachers opting to leave before the session ended. Some teachers' enthusiasm for the project quickly waned, especially for those with little investment in the arts. Project staff recognized the need to provide greater flexibility with professional development activities to increase attendance and teacher engagement. Additionally, project staff believe shared goals and objectives and constant communication with everyone involved is important for project success.

Next Steps

Project staff are exploring options to continue the project in a reduced capacity. Alternative funding sources, such as foundations and local businesses, are being approached to donate funds or supplies to support the project. The project staff hope to use the evaluation results to showcase the project as a model for arts instruction and are exploring the possibility of continuing to work with those teachers and artists who made substantial gains during the two years of the project.

VALLEY CENTER-PAUMA UNIFIED SCHOOL DISTRICT

Project Description

The school district partnered with the arts organization and state university to provide professional development in arts instruction. The project placed artist coaches into classrooms to work directly with teachers to design and implement standards-based, arts-integrated lessons. At the beginning of the school year, the artist taught the lessons and the teacher assisted, but as the year progressed, the teacher gradually took over and the artist assisted. The artist modeling as well as professional development workshops were designed to provide the classroom teachers a level of proficiency in arts instruction that would be sustained long after the artist left the classroom.

The artists worked with students and the classroom teachers one hour each week throughout the school year. The artists also spent an additional half hour each week planning lessons with their partner teacher and led afterschool professional development workshops for all teachers participating in the project. In addition to in-school exposure, students and teachers attended one performance at the arts organization.

Goals

The primary goal of the project was to sustain arts instruction in the classroom by partnering artist coaches with classroom teachers. The partnership was expected to increase teacher awareness and use of the VAPA Standards, increase teaching of the VAPA Standards with other core content standards, and improve teacher collaboration with artists. Similarly, the project intended to increase artist awareness and use of the VAPA Standards and collaboration with teachers. A secondary intended outcome of the project was improved attendance rates for Native American students.

Alignment with Standards

Artists were trained on the VAPA Standards and met with staff from the university weekly. The artists, through professional development and mentoring, passed their knowledge on to the classroom teachers. Together, they developed standards-based lesson plans that integrated the arts with other core content areas, such as language arts and mathematics.

Partners

Four elementary schools in district participated in the project. Each school serves different grade levels, such as kindergarten and first grade students or second and third grade students. One school serves kindergarten through eighth grade students, but only kindergarten through fifth grade students participated in the project. Additional partners included the arts organization, which served as the liaison between the artists and the schools, and the state university, which provided support for the artists through weekly coaching meetings.

Project History

Implementation of the project did not change from the first to second year of funding. Fewer teachers were included in the project because of budget cuts, but the project continued to function as it did in year one.

Evaluation

For the second year of the project, an external evaluator was hired to measure the impact of the project on teachers and artists. The focus of the evaluation was narrowed to gather data on the impact, and new evaluation measures were implemented.

Impact

Students

The primary goals for the project focused on teachers, with the underlying premise that teachers must change how they teach before an impact can be seen in their students. The project identified improved attendance for Native American students as a secondary intended outcome. The number of school days missed for Native American students participating in the project was significantly lower than a comparison group of Native American students not participating in the project. Also, students participating in the project were less likely to be absent on the day the artist was in the classroom (6% absent rate) than any other day of the week (10% absent rate). Additionally, anecdotal evidence suggested that project participation improved students' self-esteem and provided an area for some students to shine when they struggled academically.

Teachers

Intended outcomes for teachers were increased teacher awareness and use of the VAPA Standards, increased teaching of the VAPA Standards with other core content standards, and improved teacher collaboration with artists. Teachers who participated in the project reported significantly higher levels of knowledge of the VAPA Standards than a comparison group of teachers; however, observations could not confirm that teachers were incorporating the standards into instruction. No differences were found between project and non-project teachers for integrating the arts with other core content areas. Both groups indicated high levels of interest and comfort for integrating the arts; however no data were collected to identify differences in quantity or quality of arts integration. Increased collaboration was inherent to the project since teachers were partnered with local artists. However, the degree of the partnership varied. Observations found only 2 out of 11 teachers co-teaching the arts lessons, and 7 out of 11 teachers assisting the artist, such as controlling discipline or helping students. Teachers understood the value of collaboration, but the extent of collaboration was unknown.

Artists

The project intended to increase artist awareness and use of the VAPA Standards and their collaboration with teachers. Survey results and observations found the artists very knowledgeable about and confident in using the VAPA Standards prior to project implementation, leaving little room for improvement. Improvements were found in artist collaboration with teachers, especially in the area of discussing content standards with teachers.

Schools

Teachers within the schools learned new skills and developed arts-integrated curricula they will continue to use. The impact on the school varies by the number of trained teachers at the school, and the sustained impact will depend on the natural attrition rate of the trained teachers.

District(s)

The project did not intend to impact the district.

Parents and Community

Parents and community members were not impacted directly by the project, but were supportive of the project. Some parents assisted artists and helped display student artwork.

Visibility Plan

The project gained visibility through articles in the local newspaper and displaying student artwork in local businesses. Project staff also made presentation to local organizations, such as the Parent-Teacher Club, the school site council, and the Kiwanis Club. Additionally, a page about the project was included in the arts organization brochure. Possibly the greatest success in visibility was the presentation made at the School Board meeting. The boardroom was transformed into a museum of student artwork, including visual displays, videos, and music performances. Teachers and students were in attendance to discuss their artwork and personal experiences participating in the project. The School Board and audience members learned first hand how the project impacted the lives of the students and teachers.

Successes & Best Practices

Project staff found the model of professional development effective for introducing arts instruction into the classrooms. Teachers, paired with local artists, learned from the artist and gradually took more responsibility for teaching the art lessons until the artist served as an assistant rather than a mentor. This provided teachers an opportunity to learn, and then test their new skills with the artist present to assist as needed. Constant support was available to the teachers throughout the year, as was constant support available to the artists throughout the year from university staff.

Challenges & Lessons Learned

The primary challenge the project encountered related to personnel issues. Some teachers, after having volunteered to participate, no longer wanted to be a part of the project. Additionally, the teaching abilities of the artists varied greatly, some having little prior experience working in the classroom. Project staff worked closely with staff from the arts organization and the university to overcome personnel challenges, convincing teachers to participate and training and supporting the artists.

Next Steps

Teachers who participated in the project are expected to continue using the curriculum units and skills they developed through working with the artists. Currently the project is on hold and not expected to continue unless additional funding is secured.